Published in final edited form as:

Ann Allergy Asthma Immunol. 2019 February ; 122(2): 136–139. doi:10.1016/j.anai.2018.11.009.

Asthma in the Melting Pot

Margee Louisias, MD, MPH^{#a,b,c}, Lakiea Wright, MD, MAT, MPH^{#b,c}, and Wanda Phipatanakul, MD, MS^{a,c}

^aBoston Children's Hospital, Division of Allergy and Immunology

^bBrigham and Women's Hospital Division of Rheumatology, Immunology and Allergy

^cHarvard Medical School

These authors contributed equally to this work.

Keywords

asthma; environment; disparities; asthma morbidity; discrimination

Introduction

America is becoming more diverse, with minority groups increasing at higher rates than whites. The health implications are vast, impacting all medical conditions. However, as asthma remains a persistent public health problem where the disease burden is higher in minorities and low income populations – the need to find solutions is crucial¹. These disparities or differences have been documented and defined to a significant degree in the literature, but what is lacking are solutions to tackle these differences.

The approach we must consider taking to thwart asthma disparities is described by Thomas et al². This generations framework allows one to easily follow the progression of investigation - description of differences, explanation of differences and solutions for differences. Asthma disparities research has spanned across the generations however there is a clear need for greater efforts in 2nd and 3rd generation research.

Corresponding Author: Wanda Phipatanakul, MD, MS, Division of Allergy and Immunology, Boston Children's Hospital, 300 Longwood Avenue, Fegan Building, 6th Floor, Boston, MA 02115, Wanda.Phipatanakul@childrens.harvard.edu, Telephone: 617-355-6117, Fax: 617-730-0248.

Author Contact Information:

Margee Louisias, MD, MPH: Boston Children's Hospital, 1 Autumn Street, 3rd Floor Boston, MA 02115; mlouisias@bwh.harvard.edu

Lakiea Wright MD, MAT, MPH: Brigham and Women's Hospital, 75 Francis Street, Boston, MA 02115; lwright8@bwh.harvard.edu

Wanda Phipatanakul, MD, MS, Division of Allergy and Immunology, Boston Children's Hospital, 300 Longwood Avenue, Fegan Building, 6th Floor, Boston, MA 02115, Wanda.Phipatanakul@childrens.harvard.edu

Publisher's Disclaimer: This is a PDF file of an unedited manuscript that has been accepted for publication. As a service to our customers we are providing this early version of the manuscript. The manuscript will undergo copyediting, typesetting, and review of the resulting proof before it is published in its final citable form. Please note that during the production process errors may be discovered which could affect the content, and all legal disclaimers that apply to the journal pertain.

Summary conflict of interest statements for each author (or a statement indicating no conflicts exist for the specified author[s]): All authors have no conflicts of interest.

In this perspective, we highlight research advances in the asthma health disparities research spectrum and make recommendations of innovative approaches to achieve equity and social justice.

Current Asthma Research and Risk Factors for Disparities

There are complex interactions among asthma risk factors influencing its development and trajectory; including but not limited to environmental exposures, diet, obesity, race/ethnicity, socioeconomic status, and genetics.

Environmental exposures

The indoor environment's role in asthma etiology and management is of growing interest in the past few decades. Questions remain regarding environmental remediation in asthma management as there is publication bias, however the current literature has consistently demonstrated that multifaceted interventions are effective and exposures in non-residential areas (e.g. mold and mouse allergen in school) can significantly impact asthma³.

Although cockroach and mouse are both recognized as major asthma triggers in some urban communities, mouse sensitization and exposure was associated with increased acute healthcare visits, higher FeNO, decreased FEV₁/FVC(%), increased prevalence of bronchodilator reversibility, even when both mouse and cockroach were present in high concentrations in the home⁴. Interestingly, the School Inner City Asthma Study (SICAS) found mouse allergen had high rates of detections in homes, but rates were significantly higher in schools⁵. Mouse allergen exposure, independent of sensitization and home allergen exposure, was significantly associated with more asthma symptom days and decreased FEV₁ % predicted, suggesting the school environment's importance in urban asthma. An ongoing school specific environmental intervention is being conducted, targeting school specific exposures found to be important, including mouse, particulates, and pollutants NCT02291302.

There is also growing evidence that ambient air pollution contributes to poor asthma outcomes and asthma development. The mechanisms underlying this association include DNA methylation, increased allergen release, pollutants (e.g. diesel fuel) acting as adjuvants in IgE-mediated mechanisms, enhanced allergenicity, and activated respiratory reflexes. Asthma exacerbations are significantly associated with higher concentration of NO₂, SO₂, particulate air pollutants and traffic-related air pollution⁶. Minority and low-income communities are particularly at risk due to their proximity to dense vehicular traffic, highways, and industrial facilities; resulting from residential segregation and redlining. Pregnant women exposed to ambient air pollution are at increased risk of having term low birth weight (TLBW) infants; and maternal asthma alone increases the risk of TLBW⁷. However, there is insufficient evidence to conclude if maternal asthma is an effect modifier of this relationship.

Environmental remediation has always been an important part of asthma management despite the conflicting evidence regarding its efficacy. Criticism has largely been related to cost and practicality, and if changes truly associate with improved outcomes. There is

growing interest in single-component environmental remediation studies, as it is difficult to tease out which component contributed to asthma outcomes. There are several recently published, promising single-component studies. Such as MAAIT⁸ which evaluated integrated pest management and education targeting mouse allergen, and NO-Roach⁹, which evaluated cockroach insecticidal bait. However more studies with pragmatic designs are needed to evaluate integration into real-world settings and health services research approaches to support payer coverage of remediation.

Diet

Dietary influence on asthma is complex. There are conflicting studies on associations of vitamin D and asthma. Some have demonstrated low vitamin D levels correlate with poor asthma control; however, in the landmark VIDA study, vitamin D supplementation in adults failed to improve asthma control¹⁰. More recently, dietary sugar intake has been investigated as a potential asthma risk factor because its intake influences the pathogenesis of inflammatory conditions such as diabetes and hepatosteatosis. In a pre-birth cohort of mother-child pairs, higher prenatal maternal intake of sugar-sweetened beverages and early childhood intake of fructose were associated with a greater odds of asthma diagnosis in mid-childhood¹¹. However, dietary influence on asthma is not well understood and it is likely influenced by a delicate balance between anti-inflammatory and inflammatory nutrients. Further investigation on this mechanism is needed particularly as dietary sugar intake can be affected by income, education and food security – therefore having implications for disparities.

Obesity

Obesity is accepted as a risk factor for incident asthma and asthma severity. Mechanisms include dysanapsis (incongruence between lung and airway growth), increased mechanical load and metabolic inflammation¹². However questions remain -at what age does being obese matter regarding lung development and asthma pathogenesis? How does weight loss affect lung and immune function? Is there a critical “age” window when a child’s increased fat mass could negatively impact their asthma prognosis? There is also a need for predictive tools to assess risk of asthma in these already high-risk groups. Black and Latinos have higher rates of overweight and obesity compared to Whites. Similar to diet, how do social determinants of health interact with the association between obesity and asthma?

Advances in research in SES

Despite the advances in our understanding of complex interrelationships of multiple asthma risk factors associated with asthma disparities there are unmet needs. It is still unclear the mechanisms through which these factors lead to health outcome differences – innovative study designs will allow further elucidation. There is also a need for medical scientists to consider historical and social context influences. Additionally, there is a need to evaluate other factors that are increasingly being examined in the social sciences and discussed in our current political landscape despite being a longstanding issue – such as discrimination and structural racism. Black race was associated with significant differences in asthma care patterns amongst White and Black patients in the same Detroit managed care plan by Zoratti

et al¹³. Black patients had more asthma ED visits, less inhaled steroids prescriptions, more oral steroid prescriptions, more asthma admissions, and less asthma specialist visits despite having equal healthcare access-suggesting other factors were contributing to the differences.

Study Design

Traditional randomized controlled trials (RCTs) may not always be the most appropriate approach to health disparities research interventions. Communities will not see the value of not receiving the intervention for the sake of science. An appropriate alternative is the stepped-wedge design where all subjects get the intervention, but the order in which the intervention is executed is randomized¹⁴.

Additionally, as intervention trials are not always feasible, there are several alternative analytic approaches that can be used instead. Mediation analysis describes a chain of causal influences¹⁵. It can be used to explain why and how an intervention would work, determinants of disparities, understanding intervention effectiveness and determining the differential effectiveness of multi-faceted studies' components. Modeling is also a great alternative when RCTs cannot be done ethically or practically for public health policy research. It can allow one to simulate different assumptions prior to policy implementation¹⁶.

Dissemination and Implementation (D&I) research are emerging areas of scientific inquiry developed out of the need to reduce the discovery-to-improved health gap¹⁷. D&I research is a much-needed addition to our repertoire of scientific inquiry to reduce asthma disparities by informing how we can translate research findings into real-world practice and community settings. The Center for Translation Research and Implementation Science (CTRIS), one of the NHLBI scientific divisions, was established to support and identify critical findings in this area. PCORI has also recently supported investigators with funding to conduct D&I research of PCORI-funded projects to ensure patient-centered result are accessible and utilized.

Another area in need of more development is the use of biomarkers to measure the social disadvantage impact in asthma outcomes. Social scientists are presently evaluating the association between social adversity and biomarkers such as DNA methylation and telomere length¹⁸. Over time individuals may age faster if they have experienced poverty or social deprivation. Perhaps asthma cohort studies can include assessments of social deprivation and collection of biological samples to elucidate its impact on asthma onset and morbidity.

Inner-City Asthma in the Age of Gentrification

The term "inner city asthma" was widely used in the 1980s and 1990s to refer to asthma health disparities. More recently, we have adopted the term asthma in "disadvantaged populations" because it is all encompassing and includes underrepresented minorities, low-income groups, and/or individuals from suburban or rural communities - asthma disparities is not limited to the inner-city or urban areas.

Moreover, in the age of urban gentrification, we see a demographic shift in inner-city communities which impact our asthma disparities characterization. In the past, most inner-city areas were plagued by economic and environmental deprivation (e.g. dilapidated buildings, rodent exposure, pollution). More recently, there has been an influx of higher income earners into urban areas leading to improved community resources; thus, “inner city” is not necessarily synonymous with poverty and its associated conditions. Keet and colleagues conducted a study of children enrolled in Medicaid and found urban residence was not associated with a higher asthma prevalence but it was associated with higher asthma morbidity¹⁹. It is important to reexamine these paradigms of asthma risk factors and perform rigorous analyses to uncover complexities among associations of neighborhood and asthma. It is not solely your neighborhood but the segregation within neighborhoods contributes to disease and health disparities²⁰. To move the field of asthma health disparities forward, we need to novel study designs to further capture and disentangle the relationship between race, socioeconomic status, and neighborhood to determine effects on asthma.

Stress, Racism, & Discrimination

In addition to the physical environment contributing to asthma, there is an emerging body of literature suggesting being a member of a marginalized group is associated with chronic stress and racism leading to inflammation. Inflammation may contribute to immunological changes and airway hyperresponsiveness. In prospective analyses conducted in the Black Women’s Health Study, participants in the highest quartile, compared to the lowest quartile of self-reported racism had a higher incidence of adult-onset asthma²¹. In a pediatric study, Black youth who reported any perceived discrimination had greater odds of asthma and worse control²².

Genetics

There has been a growing interest in finding genetic variants associated with asthma to allow improved classification – e.g. phenotypes and endotypes. As Latinos and Blacks have worse outcomes there has been emphasis in finding genetic markers to clarify the sources of these differences. One area recently emphasized in pharmacogenetics is if there is a genetic association with bronchodilator response. Mak et al attempted to identify a genetic variant but concluded that the lack of diverse data despite extensive collaborative efforts made it impossible to replicate their findings²³. It is the opinion of the authors it is unlikely that genetic variants in minority groups will explain the sole source of asthma disparities – it is more likely socioeconomic disadvantage likely causes biological changes (DNA methylation, inflammatory effects) – but a significant first step is that researchers must make intentional, tailored efforts to diversify their study populations for genetics research. This issue also highlights the tension between precision medicine and macro-level or public health approaches to disease. We must be cautious about the current direction of genomics research and acknowledge it cannot be used in isolation, without factoring in other health determinants²⁴.

Conclusion: Future of research

Moving the needle on disparities research requires a systematic approach and going beyond documenting the problem. PCORI has funded several multicomponent interventions to improve patient-centered outcomes for minorities with uncontrolled asthma. These projects encompass improving adherence to evidence-based asthma guidelines, health worker home visits to enhanced outpatient care. The NIAID-funded SICAS has also taken the innovative approach of evaluating the association between asthma symptoms and urban school environment exposures. These efforts will shed light on solutions for real-world settings involving stakeholder engagement.

We must also consider the impact of our current sociopolitical environment on health. Efforts to increase coal power generation and funding reduction for air quality regulation enforcement, will cripple our progress to produce clean and renewable forms of energy and increase air pollution²⁵. It also is documented that recent dramatic societal events have been associated with increased: racial animosity, stress in targeted racial/ethnic groups, mortality risk, worry and rumination particularly over concern of health care coverage reduction²⁶. Examining current events' effects on health outcomes will allow improved recognition for the etiology of differences, and hopefully identify more areas to change with policy.

The future direction of asthma research entails moving beyond detecting problems to evaluating the causes of the differences and creating solutions. This direction will require more collaborative efforts across research disciplines and sectors, to enrich a body of research to inform and activate policy reform.

Acknowledgments

Funding and Support:

This manuscript was conducted with the support of grants AHRQ K12HS022986, BWH H. Richard Nesson Fellowship, NIAID K24AI 106822, U01 AI110397, R01HL137192, U01 AI 126614, R01HL137192, U01 AI 126614, U01 AI 110397 and The Allergy and Asthma Awareness Initiative, Inc.

Abbreviations:

NHLBI	National Heart, Lung and Blood Institute
PCORI	Patient-Centered Outcomes Research Institute

References:

1. Akinbami LJ, Moorman JE, Bailey C, et al. Trends in asthma prevalence, health care use, and mortality in the United States, 2001–2010. NCHS data brief. 2012;94(94):1–8.
2. Thomas SB, Quinn SC, Butler J, Fryer CS, Garza MA. Toward a fourth generation of disparities research to achieve health equity. Annual review of public health. 2011;32:399–416.
3. Gold DR, Adamkiewicz G, Arshad SH, et al. NIAID, NIEHS, NHLBI, and MCAN Workshop Report: The indoor environment and childhood asthma—implications for home environmental intervention in asthma prevention and management. Journal of Allergy and Clinical Immunology. 2017.

4. Ahluwalia SK, Peng RD, Breyse PN, et al. Mouse allergen is the major allergen of public health relevance in Baltimore City. *Journal of Allergy and Clinical Immunology*. 2013;132(4):830–835. e832. [PubMed: 23810154]
5. Sheehan WJ, Permaul P, Petty CR, et al. Association Between Allergen Exposure in Inner-City Schools and Asthma Morbidity Among Students. *JAMA pediatrics*. 2017;171(1):31–38. [PubMed: 27893060]
6. Nardone A, Neophytou AM, Balmes J, Thakur N. Ambient Air Pollution and Asthma-Related Outcomes in Children of Color of the USA: a Scoping Review of Literature Published Between 2013 and 2017. *Current allergy and asthma reports*. 2018;18(5):29. [PubMed: 29663154]
7. Westergaard N, Gehring U, Slama R, Pedersen M. Ambient air pollution and low birth weight—are some women more vulnerable than others? *Environment international*. 2017;104:146–154. [PubMed: 28390661]
8. Matsui EC, Perzanowski M, Peng RD, et al. Effect of an integrated pest management intervention on asthma symptoms among mouse-sensitized children and adolescents with asthma: a randomized clinical trial. *Jama*. 2017;317(10):1027–1036. [PubMed: 28264080]
9. Rabito FA, Carlson JC, He H, Werthmann D, Schal C. A single intervention for cockroach control reduces cockroach exposure and asthma morbidity in children. *Journal of Allergy and Clinical Immunology*. 2017.
10. Castro M, King TS, Kunselman SJ, et al. Effect of vitamin D3 on asthma treatment failures in adults with symptomatic asthma and lower vitamin D levels: the VIDA randomized clinical trial. *Jama*. 2014;311(20):2083–2091. [PubMed: 24838406]
11. Wright LS, Rifas-Shiman SL, Oken E, Litonjua AA, Gold DR. Prenatal and early life fructose, fructose-containing beverages, and midchildhood asthma. *Annals of the American Thoracic Society*. 2018;15(2):217–224. [PubMed: 29219619]
12. Forno E, Celedón JC. The effect of obesity, weight gain, and weight loss on asthma inception and control. *Current opinion in allergy and clinical immunology*. 2017;17(2):123–130. [PubMed: 28030376]
13. Zoratti EM, Havstad S, Rodriguez J, Robens-Paradise Y, Lafata JE, McCARTHY B. Health service use by African Americans and Caucasians with asthma in a managed care setting. *American journal of respiratory and critical care medicine*. 1998;158(2):371–377. [PubMed: 9700109]
14. Bonell CP, Hargreaves JR, Cousens SN, et al. Alternatives to randomisation in the evaluation of public-health interventions: design challenges and solutions. *Journal of Epidemiology & Community Health*. 2009; jech. 2008.082602.
15. MacKinnon DP, Fairchild AJ, Fritz MS. Mediation analysis. *Annu Rev Psychol*. 2007;58:593–614. [PubMed: 16968208]
16. Basu S, Andrews J. Complexity in mathematical models of public health policies: a guide for consumers of models. *PLoS medicine*. 2013;10(10):e1001540. [PubMed: 24204214]
17. Brown CH, Curran G, Palinkas LA, et al. An overview of research and evaluation designs for dissemination and implementation. *Annual review of public health*. 2017;38:1–22.
18. Mitchell C, McLanahan S, Schnepel L, Garfinkel I, Brooks-Gunn J, Notterman D. Father loss and child telomere length. *Pediatrics*. 2017:e20163245. [PubMed: 28716823]
19. Keet CA, Matsui EC, McCormack MC, Peng RD. Urban residence, neighborhood poverty, race/ethnicity, and asthma morbidity among children on Medicaid. *Journal of Allergy and Clinical Immunology*. 2017.
20. Williams DR, Collins C. Racial residential segregation: a fundamental cause of racial disparities in health. *Public health reports*. 2001;116(5):404. [PubMed: 12042604]
21. Coogan PF, Yu J, O'connor GT, et al. Experiences of racism and the incidence of adult-onset asthma in the Black Women's Health Study. *Chest*. 2014;145(3):480–485. [PubMed: 23887828]
22. Thakur N, Barcelo NE, Borrell LN, et al. Perceived Discrimination Associated with Asthma and Related Outcomes in Minority Youth: The GALA II and SAGE II Studies. *Chest*. 2017;151(4):804–812. [PubMed: 27916618]
23. Mak AC, White MJ, Eckalbar WL, et al. Whole genome sequencing of pharmacogenetic drug response in racially diverse children with asthma. *American journal of respiratory and critical care medicine*. 2018(ja).

24. Chowkwanyun M, Bayer R, Galea S. “Precision” Public Health—Between Novelty and Hype. *New England Journal of Medicine*. 2018.
25. Berger RE, Ramaswami R, Solomon CG, Drazen JM. Air pollution still kills. *New England Journal of Medicine*. 2017;376(26):2591–2592. [PubMed: 28657876]
26. Williams DR, Medlock MM. Health effects of dramatic societal events—ramifications of the recent presidential election. In: *Mass Medical Soc*; 2017.

Author Manuscript

Author Manuscript

Author Manuscript

Author Manuscript