Published in final edited form as:

J Phys Chem A. 2018 October 11; 122(40): 8058–8061. doi:10.1021/acs.jpca.8b07961.

Secondary Carbocations in the Biosynthesis of Pupukeanane Sesquiterpenes

Christina H. McCulley and Dean J. Tantillo*

Department of Chemistry, University of California–Davis, Davis, CA 95616, USA

Abstract

The results of quantum chemical calculations on putative biosynthetic carbocation cyclization/rearrangements leading to pupukeanane and related sesquiterpenes indicate that a secondary carbocation proposed as an intermediate is not a minimum on the potential energy surface and instead resides in a region of the potential energy surface associated with a plateau containing multiple exit channels.

Graphic Abstract

INTRODUCTION

The formal s-bond frameworks of carbocations tend towards greater delocalization than those of carbanions, carbon-centered radicals and alkanes.^{1–4} As a result, barriers for rearrangement reactions that involve the breaking of bonds involved in delocalized arrays (e.g., engaged in strong hyperconjugation⁴) can have very low barriers, and transition state structures (TSSs) for such rearrangements are frequently lacking in s-delocalization. For example, many secondary carbocations proposed as intermediates in cyclization/rearrangement reactions involved in the biosynthesis of terpene natural products have been shown not to be minima on potential energy surfaces (PESs), at least in the absence of enzymatic chaperons, occurring instead at other points on reaction coordinates, sometimes near TSSs (Figure 1).^{5,6} Our ongoing studies on the scope and generality of this concept led us to examine the reactions shown in Scheme 1. It was proposed that cation **2**, formed from cyclization of cation **1**, could undergo a 1,2-alkyl shift to form either cation **3** or cation **4**. Cation **3** would be a biosynthetic precursor to neopupukeanane sesquiterpenes, while cation **4** would be a direct precursor to pupukeanane sesquiterpenes and an indirect precursor to

* djtantillo@ucdavis.edu.

SUPPORTING INFORMATION

Coordinates and energies for all computed structures, additional information on IRC calculations, full *Gaussian* reference.

abeopupukeanane sesquiterpenes (via cation **5**).⁷ Based on previous experience, we suspected that one or both of secondary cations **3** and **4** might not be PES minima and set out to test this hypothesis using density functional theory (DFT) calculations.

METHODS

Computations were performed at the B3LYP/6–31+G(d,p),^{8–10} B3LYP-D3/6–31+G(d,p)¹¹ and mPW1PW91/6–31+G(d,p)^{12–13} levels of theory, using *Gaussian09*.¹⁴ Identities of all stationary points (minima or transition state structures) were confirmed by frequency analysis and intrinsic reaction coordinate (IRC) calculations were performed on all transition state structures to confirm connectivity to products.^{15,16} All energies shown are free energies at room temperature, except for those in the IRC plots, which are electronic energies. Three-dimensional molecular images were generated with *CyView*.¹⁷

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Secondary cation **3** is predicted to be a minimum at all levels used and is formed from cation **2** via a TSS that is similar in structure and energy to **2** (Figure 2). The formal secondary carbocation center in cation **3** benefits from hyperconjugation from two adjacent C–C bonds (1.59 and 1.70 Å; see Figure 2). Hyperconjugation with the 1.70 Å C–C bond has entered the realm of bridging (C–C–C angle <90°, consistent with cation **3** being described as nonclassical).^{18–22}

Secondary cation **4** is predicted not to be a minimum at all levels used. With mPW1PW91/6–31+G(d,p), a TSS for concerted conversion of cation **2** to cation **5** was located (Figure 3). The TSS for this reaction, and nearby structures flanking it, resemble cation **4**. This reaction is another example of a concerted reaction with asynchronous 1,2-alkyl shifts.^{23–25} With B3LYP/6–31+G(d,p) and B3LYP-D3/6–31+G(d,p), TSSs resembling cation **4** were also found, but these are connected, via IRC calculations, to cation **5** and, unexpectedly, cation **6** (Figure 4). The interconversion of cations **5** and **6** corresponds to a dyotropic rearrangement, several of which have been proposed to occur in terpene biosynthesis.²⁶ Structures on the shoulder on the side of the IRC pathway leading to **6** resemble the geometry expected for a TSS for a 1,2-alkyl shift that calculations are shown. Relative free energies from B3LYP-D3/6–31+G(d,p) (kcal/mol) are shown on each structure; energies for IRC points are electronic energies. All structures are cationic, but positive charge symbols are not shown, since charge is delocalized over multiple atoms.

Taken together, the results from the three levels of theory used are consistent with the following scenario. The portion of the PES near to cation **4** is somewhat flat and has at least three exit channels: to cations **2**, **5** and **6**. It is possible that there are two TSSs close to each other in structure and energy,^{27,28} the initially formed TSS followed by the **5** ⇌ **6** TSS, i.e., there exists a post-transition state bifurcation (PTSB; Figure 5),^{29,30} a contention that could be tested in the future using direct dynamics simulations.^{31–34} Previous work has suggested that locating TSSs with similar structures at different levels of theory whose IRC pathways lead to different products is a marker for PTSBs.²⁷

These results have implications for the biosynthesis of pupukeanane and related sesquiterpene natural products. First, sesquiterpenes with the pupukeanane skeleton would either result from coupled 1,2-shift/quenching reactions, as has been proposed for related systems,^{35–37} or an enzyme would need to convert cation **4** to a minimum, i.e., increase its lifetime, via selective binding. Second, formation of abeopupukeanane sesquiterpenes would likely require a dynamical preference^{31–34} – either inherent³⁸ or enzyme induced – for formation of cation **5** rather than cation **6**.

CONCLUSIONS

Putative biosynthetic carbocation cyclization/rearrangements leading to pupukeanane and related sesquiterpenes were examined using DFT calculations. The results of these calculations indicate that one of the secondary carbocations proposed as an intermediate is not a minimum on the PES and instead resides in a region of the PES associated with a plateau containing multiple exit channels or a PTSB. These examples add to the growing body of examples of such phenomena in biosynthetic carbocation chemistry, highlighting the complex chemistry of secondary carbocations – chemistry that differs greatly from that generally contained in the organic chemist's body of "general knowledge."

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Support from the US National Science Foundation (CHE-1565933 and CHE-030089 [XSEDE]) and the UC Davis Chemical Biology Program (NIH sponsored) is gratefully acknowledged.

REFERENCES

1. Richard JP; Amyes TL; Toteva MM Formation and Stability of Carbocations and Carbanions in Water and Intrinsic Barriers to Their Reactions. *Acc. Chem. Res* 2001, 34, 981–988. [PubMed: 11747416]
2. Ofial AR; Mayr H Reactivities of Carbocations and Carbanions. *Macromol. Symp* 2004, 215, 353–368.
3. Leroy G; Wilante C; Peeters D; Uyewa MM A Theoretical Investigation of the Properties of Carbocations and Carbanions. *J. Mol. Struct. (Theochem)* 1985, 124, 107–131.
4. Alabugin IV; Gilmore KM; Peterson PW Hyperconjugation. *Wiley Interdiscip. Rev. Comput. Mol. Sci* 2011, 1, 109–141.
5. Tantillo DJ The Carbocation Continuum in Terpene Biosynthesis - Where are the Secondary Cations? *Chem. Soc. Rev* 2010, 39, 2847–2854. [PubMed: 20442917]
6. Tantillo DJ Biosynthesis via Carbocations Theoretical Studies on Terpene Formation. *Nat. Prod. Rep* 2011, 28, 1035–1053. [PubMed: 21541432]
7. Jaisamut S; Prabpai S; Tancharoen C; Yuenyongsawad S; Hannonbua S; Kongsaree P; Plubrukarn A Bridged Tricyclic Sesquiterpenes from the Tubercle Nudibranch *Phyllidia coelestis* Bergh. *J. Nat. Prod* 2013, 76, 2158–2161. [PubMed: 24200393]
8. Becke AD Density-functional Thermochemistry. III. The Role of Exact Exchange. *J. Chem. Phys* 1993, 98, 5648–5652.
9. Lee C; Yang W; Parr RG Development of the Colle-Salvetti Correlation-energy Formula into a Functional of the Electron Density. *Phys. Rev. B: Condens. Matter Mater. Phys* 1988, 37, 785–789.
10. Miehlich B; Savin A; Stoll H; Preuss H Results Obtained with the Correlation Energy Density Functionals of Becke and Lee, Yang and Parr. *Chem. Phys. Lett* 1989, 157, 200206.
11. Grimme S; Antony J; Ehrlich S; Krieg H A Consistent and Accurate ab initio Parametrization of Density Functional Dispersion Correction (DFT-D) for the 94 Elements H-Pu. *J. Chem. Phys* 2010, 132, 154104. [PubMed: 20423165]

12. Adamo C; Barone V Exchange Functionals with Improved Long-range Behavior and Adiabatic Connection Methods without Adjustable Parameters: The mPW and mPW1PW Models. *J. Chem. Phys* 1998, 108, 664–675.
13. Matsuda SPT; Wilson WK; Xiong Q Mechanistic Insights into Triterpene Synthesis from Quantum Mechanical Calculations. Detection of Systematic Errors in B3LYP Cyclization Energies. *Org. Biomol. Chem* 2006, 4, 530–543. [PubMed: 16446812]
14. Frisch MJ; Trucks GW; Schlegel HB; Scuseria GE; Robb MA; Cheeseman JR; Scalmani G; Barone V; Mennucci B; Petersson GA, et al. Gaussian 09, Revision A.1; Gaussian, Inc.: Wallingford, CT, 2009; full reference in Supporting Information.
15. Fukui K The Path of Chemical Reactions - the IRC Approach. *Acc. Chem. Res* 1981, 14, 363–368.
16. Maeda S; Harabuchi Y; Ono Y; Taketsugu T; Morokuma K Intrinsic Reaction Coordinate: Calculation, Bifurcation, and Automated Search. *Int. J. Quantum Chem* 2015, 115, 258–269.
17. CY Lview, 1.0b; Legault CY, Universite de Sherbrooke, 2009, <http://www.cylview.org>; (accessed September 11, 2018).
18. Grob CA Inductivity and Bridging in Carbocations. *Acc. Chem. Res* 1983, 16, 426–431.
19. Brown HC The Energy of the Transition States and the Intermediate Cation in the Ionization of 2-Norbornyl Derivatives. Where is the Nonclassical Stabilization Energy? *Acc. Chem. Res* 1983, 16, 432–440.
20. Olah GA; Prakash GKS; Saunders M Conclusion of the Classical-Nonclassical Ion Controversy Based on the Structural Study of the 2-Norbornyl Cation. *Acc. Chem. Res* 1983, 16, 440–448.
21. Walling C An Innocent Bystander Looks at the 2-Norbornyl Cation. *Acc. Chem. Res* 1983, 16, 448–454.
22. Brown HC (with comments by Schleyer P. v. R.) The Nonclassical Ion Problem; Plenum New York, 1977.
23. Williams A Concerted Organic and Bio-Organic Mechanisms, CRC Press: Boca Raton, FL, 2000.
24. Hess BA, Jr. Concomitant C-Ring Expansion and D-Ring Formation in Lanosterol Biosynthesis from Squalene without Violation of Markovnikov's Rule. *J. Am. Chem. Soc* 2002, 124, 10286–10287. [PubMed: 12197724]
25. Tantillo DJ Recent Excursions to the Borderlands between the Realms of Concerted and Stepwise: Carbocation Cascades in Natural Products Biosynthesis. *J. Phys. Org. Chem.* 2008, 21, 561–570.
26. Gutierrez O; Tantillo DJ Analogies Between Synthetic and Biosynthetic Reactions in which [1,2]-Alkyl Shifts are Combined with Other Events - Dyotropic, Schmidt and Carbocation Rearrangements. *J. Org. Chem* 2012, 77, 8845–8850 and references therein. [PubMed: 23006240]
27. Hare SR; Tantillo DJ Cryptic Post-Transition State Bifurcations Reduce the Efficiency of Lactone-Forming Rh-Carbenoid C-H Insertions. *Chem. Sci* 2017, 8, 1442–1449. [PubMed: 28451284]
28. Birney DM Theory, Experiment and Unusual Features of Potential Energy Surfaces of Pericyclic and Pseudopericyclic Reactions with Sequential Transition Structures. *Curr. Org. Chem* 2010, 14, 1658–1668.
29. Hare SR; Tantillo DJ Post-Transition State Bifurcations Gain Momentum – Current State of the Field. *Pure Appl. Chem* 2017, 89, 679–698.
30. Ess DH; Wheeler SE; Iafe RG; Xu L; Çelebi- Ölçüm N; Houk KN Bifurcations on Potential Energy Surfaces of Organic Reactions. *Angew. Chem. Int. Ed* 2008, 47, 7592–7601.
31. Ma X; Hase WL Perspective: Chemical Dynamics Simulations of Non-statistical Reaction Dynamics. *Phil. Trans. R. Soc* 2017, 375, 20160204.
32. Lourderaj U; Park K; Hase WL Classical Trajectory Simulations of Post-transition State Dynamics. *Int. Rev. Phys. Chem* 2008, 27, 361–403.
33. Carpenter BK Intramolecular Dynamics for the Organic Chemist. *Acc. Chem. Res* 1992, 25, 520–528.
34. Carpenter BK Nonstatistical Dynamics in Thermal Reactions of Polyatomic Molecules. *Ann. Rev. Phys. Chem* 2005, 56, 57–89. [PubMed: 15796696]
35. Hong YJ; Tantillo DJ Formation of Beyerene, Kaurene, Trachylobane and Atiserene Diterpenes by Rearrangements that Avoid Secondary Carbocations. *J. Am. Chem. Soc* 2010, 132, 5375–5386. [PubMed: 20353180]

36. Hong YJ; Tantillo DJ How Many Secondary Carbocations are Involved in the Biosynthesis of Avermitilol? *Org. Lett* 2011, 13, 1294–1297. [PubMed: 21322615]
37. Lodewyk MW; Gutta P; Tantillo DJ Computational Studies on Biosynthetic Carbocation Rearrangements Leading to Sativene, Cyclosativene, α -Ylangene, and β -Ylangene. *J. Org. Chem* 2008, 73, 6570–6579. [PubMed: 18681400]
38. Tantillo DJ Importance of Inherent Substrate Reactivity in Enzyme Promoted Carbocation Cyclization/Rearrangements. *Angew. Chem. Int. Ed* 2017, 56, 10040–10045.

Figure 1.

Comparison between reaction coordinate for a stepwise carbocation rearrangement (left), which is often assumed, and a concerted rearrangement involving multiple asynchronous events (right), which is often observed. In the specific example shown, a reaction that might be formulated as two 1,2-shifts (of R_1 and then R_3) separated by a minimum (intermediate on the PES) is instead found to be a concerted process where the two 1,2-shifts occur sequentially but without an intervening minimum; instead the transition state structure for the concerted rearrangement (here a dyotropic rearrangement²⁶) resembles the secondary cation formed after the first 1,2-shift.

Figure 2. Stationary points involved in the **2** $\rightarrow$ **3** rearrangement. Geometries (selected distances in Å) from B3LYP/6-31+G(d,p) calculations are shown. Relative free energies in kcal/mol from three levels of theory are shown: B3LYP/6-31+G(d,p) in plain text, B3LYP-D3/6-31+G(d,p) in italics, mPW1PW91/6-31+G(d,p) underlined. All structures are cationic, but positive charge symbols are not shown, since charge is delocalized over multiple atoms.

Figure 3.

Stationary points involved in the **2** $\rightarrow$ **5** rearrangement, along with IRC plot, obtained with mPW1PW91/6-31+G(d,p). Geometries (selected distances in Å) from mPW1PW91/631+G(d,p) calculations are shown. Relative free energies from mPW1PW91/6-31+G(d,p) (kcal/mol) are shown on each structure; energies for IRC points are electronic energies. All structures are cationic, but positive charge symbols are not shown, since charge is delocalized over multiple atoms.

Figure 4. Stationary points involved in the $5 \rightarrow 6$ rearrangement, along with IRC plot, obtained with B3LYP-D3/6-31+G(d,p). Geometries (selected distances in Å) from B3LYP-D3/6-31+G(d,p) calculations are shown. Relative free energies from B3LYP-D3/6-31+G(d,p) (kcal/mol) are shown on each structure; energies for IRC points are electronic energies. All structures are cationic, but positive charge symbols are not shown, since charge is delocalized over multiple atoms.

Figure 5. Schematic representation of a PTSB. The reaction coordinate leading from reactant, through an initial TSS, toward products (black) bifurcates on the downhill slope following the first TSS. A second TSS can interconvert the two products, and the associated reaction coordinate for the product 1 $\rightleftharpoons$ product 2 interconversion (red) is orthogonal to that associated with the first TSS (black).

Scheme 1.

Carbocations involved in proposed mechanisms for formation of pupukeanane and related sesquiterpene natural products. Newly formed σ -bonds in each structure are bolded and colored blue.