Published in final edited form as:

Environ Res. 2017 January ; 152: 304–307. doi:10.1016/j.envres.2016.11.001.

Short-Term Exposures to Ambient Air Pollution and Risk of Recurrent Ischemic Stroke

Jeffrey J. Wing, PhD^{a,1}, Sara D. Adar, ScD^a, Brisa N. Sánchez, PhD^b, Lewis B. Morgenstern, MD^{a,c}, Melinda A. Smith, DrPH^c, and Lynda D. Lisabeth, PhD^{a,c}

^aDepartment of Epidemiology, School of Public Health, University of Michigan

^bDepartment of Biostatistics, School of Public Health, University of Michigan

^cDepartment of Neurology, Stroke Program, University of Michigan

Abstract

Objective—To investigate the association between short-term changes in ambient pollution (particulate matter <2.5 μ m in aerodynamic diameter (PM_{2.5}) and ozone (O₃)) and the risk of recurrent ischemic stroke among individuals living in a bi-ethnic community.

Methods—We identified recurrent ischemic stroke cases from the population-based Brain Attack Surveillance in Corpus Christi (BASIC) project between 2000 and 2012. Associations between PM_{2.5} (mean 24-hour) and O₃ (maximal 8-hour) levels, measured on the previous day, and odds of ischemic stroke were assessed using a time-stratified case-crossover design and modeled using conditional logistic regression.

Results—There were 317 recurrent ischemic strokes after excluding 41 strokes that occurred on days with missing air pollution data. Mean age was 72 years (SD=12) and median time to stroke recurrence was 1.1 years (IQR: 0.2-2.8 years). Median levels of PM_{2.5} and O₃ over the study period were 7.7 μ g/m³ (IQR: 5.6-10.7 μ g/m³) and 35.2 ppb (IQR: 25.0-46.1 ppb), respectively. We observed no associations between previous-day PM_{2.5} and O₃ and odds of recurrent stroke (OR=0.95 per 10 μ g/m³ of PM_{2.5}, 95% CI: 0.71-1.28 and OR=0.97 per 10ppb of O₃, 95% CI: 0.87-1.07) after adjusting for ambient temperature and relative humidity. Co-adjustment of both pollutants did not change the results.

Conclusion—We found no evidence of associations between previous-day air pollution levels and recurrent ischemic stroke. Research on the influence of air pollutants on risk of stroke

Corresponding Author Information: Jeffrey J. Wing, PhD, MPH, Department of Public Health, 545 Michigan St. NE, Suite 300, Grand Rapids, MI 49503, Tel. 616-331-5537, Fax. 616-331-5550, wingje@gvsu.edu.

¹Permanent address: Department of Public Health, Grand Valley State University, 545 Michigan St. NE, Suite 300, Grand Rapids, MI 49503

Human Subjects: The Brain Attack Surveillance In Corpus Christi (BASIC) project was approved by the University of Michigan Institutional Review Board and each of the Nueces County hospital systems.

Competing Interests: None

Publisher's Disclaimer: This is a PDF file of an unedited manuscript that has been accepted for publication. As a service to our customers we are providing this early version of the manuscript. The manuscript will undergo copyediting, typesetting, and review of the resulting proof before it is published in its final citable form. Please note that during the production process errors may be discovered which could affect the content, and all legal disclaimers that apply to the journal pertain.

recurrence is still in its infancy, and more research is necessary in studies that are adequately powered to understand the relation.

Keywords

Ischemic stroke; recurrent stroke; air pollution

1. Introduction

Recurrent strokes are associated with worse outcomes and greater mortality relative to first strokes (Jerrgensen et al., 1997; Pettersen et al., 2002; Weimar et al., 2002). Short-term ambient air pollution as a risk factor for stroke has been gaining attention (Henrotin et al., 2010; Lisabeth et al., 2008; O'Donnell et al., 2011; Wellenius et al., 2012; Wing et al., 2015). Although associations between air pollution and risk of stroke have been observed, the evidence for short-term effects of air pollution on risk of stroke recurrence is in its infancy with only a few studies reported to date (Henrotin et al., 2010; O'Donnell et al., 2011; Suissa et al., 2013; Wellenius et al., 2012). While there is little evidence, it is plausible that individuals with prior stroke may be more vulnerable to the effects of air pollution on stroke given they are likely to have systemic or more severe atherosclerosis in the vessels of the brain (Suissa et al., 2013; Villeneuve et al., 2012). Recently, there has been a call by researchers to further investigate the susceptibility of persons with a history of stroke to the effects of air pollution (Oudin et al., 2012). Our objective was to investigate the association between daily variations in ambient air pollutant (PM_{2.5} and O₃) levels and risk of recurrent stroke.

2. Material and Methods

2.1 Study Population

Data are from the Brain Attack Surveillance in Corpus Christi (BASIC) Project, which is an ongoing population-based stroke surveillance study in Nueces County, Texas. Nueces County is located on the Gulf Coast and has a large petroleum and petrochemical industry (Lisabeth et al., 2008). The topography of the county is flat, with elevation varying from sea level to a maximum elevation of 180 feet (TNRIS (Texas Natural Resources Information System), 2013)). Approximately, 340,000 people live in Nueces County with the majority of the population (95%) residing in the urban city of Corpus Christi. Based on the 2010 Census, 61% of the population is Mexican American and 33% is non-Hispanic white (US Census Bureau, 2012).

A combination of active and passive surveillance techniques were used to identify ischemic stroke cases between January 2000 and June 2012, as has been previously described (Morgenstern et al., 2013). Ischemic strokes were defined clinically as a focal neurologic deficit of acute onset specifically attributable to cerebrovascular distribution lasting longer than 24 hours. Recurrent strokes were defined as the first recurrent ischemic stroke (one per individual) following an incident ischemic stroke identified in BASIC. Recurrent strokes that occurred on the same calendar day as the first stroke were excluded. Per the BASIC protocol, patients were excluded if they were younger than 45 years of age, lived outside of

Nueces County, or if their strokes were the result of trauma. The BASIC project was approved by the University of Michigan Institutional Review Board and each of the Nueces County hospital systems.

2.2 Study Design

A time-stratified case-crossover design was used to assess the association between air pollution and odds of recurrent stroke among individuals with ischemic stroke. This study design effectively controls for all time-invariant individual level characteristics, while comparing each subject's exposure to air pollution prior to the recurrent stroke event with his or her own exposure during referent control periods where he/she did not have a recurrent stroke (Lumley and Levy, 2000). Control periods were selected on the same day of the week, falling in the same month as the recurrent stroke (Janes et al., 2005).

2.3 Air Pollutant and Meteorology Data

Data for PM_{2.5}, O₃ and meteorological data from 2000 to 2012 were obtained from the Texas Commission on Environmental Quality's Texas Air Monitoring Information System from a centrally located monitor. Data from this monitor were highly correlated with others in the county ($p > 0.8$) (TCEQ (Texas Commission on Environmental Quality), 2012). PM_{2.5}, temperature and relative humidity were averaged daily (midnight to midnight) and O₃ was summarized as the maximal 8-hour average. Each air pollutant was examined 1-day prior to recurrent stroke onset based on associations from other studies and the belief that this time period includes the appropriate window for triggering a recurrent stroke (Henrotin et al., 2010; Suissa et al., 2013; Wellenius et al., 2012). We also examined exposures on the same-day, 2-days prior and 3-days prior to onset of recurrent stroke in secondary analyses.

2.4 Statistical Methods

Descriptive statistics were calculated for the study population, air pollution exposures and meteorological data and summarized using means/medians and frequencies/percentages. Conditional logistic regression models, stratifying on each recurrent stroke (limited to one recurrent stroke per individual), were used to calculate odds ratios (ORs) for a 10 $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$ or 10 ppb change in PM_{2.5} or O₃, respectively, and corresponding 95% confidence intervals (CI). Unadjusted models were run for each pollutant on each lag day separately. Models were then repeated adjusting for ambient temperature and relative humidity measured on the same day as pollutant exposure. Functional forms of air pollutant and meteorological variables were assessed using penalized polynomial splines and found linear functional forms to be appropriate. The association between each pollutant and recurrent stroke was first examined separately and then in two-pollutant models. All analyses were conducted using SAS version 9.3 (SAS Institute Inc, Cary, NC) and the R statistical package, version 3.0.1.

3. Results

A total of 3,216 first-ever ischemic strokes were identified; 388 of these individuals had a recurrent stroke. Restricting to the first recurrent ischemic stroke and excluding those events that occurred on the same calendar day as the index stroke, reduced our sample to 358. Our

analytic sample was further reduced to 317 recurrent ischemic strokes after excluding 41 strokes that occurred on days with missing air pollution data. Mean age of the 317 recurrent stroke cases was 72 years (SD=12) (Table 1). Sixty-four percent of cases were Mexican American (n=202) and 53% (n=169) were female. The median time to stroke recurrence was 1.1 years with an interquartile range (IQR) of 0.2 to 2.8 years. Median levels of PM_{2.5} and O₃ over the study period were 7.7 µg/m³ (IQR: 5.6 to 10.7 µg/m³) and 35.2 ppb (IQR: 25.0 to 46.1 ppb), respectively.

We observed no associations between previous-day PM_{2.5} and O₃ and odds of recurrent ischemic stroke in either unadjusted models or models adjusted for ambient temperature and relative humidity (Figures 1 & 2). Associations between air pollutants and recurrent stroke were consistently null for other lagged exposure days (lag 2 and lag 3 days), but there was a suggestive protective effect for same-day levels of both pollutants (Figures 1 & 2). Neither ambient temperature nor relative humidity were associated with recurrent stroke in the adjusted models for PM_{2.5} or O₃, with the exception of ambient temperature in the Lag 2 model. Temperature two days prior to recurrent stroke was suggestive of an association, but did not reach statistical significance for either PM_{2.5} or O₃ (both OR=1.04, 95% CI: 1.00 to 1.09). After co-adjustment of both pollutants the results did not change for either PM_{2.5} or O₃.

4. Discussion

We observed no significant associations between previous-day levels of PM_{2.5} and O₃ and recurrent ischemic stroke in our population-based stroke surveillance study with 13 years of validated recurrent ischemic strokes. Nor did we observe associations on other lag days. By using a time-stratified case-crossover design our findings are robust to confounding by individual-level characteristics. However, we may have been inadequately powered to examine the associations in our study as previous studies in this population have reported marginal or no overall associations between PM_{2.5} and O₃ and risk of incident ischemic stroke and there was limited variability in air pollutant exposure levels (Lisabeth et al., 2008; Wing et al., 2015).

Previous case-crossover studies have reported associations between higher levels of ambient air pollution and risk of recurrent stroke (Henrotin et al., 2010; Oudin et al., 2012; Suissa et al., 2013; Wellenius et al., 2012); however, a subgroup analysis of a case-crossover study in Canada found no association when considering a 48-hour moving average in air pollution levels consistent with our findings (O'Donnell et al., 2011). The previous studies differed from ours in their selection of cases which may help to explain the disparate findings. Some of these studies included TIAs in their stroke population (Henrotin et al., 2010; Wellenius et al., 2012) and also in their definition of recurrent events (Henrotin et al., 2010) while we *a priori* decided to excluded TIAs. The biggest advantage to including TIAs in a study would be the increase in the number of subjects and recurrent events and thus statistical power. However, this advantage may be outweighed by the uncertainty of the association between air pollution and TIA. Although the number of recurrent strokes in our study was similar to previous studies (Henrotin et al., 2010; Suissa et al., 2013), we may have been

underpowered to detect an association, perhaps due to the fact that the observed levels of ambient air pollution in our study population were generally low with modest variability.

Another possible reason we did not observe similar associations in our population could be due to sources of ventilation. According to the American Housing Survey, the prevalence of home air conditioning is much higher in Corpus Christi compared to Boston (87% vs. 26%) (U.S. Census Bureau, 2011), and may also be higher in Texas than in France, the two geographic locations of the prior case-crossover studies. The greater prevalence of air conditioning in our community would blunt the associations between air pollution and recurrent stroke due to decreased infiltration of outdoor air pollution into homes (Janssen et al., 2002). Lower prevalence of air conditioning often promotes more open windows, and thus substantially higher infiltration of air pollution into homes (Allen et al., 2012).

There are some limitations that warrant discussion. In our study we have averaged daily exposure levels at a single monitoring station, which could result in exposure misclassification. However, we have found high correlations ($\rho \geq 80\%$) between multiple monitoring stations in the county (Wing et al., 2015). We may have some misclassification in the timing of our outcome given that we do not have the time of stroke onset, but rather the day of hospital presentation (Lokken et al., 2009). Selection bias could also have played a role in our ability to detect an association between air pollution and recurrent stroke given that in order to be included in our analysis, an individual must have survived their first ischemic stroke. This may also explain our suggestively protective results with same-day exposures. Another possibility is that air pollution exposures could have triggered other outcomes linked to these exposures such as myocardial infarction or death such that competing risks would reduce the observed association between air pollution and recurrent stroke (Brook et al., 2010). There was also limited variability in the exposure which may have limited our power to detect an association.

In conclusion, we observed no associations between previous-day air pollution levels and recurrent ischemic stroke. Little work has been done to explore the influence of air pollutants on risk of recurrence, and more research is necessary in studies that are adequately powered to consider early recurrent stroke risk.

Acknowledgments

None

Funding: This study was supported by grants from the American Heart Association (14PRE18360000) and the National Institutes of Health/National Institute of Neurological Disorders and Stroke (R0138916 and R01NS070941).

References

- Allen RW, Adar SD, Avol E, Cohen M, Curl CL, Larson T, Liu LJS, Sheppard L, Kaufman JD. Modeling the residential infiltration of outdoor PM(2.5) in the Multi-Ethnic Study of Atherosclerosis and Air Pollution (MESA Air). *Environ Health Perspect.* 2012; 120:824–30. DOI: 10.1289/ehp.1104447 [PubMed: 22534026]
- Brook RD, Rajagopalan S, Pope CA, Brook JR, Bhatnagar A, Diez-Roux AV, Holguin F, Hong Y, Luepker RV, Mittleman MA, Peters A, Siscovick D, Smith SC, Whitsel L, Kaufman JD. Particulate

matter air pollution and cardiovascular disease: An update to the scientific statement from the American Heart Association. *Circulation*. 2010; 121:2331–78. DOI: 10.1161/CIR.0b013e3181d8e1 [PubMed: 20458016]

Henrotin JB, Zeller M, Lorgis L, Cottin Y, Giroud M, Béjot Y. Evidence of the role of short-term exposure to ozone on ischaemic cerebral and cardiac events: the Dijon Vascular Project (DIVA). *Heart*. 2010; 96:1990–6. DOI: 10.1136/hrt.2010.200337 [PubMed: 20702540]

Janes H, Sheppard L, Lumley T. Case-crossover analyses of air pollution exposure data: referent selection strategies and their implications for bias. *Epidemiology*. 2005; 16:717–26. DOI: 10.1097/01.ede.0000181315.18836.9d [PubMed: 16222160]

Janssen NAH, Schwartz J, Zanobetti A, Suh HH. Air conditioning and source-specific particles as modifiers of the effect of PM(10) on hospital admissions for heart and lung disease. *Environ Health Perspect*. 2002; 110:43–9.

Jørgensen HS, Nakayama H, Reith J, Raaschou HO, Olsen TS. Stroke recurrence: Predictors, severity, and prognosis. The Copenhagen Stroke Study. *Neurology*. 1997; 48:891–895. DOI: 10.1212/WNL.48.4.891 [PubMed: 9109873]

Lisabeth LD, Escobar JD, Dvorchak JT, Sánchez BN, Majersik JJ, Brown DL, Smith MA, Morgenstern LB. Ambient air pollution and risk for ischemic stroke and transient ischemic attack. *Ann Neurol*. 2008; 64:53–9. DOI: 10.1002/ana.21403 [PubMed: 18508356]

Lokken PR, Wellenius GA, Coull BA, Burger MR, Schlaug G, Suh HH, Mittleman MA. Air Pollution and Risk of Stroke. *Epidemiology*. 2009; 20:137–142. DOI: 10.1097/EDE.0b013e31818ef34a [PubMed: 19244659]

Lumley T, Levy D. Bias in the case–crossover design: implications for studies of air pollution. *Environmetrics*. 2000; 11:689–704.

Morgenstern LB, Smith MA, Sánchez BN, Brown DL, Zahuranec DB, Garcia N, Kerber KA, Skolarus LE, Meurer WJ, Burke JF, Adelman EE, Baek J, Lisabeth LD. Persistent ischemic stroke disparities despite declining incidence in Mexican Americans. *Ann Neurol*. 2013; 74:778–85. DOI: 10.1002/ana.23972 [PubMed: 23868398]

O'Donnell MJ, Fang J, Mittleman MA, Kapral MK, Wellenius GA. Fine particulate air pollution (PM_{2.5}) and the risk of acute ischemic stroke. *Epidemiology*. 2011; 22:422–31. DOI: 10.1097/EDE.0b013e3182126580 [PubMed: 21399501]

Oudin A, Forsberg B, Jakobsson K. Air pollution and stroke. *Epidemiology*. 2012; 23:505–6. DOI: 10.1097/EDE.0b013e31824ea667 [PubMed: 22475837]

Pettersen R, Dahl T, Wyller TB. Prediction of long-term functional outcome after stroke rehabilitation. *Clin Rehabil*. 2002; 16:149–159. DOI: 10.1191/0269215502cr482oa [PubMed: 11911513]

Suissa L, Fortier M, Lachaud S, Staccini P, Mahagne MH. Ozone air pollution and ischaemic stroke occurrence: a case-crossover study in Nice, France. *BMJ Open*. 2013; 3:e004060.doi: 10.1136/bmjopen-2013-004060

TCEQ (Texas Commission on Environmental Quality). Texas Air Monitoring Information System (TAMISWeb). 2012. [WWW Document]. URL <http://www.tceq.texas.gov/agency/data/download-data.html>

TNRIS (Texas Natural Resources Information System). Texas Natural Resources Information System. 2013. [WWW Document]. URL www.tnris.org

U.S. Census Bureau. Washington, DC: Department of Housing and Urban Development; 2011. The American Housing Survey. [WWW Document] URL <http://www.census.gov/programs-surveys/ahs/> [accessed 6.26.15]

US Census Bureau. Census 2010 summary file 2 (SF2). Population of Nueces County, Texas: 2010. 2012. [WWW Document]. URL www.census.gov

Villeneuve PJ, Johnson JYM, Pasichnyk D, Lowes J, Kirkland S, Rowe BH. Short-term effects of ambient air pollution on stroke: Who is most vulnerable? *Sci Total Environ*. 2012; 430:193–201. DOI: 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2012.05.002 [PubMed: 22647242]

Weimar C, Ziegler A, König IR, Diener HC. Predicting functional outcome and survival after acute ischemic stroke. *J Neurol*. 2002; 249:888–95. DOI: 10.1007/s00415-002-0755-8 [PubMed: 12140674]

Wellenius GA, Burger MR, Coull BA, Schwartz J, Suh HH, Koutrakis P, Schlaug G, Gold DR, Mittleman MA. Ambient air pollution and the risk of acute ischemic stroke. *Arch Intern Med*. 2012; 172:229–34. DOI: 10.1001/archinternmed.2011.732 [PubMed: 22332153]

Wing JJ, Adar SD, Sánchez BN, Morgenstern LB, Smith MA, Lisabeth LD. Ethnic differences in ambient air pollution and risk of acute ischemic stroke. *Environ Res*. 2015; 143:62–7. DOI: 10.1016/j.envres.2015.09.031 [PubMed: 26451880]

Abbreviations

PM_{2.5}	particulate matter less than 2.5µm in aerodynamic diameter
O₃	Ozone

Highlights

Research on the influence of air pollutants on risk of stroke recurrence is nascent.

Case-crossover design to assess associations between PM_{2.5}/O₃ and stroke recurrence.

No observed associations between PM_{2.5} or O₃ and risk of stroke recurrence.

Further investigation is necessary in adequately powered studies.

Figure 1. Unadjusted and adjusted odds ratios associated with a 10 µg/m³ increase in 24-h PM_{2.5} for 2000-2012 recurrent ischemic stroke cases in Nueces County, Texas.

Figure 2. Unadjusted and adjusted odds ratios associated with a 10 ppb increase in maximal 8-h O_3 for 2000-2012 recurrent ischemic stroke cases in Nueces County, Texas.

Table 1

Baseline characteristics (N (%)) for recurrent ischemic strokes between January 2000 and June 2012.

Characteristic	n=317
Age Group	
45-59	69 (22)
60-74	108 (34)
75+	140 (44)
Sex	
Female	169 (53)
Male	148 (47)
Ethnicity	
Non-Hispanic White	115 (36)
Mexican American	202 (64)
Atrial Fibrillation	67 (21)
Coronary Artery Disease	122 (38)
Diabetes	166 (52)
Hypertension	266 (84)
NIH Stroke Scale (Index)	
6	97 (31)
< 6	220 (69)
Smoking Status	
Never	233 (74)
Former	38 (12)
Current	42 (13)
Within 1 year of index stroke	147 (46)
Within 5km of monitor	154 (48)
Within 90 days of index stroke	86 (27)
Discharged Home (Index) [†]	
Yes	126 (61)
No	80 (39)

NIH = National Institute of Health

[†] Only available for a subset of the cases