Published in final edited form as:

Labour Econ. 2016 April ; 39: 88–98. doi:10.1016/j.labeco.2016.02.003.

Occupational Skills and Labour Market Progression of Married Immigrant Women in Canada

Alicia Adserà* and

Woodrow Wilson School, Princeton University, 347 Wallace Hall, Princeton NJ 08544

Ana Ferrer

Department of Economics, University of Waterloo, 200 University Avenue, Waterloo, ON, Canada N2L 3G1, aferrer@uwaterloo.ca

Abstract

We use the confidential files of the 1991-2006 Canadian Census, combined with information from O*NET on the skill requirements of jobs, to explore whether immigrant women behave as secondary workers, remaining marginally attached to the labour market and experiencing little career progression over time. Our results show that the current labour market patterns of female immigrants to Canada do not fit this profile, as previous studies found, but rather conform to patterns recently exhibited by married native women elsewhere, with rising participation and wage progression. At best, only relatively uneducated immigrant women in unskilled occupations may fit the profile of secondary workers, with slow skill mobility and low-status job-traps. Educated immigrant women, on the other hand, experience skill assimilation over time: a reduction in physical strength and an increase in analytical skills required in their jobs relative to those of natives.

Keywords

skill assimilation; family investment hypothesis; labour market outcomes of immigrant women; wage gaps; female labour force participation; Canadian migration

1. Introduction

We exploit a large sample of immigrant and native married women taken from the restricted files of four Canadian censuses (1991-2006), combined with information on the skill requirements of the jobs women hold, to examine the progression of market outcomes of immigrant women. To our knowledge, this is the first paper to exclusively assess the labour market advancement of Canadian immigrant women through the changes in the task content of their occupations -- in line with recent work in labour economics. Our results concur with recent findings in the US literature showing that married immigrant women make labour

* Corresponding author ; Email: adsera@princeton.edu.

Publisher's Disclaimer: This is a PDF file of an unedited manuscript that has been accepted for publication. As a service to our customers we are providing this early version of the manuscript. The manuscript will undergo copyediting, typesetting, and review of the resulting proof before it is published in its final citable form. Please note that during the production process errors may be discovered which could affect the content, and all legal disclaimers that apply to the journal pertain.

supply decisions similar to those recently observed for native married women, who are guided by their own opportunities in the labour market, and dispel the more traditional view that Canadian immigrant women behave on average like secondary workers.

A large literature documents immigrant assimilation using different measures of labour market performance (Chiswick, 1978; Borjas, 1985, 1995, 2013). Since the 1990s these studies report that recent immigrant cohorts to most major host countries have experienced a significant deterioration in their economic well-being relative to previous arrival cohorts (See among others, Borjas 1995; Bell, 1997; Dustmann et al., 2003; Aydemur and Skaterud 2005; Antecol et al, 2006; Clark and Lindley, 2009; Beenstock et al., 2010). Traditionally, this work focused on men, partly because labour force decisions of women were more complex and required richer data, and partly because immigrant women's labour force activity was considered less economically relevant. Hence, the majority of earlier studies typically looked solely at male immigrants, though a few papers also analyzed the labour market outcomes of immigrant women (Ferrer and Ridell 2008; Amuedo-Dorantes and de la Rica, 2007; Adserà and Chiswick, 2007; Dustmann and Fabri, 2005; Shoeni, 1998; Duleep and Sanders 1993; Beach and Worswick, 1993). Most of the earlier studies that distinguished workers by gender found that, in general, the assimilation patterns of female and male immigrants were different. A series of papers that employ US and Canadian data (Duleep and Sanders, 1993; Worswick, 1996 and 1999; Baker and Benjamin, 1997; Duleep and Regrets, 1999) found evidence that immigrant women married to immigrant men were more likely to work immediately after migration, but had flatter wage profiles and a lower propensity to undertake country-specific human capital investments than immigrant women married to native-born men. These results support a popular account of the labour supply choices of immigrant women (the Family Investment Hypothesis) that highlights their role as secondary (or lower-wage) earners in the household. This explanation relies on traditional views of gender roles within families and argues that recent immigrant women join the labour market largely to support their husbands' investment in local skills - which depreciate upon migration. However, more recent studies (Blau et al., 2003; Duleep and Dowhan, 2002; Basilio et al., 2009) find that married immigrant women make labour supply decisions similar to those recently observed for native married women.

It is not surprising to find conflicting evidence regarding the labour market outcomes of married immigrant women in the literature since immigration policies and institutions in place to ease immigrant assimilation vary across destinations. These differences, in turn, are bound to affect the composition of immigrant flows and the way immigrant families allocate their time. Further, any changes that occur over time on those same institutional features within a country can result in conflicting empirical results. In many cases, discrepancies across studies regarding immigration outcomes are related to the use of different data sets. For instance, Duleep and Dowhan (2002) analyze longitudinal US data and suggest that the theory of women as secondary workers is consistent with the earnings path of immigrant women to the US from earlier cohorts, but not with that of recent cohorts. Kim and Varanasi (2010) replicate the results in Blau et al. (2003) to find that the secondary worker's theory is partly supported among immigrant women working in low-status jobs

In trying to understand the labour market outcomes of immigrant women, we take advantage of both the novel approaches pioneered by Autor (2013) to study job transitions and the availability of more recent and richer data to contribute to the literature in two dimensions. First, following recent work by Autor and Handel (2013) we expand the set of labour outcomes the literature has examined in the past to analyze the progression of immigrant women in the market - such as participation and wages - to consider as well the skill content of the jobs immigrant women hold. The nature of the work performed is a dimension along which the labour force outcomes of immigrant and native-born women may possibly differ. If immigrant women only participate temporarily as a response to a decrease in family earnings around the time of migration, low status jobs may appear more attractive to them. Qualifying for these positions is easier than for high status jobs that require credentials or experience. Do immigrant women temporarily aim for low-status jobs, which are easy to get and pay relatively well for unskilled workers, to boost family earnings, while their partners upgrade their qualifications? In addition, as their partners settle, do they move to better positions or they drop out from the labour force? The ability to answer these questions using only standard measures of occupational category may be limited. Considering broad measures of occupational status – such as blue/white collar or managerial/non-managerial jobs - may miss a substantial part of the change in occupational status. But including too finely detailed job classifications --such as 4-digit level SOC occupations - is impractical. Hence, in this paper we employ a small set of fundamental occupational skills – such as analytical capability and physical strength demands of jobs - obtained from the Occupational Information Network (O*Net). With these tools we focus on the degree of attachment to low-skill jobs among immigrant women and how the skill requirements of their jobs change with time in Canada.

Second, we also extend the existing literature by looking at the most recent cohorts of Canadian immigrants with the 20% confidential Canadian Census that offers more detailed information than the publicly available data employed by previous studies. It allows us to better control for immigrant heterogeneity in an array of dimensions. For instance, detailed information of country of birth allows us to include in the models measures of both linguistic proximity between origin and destination countries and the degree of labour force attachment among women in the source countries, to better understand (and control for) the influence of the country of origin on the outcomes of immigrant women. Much has changed in the Canadian labour market during the 1990s and 2000s, particularly in regards to immigration policy. As a result, the composition of the immigrant pool has evolved, and most notably the educational attainment of immigrants relative to that of natives has increased (Ferrer et al., 2014 and Bonikowska et al., 2011). In view of these changes, we do not necessarily expect to replicate previous results in the literature of Canadian immigration, which find evidence that immigrant women might behave like secondary workers, with our data.

Our results indicate that immigrant women experience substantial advancement in the Canadian labour market over the years, with rising participation and wage progression. University-educated women start at relatively low levels of participation and wages but experience substantial improvements over the years. Less-educated immigrants show instead flatter profiles. This dichotomy is also apparent when examining the skills required by the

jobs they hold. Relatively uneducated immigrant women in low-skill occupations experience little improvement in skills over the years. Educated immigrant women, on the other hand, progressively work in jobs requiring substantially less physical strength and slightly more analytical skills.

The next section discusses the methodology and presents the data. Section 3 shows the results on labour force participation, wages and skill assimilation of women with time in Canada. Section 4 discusses the robustness of the results, and the final section concludes.

2. Methodology and Data

Our analysis of the labour market assimilation of immigrant women follows pioneer work by Borjas (1985) that, in absence of longitudinal data, relies on multiple cross-sectional data to disentangle the cohort and entry effects from immigrant outcomes.¹ We distinguish four different types of families in our analysis and include separate entry-cohort effects for each immigrant spouse. We estimate the following type of regression to compare the performance of immigrant women to those of the native-born

$$Y_{it} = X_{it}\beta_1 + \sum_{h=I, NB} \sum_t \sum_k \tau_{kt} C_{ik}^{Wh} * S_t + \sum_{w=I, NB} \sum_t \sum_k \tau_{kt} C_{ik}^{Hw} * S_t + \sum_t \gamma_t S_t + \varepsilon_{it}$$

where the dependent variable (Y_{it}) is a measure of labour market performance of woman i , in survey year t ; X_{it} is a vector of individual/household characteristics including age, age squared, fertility indicators, education, husband wage, province and city of residence, and a measure of linguistic proximity of mother tongue to local language; C_{ik}^{Wh} , C_{ik}^{Hw} are indicators for different k -immigrant arrival cohorts of immigrant wives (W)/husbands (H) with either immigrant or native spouses-, which we interact with a full set of indicators S_t for survey year (t) to track the evolution of different cohorts over time on a particular outcome. This approach yields more flexible estimates of assimilation patterns than more traditional approaches that use a continuous variable for years since migration (and its square). The latter impose either a linear or quadratic pattern of assimilation over time, whereas our specification generates separate estimates each time the cohort is observed in our data without restricting the shape of the assimilation profile.² Cohorts are defined over five years (e.g. the “86-90” cohort includes individuals arriving between 1986 and 1990). To differentiate two-immigrant couples from mixed couples, cohort effects vary depending on whether the husband/wife (h/w) of the immigrant is him/herself immigrant or Canadian born. This analysis is directly comparable to previous literature that studied the performance of immigrant women in Canada in the context of the family investment hypothesis. This line of research distinguishes these types of couples to disentangle whether incentives of women

¹Lubotsky (2007) shows that using cross-sectional data overestimates the wage progression of immigrants in the US. However, longitudinal data adequate to study immigrant progress is very rare. In Canada, there is only one panel data set with enough information about immigrants for such study (The Survey of Income and Labour Dynamics, SLID). However, it only follows individuals for a maximum of 6 years and the small numbers do not permit to properly control for immigrant heterogeneity. The Immigrant Data Base (IMBD) does not have information about occupation after arrival.

²In separate estimates (available upon request) we show that our results are robust to a specification that includes both a linear and a quadratic “year since migration” trend. However, such specification tends to overestimate the progress made over time for recent cohorts.

to work varied depending on migration-family status (Baker and Benjamin (1997), Worswick (1999)). Even though our main results follow through if we pool all married immigrant (native-born) women together, we show some differences in the performance of immigrant women in mixed versus those in immigrant families that render this distinction useful. The coefficients for the cohort-time indicators τ_{kt} are the key parameters of interest. In our robustness analysis, we also include gender differences in labour force participation across countries of origin to control for cultural differences in preferences for female employment.

Our basic measures of labour market performance Y_{it} are labour force participation and wages. In addition, a distinctive feature of our analysis is a focus on a third measure of performance, namely occupational skills.

2.1 Data and Sample Selection

The data comes from the restricted individual files of the Canadian Census (1991 through 2006).³ Previous Canadian studies on this topic employed both public-use Census 1981 and Census 1991 (Worswick, 1996, 1999), or the Survey of Consumer Finances, 1986 and 1991 (Baker and Benjamin, 1997). Confidential Census files include a large level of information on key variables such as country of origin (for immigrants) or fertility in comparison to that contained in public-use data. Further, these files offer comprehensive information on individual labour market outcomes, occupation, country of birth, year of arrival, and mother tongue. For each woman we compile relevant data regarding other members of the household, including spouse and the number of children, to obtain detailed measures of fertility based on the number of children in the household and the spouse's immigration and labour market characteristics. Our indicators of fertility include the number of births, the age of the children, and the mother's age at different births. The inclusion of these variables in the models can potentially account for interruptions in labour force attachment over a woman's life cycle. Childbearing is an important area in which the behavior of immigrant and Canadian-born females is likely to diverge (Adserà and Ferrer, 2014 a).

As suggested by previous research, both fluency in the language of the destination country and the ability to learn it quickly will influence an immigrant's success in destination countries' labour markets (Bleakley and Chin 2004; Chiswick and Miller 2010; Dustmann and van Soest 2002). However, the Canadian Census has no measure of linguistic fluency that would help to undertake this type of analysis. As a proxy for fluency, we use a measure of linguistic proximity between origin and destination languages based on the levels of the linguistic family tree both languages share developed in Adserà and Pytliková (2015).

We select a sample of married (or common-law, CL) women aged 18 to 45 for our analysis. We choose this age range to focus on the main reproductive years of women and to render our measures of fertility more reliable since we use the number of children living in the household rather than the actual number of births. In addition, we only include immigrant

³Although the 1981 and 1986 Census could have been available for this research, the difficulty of matching Standard Occupation Classification (SOC) and "Place of birth" from the earlier Census limited their usefulness. Further, in addition to major shifts in the occupational classification codes, the skill requirements within some occupations likely changed between 1981 and 2002, the year when the O*Net skills we employ were derived.

women who immigrated as adults – at age 18 or after to focus on the assimilation of younger (adult) immigrant women, which constitute the majority of the immigrants.⁴ We exclude aboriginal individuals, since their analysis presents a very different set of challenges. In order to reduce computing time to a reasonable length, from each census we select all married immigrant women plus a 20 percent random sample of married Canadian born women in the same age range and weight the observations accordingly.⁵ Our final sample contains over 800,000 observations.

2.2 Measures of Skills

As mentioned in the introduction, most job changes (and their accompanying wage responses) might not result in a change in the occupational category, particularly when measured broadly, but they may involve substantial adjustments in skill requirements. Autor and Handel (2013)'s pioneer work uses the detailed information contained in occupation databases - either the Dictionary of Occupational Titles (DOT) or the Occupational Information Network (O*NET) – to derive a small set of fundamental skill requirements for each job to be used in the analysis. These have the advantage of being limited in range, but to account for variation in very detailed occupational classifications. The skills we consider here are derived from the O*NET by Imai et al (2011). These include two indexes for cognitive skills (social and analytical) and three indexes for manual skills (fine motor skills, physical strength, and visual skills). This classification differs from the one employed by others who study the routine/non-routine nature of the jobs (Autor and Dorn, 2013; Warman and Worswick, 2015) to understand the effect of skill biased technological change on wage inequality. We abstract from this distinction to focus on the more general notion of manual and non-manual skills that seems more relevant in the case of immigrants.

To facilitate interpretation of the data, Imai et al. (2011) summarize the detailed information in the O*NET by constructing a low-dimensional vector of occupational characteristics using Principal Component Analysis (PCA).⁶ The result is a vector of skills necessary to perform the job tasks associated with each 4-digit occupational category using the O*NET. The factor analysis uses as weights the distribution of the skill distribution of the Canadian working population; hence a unit of the skill score (with mean zero) can be interpreted as one standard deviation in the skill distribution of the Canadian population.⁷ A positive index indicates either more physical strength or analytical demands than the job held by the average worker.

⁴The behavior of child immigrants is likely to be very different from that of adult immigrants (Adserà and Ferrer, 2014a; Mayer and Riphalm, 2000), particularly since they do not confront the same trade-offs between work and family at arrival as adults do and they are likely to assimilate more easily to Canadian norms through schooling. Further, most adult immigrant women are married at the time of arrival as marriage is a requirement for spousal visa, the most common visa among female immigrants.

⁵Unfortunately the census does not contain information on marriage dates and we are unable to distinguish immigrants who were already married before immigration from those who were not.

⁶In the PCA, factor loadings are calculated so that variation of the data explained by the constructed variable is maximized. A detailed description of the procedure can be found in Imai et al. (2011).

⁷Note that skills here measure the skills involved in performing each job and not the actual skills of the worker. Figure 1 in the appendix shows the full distribution of analytical and physical strength skills by family type.

2.3. Descriptive statistics

Table 1 presents summary statistics of women by family type. Immigrant women are older and more likely to hold a university degree than natives. Conversely, immigrant women are less likely to participate in the labour market and work fewer hours per week on average than Canadian-born. Among immigrants, linguistic proximity is the lowest for women in immigrant couples. Around 40% of these women come from countries where either English or French is an official language – compared to 60% of immigrant women in mixed marriages – while for a large fraction of immigrant women (23%) none of the official languages in their country of origin has any common branch in the linguistic tree with either English or French.

With regard to skill requirements, the jobs held by immigrant women in immigrant couples have the highest strength and motor scores and the lowest analytical (or quantitative) and social (or interpersonal) scores among all married women. These are usually characteristics attached to low status occupations. Immigrant women in immigrant couples work in occupations that require social and analytical skills 0.10 and 0.13 standard deviations, respectively, below the average Canadian worker (both men and women pooled together). Even though their motor and strength skill requirements are also below those required for the average Canadian worker, they are the highest among all groups of married women. In contrast, the average skill requirements in jobs held by immigrant women in mixed marriages involve social and analytical skills that are on average 0.26 and 0.09 standard deviations above the mean for Canadian workers. Moreover, their motor and strength skill requirements are 0.36 and 0.30 standard deviations below that of the average Canadian worker.

3. Regression results

3.1. Labour force participation

Previous papers analyzing the role of immigrant women in the labour market start by examining whether or not, as expected for secondary workers, immigrant women with immigrant spouses are more likely to participate in the labour market upon arrival to the country than similar native-born (or than immigrants married to native-born) and whether their participation declines with time in Canada. In the same line, a second prediction of the literature to be contrasted empirically is whether or not immigrant women are more likely than other women to enter low-status job that they eventually leave as their spouses assimilate.

We use a logit model to estimate a specification of equation (1) where the dependent variable is a binary indicator of labour force participation (1 if the respondent was employed or looking for a job last week, 0 otherwise). Results are presented in Table 2 in the form of odds ratios that can be interpreted as the difference in the probability that immigrant women participate relative to similar native-born women with native-born partners. The first panel shows the odds ratio of participating in any type of job for all married women depending on the years in Canada and the second panel only for the sample of university-educated women. It is natural to focus in the latter group separately because, during the 1990 and early 2000s,

Canadian immigration policy placed a strong emphasis on formal education. Although the qualification requirements typically concerned the main applicant, generally a man, they resulted in an increasing fraction of highly-educated spouses (Sweetman and Warman, 2009). Hence, recent cohorts of immigrant women to Canada have high levels of education relative to native-born and are deemed more likely to participate consistently in the labour market than previous cohorts.

Some recent studies show an association between home country characteristics such as female labour force participation rates and immigrant women's labour market decisions in the host country (Frank and Hou, 2013; Blau et al. 2011; Fernández and Fogli 2009). In separate regressions (available upon request) we add controls for place of birth and characteristics of the country of origin (such as GDP per capita, fraction of individuals with higher education, or female labour force participation) to our estimations, as a way to partly account for the influence of culture or ethnicity on labour market outcomes. Results from those regressions are qualitatively similar to the ones presented in Table 2, with slightly higher levels of overall participation than when these country characteristics are omitted. We prefer to show results for the average immigrant woman in each cohort since the focus of this paper is not on cultural differences among immigrants

All cohorts of immigrant women in the sample show lower levels of participation at arrival than the Canadian born. Their participation then rises steadily (rather than declining) over years spent in Canada. In column 2 of Table 2, for instance, the odds ratio of immigrant women with immigrant partners to participate in the labour market during their first 5 years in Canada - relative to a native-born woman - was 0.346 for the cohort that arrived between 1991 and 1996. After 15 years in the country, the participation of the same cohort of immigrant women relative to natives had increased to 0.737. The pattern looks very similar for both immigrant women in immigrant couples and those in mixed partnerships. Although the first group shows somewhat lower levels of participation than those in mixed couples (particularly for later arrival cohorts), attachment to the labour market evolves at a similar pace for both groups. Neither group of immigrant women behaves as predicted for secondary workers. Instead, their experience of increasing participation resembles that of immigrant men during the assimilation process (Borjas, 1995; Aydemir and Skuterud 2005) or that of immigrant women in the US and Germany in recent papers (Blau et al. 2003; Basilio et al. 2009).

The main results carry on when we look instead at the number of hours per week worked by these cohorts in estimates not presented here but available upon request. On average, immigrant women in immigrant couples arriving in the late 1980s work 5.6 hours per week less than Canadian-born women upon arrival, but only 2 hours less 15 years after migration. Differences with the Canadian born at the time of arrival have grown for subsequent cohorts. However, convergence toward the levels of Canadian-born women over time is also substantial. For those cohorts arriving during the first half of 1990s, weekly hours go from an average of 10 hours less than the native born during the first five years since migration to an average of 3 hours less after 15 years in Canada. For those arriving during the last part of the 1990s, weekly hours go from 12 hours less than the native born during the first five years, to 7 hours less after ten years. These results contrast with previous findings in Baker

and Benjamin (1997) who explored the intensive margin of labour supply decisions of immigrant couples s that hours of work declined with time in Canada for women in immigrant couples arriving before 1990. The two papers differ in a number of dimensions that could explain these differences such as the data source and the coverage period. However, a plausible account for the divergent findings is that the latest cohorts of immigrant women included in our analysis are more committed to the labour market than previous cohorts.

To study these patterns in detail, we look at how labour market outcomes evolve for immigrant women in low-skill occupations. We expect that immigrant women, who seek only temporary attachment to the labour market to support family settlement in Canada, are more likely to enter low-skill occupations (Kim and Vanarasi, 2010). Low-skill jobs are defined here as those requiring skills at the bottom 25% of the analytical skill distribution or at the top 25% of the physical strength skill distribution.⁸ Hence, the dependent variable is 1 if a woman works in a low-skill job and 0 otherwise. If immigrant women are entering these occupations merely to support their husbands while they update their human capital, we would expect to see high levels of employment in these jobs - at least around the time of migration - relative to the native-born. The first set of columns in Table 3 shows the results of this exercise both for analytical and for strength skills separately. Upon entry to Canada, immigrants work at a higher or similar rate in low-skill jobs than similar native-born married women. Further, immigrant women with immigrant partners (column 1 and 3) experience a relative *increase* in employment in low-skill jobs over time. Consider, for instance, the 1986-90 cohort who is 1.3 times more likely to work in low skill (quantitative) jobs upon entry than the native born, and ends up being 1.8 times more likely to work in these jobs after 20 years in Canada. While a declining relative employment pattern could have been difficult to interpret since it could be due to women either retiring from the labour force or moving up into more skilled positions, the increasing pattern suggests that immigrant women either remain or continue to be in low-skill jobs at a much higher rate than native-born women do. In contrast, immigrant women in mixed couples show rather flat profiles of employment in low skill jobs with years in Canada, with some cohorts displaying higher levels of employment than others.

To confirm that the previous patterns are not driven by movements out of the labour force, we re-estimate the odds of being in low-skill jobs restricting the sample to employed women (see Table 3 in the Appendix). This implies that the odd ratios are relative to those employed in jobs requiring medium or high skill levels. Even though odds ratios increase across the board, we observe the same increasing trends for immigrant women married to immigrants when looking at the odds ratios of being in jobs with low analytical-skill requirements as in Table 3. When considering high strength jobs, relative to other jobs, immigrant women in more recent cohorts do seem to reduce their relative presence – rather than to merely remain - in these low-skill jobs.

⁸Results are similar if we use instead jobs requiring low social skills (at the bottom 25% of the social skill distribution) or high fine motor or visual skills (at the top 25% of the corresponding skill distributions) to define a low-skill job.

In light of this result, it is natural to ponder whether or not the type of immigrant women entering low-skill jobs is substantially different from that of native-born entering those same jobs. In particular, since immigrant women are relatively better educated (as shown in Table 1) and presumably more career-oriented, they may not be inclined to leave the labour force even if they remain in comparatively worse jobs than those associated with their formal training. In the second set of columns of Table 3, we repeat the same analysis with the subsample of university-educated women to compare women with potentially closer career expectations. Among university-educated immigrants, those in mixed couples are between 1.7 and 2.5 times more likely to be employed in occupations requiring low analytical skills and 1 to 1.4 times more likely to work in occupations requiring high physical strength than similarly educated natives. The odds ratios for both types of low-skill jobs decline over time for the cohorts of 1986-90 and 1996-00, but they only converge with Canadian-born women in jobs requiring high levels of strength. However, among women in immigrant couples relative employment in low-skill jobs steadily rises with time in Canada, particularly in those requiring low analytical skills. The likelihood of working in those jobs is more than 3 times higher for these women than for similar native-born, even 10 and 15 years after migration.⁹ Again, we test the robustness of these results to only including employed women (in Table 3 of the appendix). The likelihood of employment in jobs requiring low analytical skills increases, but to a lesser extent than when we do not condition on employment. The relative employment in high-strength jobs, among highly-educated migrant married to immigrants, decreases over time when only employed women are included in the sample.

Due to the lack of longitudinal dimension in the Census data, it is not possible to accurately assess whether the reduction over time in the prevalence of high strength jobs among married employed immigrant women in recent cohorts represents actual career progression for them, withdrawal from the labour force, or movements towards low-skill analytical jobs (that also happen to require less strength). Further, it is not possible to interpret the large fraction of university-educated immigrant women employed in low-skill occupations as indicating that highly-educated immigrant women get *trapped* in relatively low-skill positions. An alternative explanation for these results could be that educated immigrants start in low-skill jobs, move up to higher skill positions over time and are replaced (in the aggregate) by immigrant women of the same arrival cohort who were not working before. The fact that these trends are somewhat muted for highly educated immigrant women (or even exhibit a decrease for high strength job) when we condition on employment seems to support this latter view. We do indeed observe that the fraction of immigrant university-educated women in high-skill occupations (which require skills either at the bottom quartile of the strength distribution or the top quartile of the analytical one) increases over time for most cohorts. In Figure 1 we present separate estimates that focus in detail on the first five years after migration. Results indicate educated women enter low-skill positions at much faster rate than those in the high end of the labour market. After one year in Canada, the odds that a university-educated immigrant woman is in a low-skill job relative to similarly

⁹Although the number of university-educated individuals working in low-skill analytical jobs is not large - just under 20,000 in our sample - it includes mostly immigrant women in a 3 to 1 ratio.

educated native-born woman move up from around 1.3 at arrival to 2, whereas the odds ratio of holding a high-skill job remains stable around 0.6 and only slowly increase to 0.8 after five years in Canada.

3.2. Wage assimilation

The pace of wage assimilation as immigrant women spend more time in Canada provides key information to understand their labour market performance (Duleep and Dowhan 2002; Basilio et al. 2009). Researchers who view immigrant women as secondary workers, only entering the labour market temporarily in response to household income needs, do not expect to observe significant wage advancement among these workers, but rather relatively flat wage profiles.

We estimate an OLS regression of equation (1) where log wages are the dependent variable to analyze the wage-gap among different cohorts of immigrant women and similar native-born women over time. Results in table 4 column (1) show that married immigrant women have low initial earnings - between 20 and 50% lower - that gradually converge towards those of the native-born. The initial wage-gap is larger for more recent cohorts and, even though they converge at a somewhat faster rate than those who arrived in the late 1980s, the gap is still quite substantial after 10 years in Canada.¹⁰

A substantial part of the gap seems to be related to the skills required in the jobs women hold. Controlling for the skills jobs demand (column 2), the wage gap of recent cohorts decreases except for the 1996-2000 entry cohort which arrived at the time of the IT bust in Canada. Wages are generally higher in jobs requiring high levels of social, motor and analytical skill and lower in jobs requiring high levels of physical strength and visual skills.

To take into account the underlying selection of women into the labour force, we use a two-step Heckman correction model to estimate the wages for different cohorts over time. As instruments for the first stage participation equation, we include the number of children in the household and the female/male ratio of labour force participation in the country of origin either at the time when the woman immigrated to Canada or when she was 18 years of age for the Canadian-born.¹¹ Results are shown in column (3). First stage estimates and the test of interdependence of equations are presented in the electronic appendix. Our instruments are all strongly significant. Fertility indicators and the gender labour force ratio at home are, respectively, negatively and positively related to women's labour force participation. The Chi2 test of independence of equation confirms the endogeneity of participation decisions. Accounting for selection generally reduces the wage gap between immigrant and native-born women, particularly during the first years after arrival, but produces similar estimates after 15 years in Canada than those in column (2). The first finding implies that during the first years in the country active immigrant women are relatively more negatively selected than natives. This pattern would be consistent with immigrant women who are relatively better in some unobservable dimensions (such as ability) choosing to remain outside of the labor

¹⁰We find a similar increasing wage profile even when we restrict the sample to women working in low-status jobs (those that require low levels of analytical skills), which are the jobs secondary workers are expected to enter. Results are available from the authors upon request.

¹¹The measure of female labor force participation ratio in the country of origin comes from Frank and Hou (2013).

force at arrival in order to invest in their human capital and obtain local credentials. This behavior is reasonable in the presence of strong complementarities in the labor market between their unobserved ability and human capital. The latter finding could denote the diminishing influence of the culture of the country of origin with time spent in Canada as well as a less selected sample, as more immigrant enter the labor force over the years. The observed reduction in the wage gap when selection is taken into account is particularly strong for the 2001 cohort. Overall, patterns observed in columns (1) to (3) consistently confirm strong wage assimilation with years in Canada.¹²

Columns 4 and 5 in table 4 show separate results for the subsamples of non-university and university-educated women respectively. To ease the interpretation of the findings Figure 2 displays these estimates. Even though the entry wage gap between university-educated native born and immigrants rose to 47% for the most recent cohorts the rate of wage progression is also fast for this group (wage differences close down to 15% after 15 years in Canada). In contrast, for non-university educated women, initial wage gaps between natives and immigrants stand at around 20%, but they disappear within 15 years.¹³

Given the relative high levels of educational attainment of recent immigrant women compared to those of native-born, their low initial pay is unlikely to be the product of low levels of worker' skills, but rather of difficulties in transferring them to the new environment. Among these hurdles, language barriers are a likely candidate.¹⁴

3.3. Skill assimilation

Results presented to this point indicate that, first, immigrant women do not leave the labour force – not even low-skill jobs - by the time their partners have presumably assimilated, and second, they show important wage progression over the years in Canada. Rather than behaving as secondary workers, immigrant women seem to remain attached to the labour market, and pursue careers of their own. To properly evaluate the progress of these women, an analysis of job-skill mobility could be even more informative than, or at least complementary to, an analysis of participation or of wages. Immigrant women may be undergoing considerable “occupational jumping” from initial low-skill jobs to higher skilled jobs over time. As a consequence, a significant change in job required skills may not be accompanied by shifts in employment or even immediate wage gains if a woman is switching to a new job requiring a different set of skills.

To study patterns of skill mobility among immigrant women relative to natives, we estimate an OLS model of equation (1) where the dependent variable measures the level of a particular skill index required in the job each woman holds. The purpose of this exercise is to assess whether or not there is upgrading with time in Canada in the skills required by the jobs immigrant women perform. Figures 3 and 4, panel (a), present these results for

¹²In addition to those mentioned above, we explore alternative fertility measures to address selection into the labour force -including the number of children before immigration and age at first birth - with and without including occupational skills in the regression. Results, albeit at different levels, show the same steep assimilation pattern described in model (3).

¹³Although not shown here, estimates of cohort effects on wages correcting for selection are similar to those presented above.

¹⁴Proper analysis of effect of language in the transfer of skills across countries is out of the scope of this paper. We pursue this analysis in a separate paper (Adserà and Ferrer, 2014 b)

analytical and strength skill for all immigrant women in mixed and non-mixed couples separately. Table 2 in the electronic appendix shows the estimated coefficients and standard errors.

Immigrants generally work in jobs requiring more strength or less analytical skills than similar natives. Those in mixed couples are closer to the native-born than those in immigrant couples and experience some advancement over time in both skill dimensions. However, the patterns of skill mobility (both strength and analytical) for those in immigrant couples are surprisingly flat. A somewhat unexpected result is the relative absence of cohort effects in analytical skill progression, with successive cohorts starting mainly at similar relative levels of skills at arrival and with years in Canada. By contrast estimates show strong cohort effects for relative strength skills at arrival. The strength requirements of the jobs held by immigrant women in immigrant couples during their first years in Canada significantly increased from around 16 per cent higher than those held by natives among women who arrived in the late 1980s to around 22 per cent higher for those who arrived in the early 1990s during a period of economic downturn. The immigrant cohorts who entered in 1996-2000, once the impact of the 1991 crises had subsided, did relatively better: their strength requirements were only around 10 per cent higher than those of similar natives.

These estimated patterns suggest that the majority of immigrant women experience little career progression as measured by the skills embodied in their jobs. On its own, this finding could be understood as the result of low a labour force attachment that is characteristic of secondary workers. However, it is somewhat puzzling when taken together with the patterns of labour force participation, employment and wage mobility examined before.

Potentially, these aggregate results are masking different behavior for different subsets of immigrant women. As noted, considerable changes during the 1990s and 2000s in the Canadian immigration policy have altered the educational composition of immigration. It is plausible that the career expectations and labour force attachment of immigrant women may differ by their educational attainment. To explore this issue in more detail, we repeat the analysis for the subsample of university-educated women. Results are shown in panel (b) of figures 3 and 4 (and coefficients in table 2 in the appendix). The picture for university-educated immigrants, with a clear trend in skill progression, is very different from that of the average immigrant. The amount of analytical skills required by their jobs increases over time but, more importantly, there is a significant reduction in the amount of strength skills those same positions demand. Educated immigrants with immigrant spouses from the 1996 cohort start in jobs requiring strength skills that are 0.3 standard deviations above those required for the average Canadian-born woman job. After 5 years in Canada, those women hold jobs that require strength levels only 0.15 standard deviations above the average -- a remarkable improvement considering the flat profiles observed for the average immigrant woman. This implies that mainly immigrants with non-university education are those who remain in low status jobs that require increasing levels of strength skills and decreasing levels of analytical skills over time.

4. Robustness

4.1 Immigrant husbands

Among recently arrived immigrants, a working wife may allow men more time to search for a suitable job or to train and to acquire local human capital (Worswick 1996, 1999). If this strategy is successful, these immigrants may assimilate better in the labour market than those whose wives do not work. We test to what extent the labour force participation of immigrant women is associated with better labour outcomes of their husbands. In particular, we use the same methodology as before to examine the wage and skill progression of immigrant men married to the immigrant women in our sample, and differentiate whether or not the wife participates in the labour market. Results for male wages and analytical skills are shown in Table 5.

Men whose wives participate in the labour market show almost identical labour market progression - both in terms of wages and required skills - to the average immigrant. Their wages start around 38 to 60 percent less than those of natives at arrival, depending on the arrival-cohort. Irrespective of the wife's labour market attachment, wage gaps with respect to natives are halved by the time these men have been in Canada between 15 and 10 years. Analytical skill progression of both the average married immigrant and that of migrants whose spouse participates are also very close. If anything, migrants whose wives participate do slightly worse than the average immigrant in terms of levels of analytical skills. Overall the married immigrant men gap in analytical skills with respect to similar natives does not improve, but rather increases over time.

4.2 Cultural preferences regarding the labour market

The distinction between immigrant women in either immigrant or mixed partnerships aims to control for differences between immigrants and natives in cultural preferences regarding female participation as well as to focus on the effect of transitory household income shocks at arrival on female labour market attachment (Baker and Benjamin, 1997). Immigrants from the same areas of origin will likely share cultural preferences for work, but those married to native born do not experience family income shocks pushing them into the labour market. Of course, separating immigrant women by the nativity of their spouses is not a perfect strategy if - as expected - there is selection into inter-marriage. On the one hand, if mixed unions take place after arrival as a result of assortative matching, the outcomes of immigrants married to natives may not be a good control for immigrant's cultural preferences for work, since there might be individual unobserved characteristics influencing both the propensity to marry natives and labour market choices.¹⁵ More importantly, if some immigrants were not already married upon arrival, but married later, our estimates do not adequately measure the choices of married women facing different household constraints at the time of arrival. A few researchers - see Cobb-Clark and Crossley (2004) or Basilio et al. (2009), Cohen-Goldner et al. (2009) among others - are able to use information on the time of marriage to

¹⁵Table 1 shows that immigrant women in mixed partnerships are more educated and have closer linguistic proximity to the native-born than other immigrant women. This suggests that they might not be a good control group for the labor force preferences of immigrants. These human capital advantages can help them land better jobs, but also make them more likely to marry native-born individuals and here we cannot distinguish the two effects.

eliminate the potential bias due to assortative matching and/or the effect of marital status on labour outcomes. However, the majority of the literature (including this paper) is limited by datasets that do not contain age at marriage and, as a result, assumes that immigrant couples immigrated together. Therefore it is not possible to interpret our findings as causal or to argue that the distinction between mixed and immigrant couples frees our results from immigrant's cultural preferences regarding work outcomes.

We develop several strategies to assess the robustness of the results to consideration of selection into marriage. Regarding the heterogeneity in cultural preferences for work, in alternative specifications (available upon request) we include the gender labour force participation ratio in the country of origin of each immigrant measured at their time of migration to Canada as an alternative control for cultural preferences regarding the labour market that does not rely on mixed unions. Previous research has found this variable to be associated with the labour market outcomes of immigrant women at destination countries (Frank and Hou, 2013). The variable is strongly significant but its inclusion does not change our participation results qualitatively. This suggests that broadly measured cultural preferences for work do not influence our results substantially

Since the majority of immigrant women are married at arrival, selection into marriage is only a small concern in our case.¹⁶ As a robustness test, we run our models for the subsample of immigrant women who arrived before their partners (and presumably were not married at arrival). Estimates for immigrant couples are not significantly different from those presented in the paper and are available upon request.

4.3 Age cohort across census years

One concern with cohort analysis regards the adequacy of the reference group (native-born women married to native-born husbands, aged 18 to 45), which changes over time as native-born women age out of earlier census and are replaced by women from a younger cohort in recent census. We have repeated the analysis using a single age cohort of women – those who were 18 to 24 in 1991 – to keep the age effects constant through the census years. All our results are robust for this subsample and are available upon request.

4.4 Differences in incentives to support husbands' investment in local human capital

As suggested by Duleep and Regrets (1999), immigrant women with educated partners have potentially more to gain from supporting their husbands' investment in local skills. It is plausible that patterns of behavior expected from secondary work are more prevalent among these women than for the average immigrant. To examine whether this is the case, we consider the subsample of women married to educated husbands (those with university education). Somewhat surprisingly, we do not see large differences in the participation and employment profiles of the two groups, both in levels and evolution over time. Immigrant women married to highly-educated immigrant husbands show increasing levels of employment in low analytically skilled jobs with years since migration as the average

¹⁶Citizen and Immigration Canada reports that 72% of immigrant women arriving in 2004 are married at the time of landing. In our sample we estimate this number to be 75% (including common law status)

immigrant woman does, rather than high initial levels that decline over time. Further, the patterns of wage assimilation of women married to highly-educated immigrant husbands and those of women married to less-educated immigrant husbands are alike. Finally, the evolution of analytical skills used in the jobs held by the subsample of immigrant women married to highly-educated immigrant husbands is also similar to that of all immigrant women. Results are presented in Figures 3 and 4 in the electronic appendix.

Conclusion

Our results show that on average immigrant women participate significantly more in the labour market and experience wage gains over time, even though the skills required by their jobs do not converge to those of natives. However, university-educated women also experience significant skill progression with years in Canada. With time in Canada they work at jobs that require less strength and slightly more analytical skills. These results do not accord with the basic predictions of a model that views immigrant women as secondary workers, entering the labour market in response to the income shock brought by the initial depreciation of their husbands' skills in their new location, and are at odds with findings for previous cohorts of Canadian immigrant women (Baker and Benjamin 1997). Our results fit, however, recent evidence on the performance of married immigrant women in the US (Blau et al., 2003 among others) showing they make labour supply decisions similar to those recently observed for native married women. These findings are robust to a variety of alternative specifications.

One of the main changes brought about by the Canadian immigration policy reform during the 1990s and 2000s is an increase in the fraction of female immigrants with post-secondary education. Their share went up from 32 to 57% over the period 1991-2006, while the corresponding proportion for native-born women only rose from 32 to 48%.¹⁷ Our analysis by educational attainment suggests that most labour market progression for immigrant women occurs precisely for the group of highly educated women. Despite starting with very low wages and relatively high levels of employment in low-skill jobs, there is evidence of rapid wage gains and of (a somewhat slower) job-skill progression for university-educated immigrants. Overall, notwithstanding the observed labour market assimilation, the gap between immigrants and the native-born does not close even after 20 years in Canada.

Supplementary Material

Refer to Web version on PubMed Central for supplementary material.

Acknowledgments

The work reported in this paper was partly supported by NIH under grant number 2R24HD047879.

¹⁷CANSIM table 054-0002, based on data from the Longitudinal Immigrant Data Base and CANSIM table 282-0004 based on Labour Force Survey estimates

References

- Amuedo-Dorantes C, De La Rica S. Labour Market Assimilation of Recent Immigrants in Spain. *British Journal of Industrial Relations*. 2007; 45(2):257–284.
- Antecol, H.; Kuhn, P.; Trejo, S. Canada and the United States. Vol. 41. JHR; 2006. Assimilation via Prices or Quantities? Sources of Immigrant Earnings Growth in Australia; p. 821–840.
- Adserà A, Chiswick B. Are There Gender Differences in Immigrant Labour Market Outcomes across European Countries? *Journal of Population Economics*. 2007; 20(3):495–526.
- Adserà A, Ferrer A. Fertility Adaptation of Child Migrants to Canada. *Population Studies*. 2014 a; 68(1):65–79. [PubMed: 23800074]
- Adserà A, Ferrer A. The Effect of Linguistic Proximity on the Occupational Assimilation of Immigrant Men. CLSRN working paper #144. 2014 b
- Adserà A, Pytliková M. The Role of Languages in Shaping International Migration. *Economic Journal* vol. 2015; 125(586):F49–F81.
- Autor D. The “Task Approach” to Labour Markets: An Overview. *Journal for Labour Market Research*. Vol. 2013; 46(3):185–199.
- Autor D, Dorn D. The Growth of Low-skill Service Jobs and the Polarization of the US Labour Market. *American Economic Review*. Vol. 2013; 103(5):1553–1597.
- Autor D, Handel M. Putting Tasks to the Test: Human Capital, Job Tasks, and Wages. *Journal of Labour Economics*. 2013; 31(2):S59–S96.
- Aydemir A, Skuterud M. Explaining the Deteriorating Entry Earnings of Canadian Immigrant Cohorts: 1966–2000. *Canadian Journal of Economics*. 2005; 38(2):641–72.
- Basilio L, Bauer TK, Sinning M. Analyzing the Labour Market Activity of Immigrant Families in Germany. *Labour Economics*. Vol. 2009; 16(5):510–520.
- Baker M, Benjamin D. The Role of the Family in Immigrants’ Labour Market Activity: An Evaluation of Alternative Explanations. *American Economic Review*. 1997; 87(4):705–27.
- Beach C, Worswick C. Is There a Double Negative Effect on the Earnings of Immigrant Women? *Canadian Public Policy*. 1993; 19(1):36–53.
- Beenstock MB, Chiswick, Ptiel A. Testing the Immigrant Assimilation Hypothesis with Longitudinal Data. *Review of Economics of the Household*. 2010; 8(1):7–27.
- Blau F, Kahn L, Moriarty J, Souza A. The Role of the Family in Immigrants’ Labour- Market Activity: An Evaluation of Alternative Explanations: Comment. *AER*. 2003; 93(1):429–447.
- Bleakley H, Chin A. Language Skills and Earnings: Evidence from Childhood Immigrants. *Review of Economics and Statistics*. 2004; 84(2):481–496.
- Bonikowska A, Hou F, Picott G. A Canada-US Comparison of Labour Market Outcomes among Highly Educated Immigrants. *Canadian Public Policy*. 2011; 37(1):25–48.
- Borjas G. Assimilation, Changes in Cohort Quality, and the Earnings of Immigrants. *Journal of Labour Economics*. 1985; 3(4):463–89.
- Borjas G. Assimilation, Changes in Cohort Quality Revisited and the Earnings of Immigrants. *Journal of Labour Economics*. 1995; 13(2):201–45.
- Borjas G. The Slowdown in the Economic Assimilation of Immigrants: Aging and Cohort Effects Revisited Again. NBER Working Papers 19116. 2013
- Bratsberg B, Raaum O. Identifying Earnings Assimilation of Immigrants under Changing Macroeconomic Conditions. *Scandinavian Journal of Economics*. 2004; 106(1):1–22.
- Chiswick BR. The Effect of Americanization on the Earnings of Foreign-Born Men. *Journal Political Economy*. 1978; 86(5):897–922.
- Chiswick B, Miller P. Occupational Language Requirements and the Value of English in the US Labour Market. *Journal of Population Economics*. 2010; 23(1):353–372.
- Clark K, Lindley J. Immigrant Assimilation pre and post Labour Market Entry: Evidence from the UK Labour Force Survey. *Journal of Population Economics*. 2009; 22(1):175–198.
- Cobb-Clark D, Crossley C. Revisiting the Family Investing Hypothesis. *Labour Economics*. 2004; 11(3):373–93.

- Cohen-Goldner S, Gotlibovski C, Kahana N. A Reevaluation of the Role of Family in Immigrants' Labour Market Activity: Evidence from a Comparison of Single and Married Immigrants. IZA Discussion Paper, 4185. 2009
- Duleep H, Dowhan D. Revisiting the Family Investment Model with Longitudinal Data: The Earnings Growth of Immigrant and US-born Women. IZA working paper # 568. 2002
- Duleep H, Regets M. Immigrants and human-capital investment. *American Economic Review*. 1999; 89(2):186–191.
- Duleep H, Sanders S. The Decision to Work by Married Immigrant Women. *Industrial and Labour Relations Review* 46. 1993:677–90.
- Dustmann C, van Soest A. Language and the Earnings of Immigrants. *Industrial and Labour Relations Review*. 2002; 55(3):473–492.
- Dustmann C, Fabbri F. Gender and Ethnicity: Married Immigrants in Britain. *Oxford Review of Economic Policy*. 2005; 21(3):462–84.
- Fernández R, Fogli A. Culture: An Empirical Investigation of Beliefs, Work, and Fertility. *American Economic Journal: Macroeconomics*. 2009; 1(1):146–177.
- Ferrer A, Picott G, Riddell C. New Directions in Immigration Policy: Canada's Evolving Approach to Immigration Selection. *International Migration Review*. 2014; 48(3):846–867.
- Ferrer AM, Riddell C. Education, Credentials and Immigrant Earnings. *Canadian Journal of Economics*. 2008; 4(1):186–216.
- Frank K, Hou F. Cultural Influences Across Time and Space: Do Source-country Gender Roles Affect Immigrant Women's Paid and Unpaid Labour Activity? Statistics Canada Analytical Studies Branch Research Paper Series #349. 2013
- Imai S, Stacey D, Warman C. From Engineer to Taxi Driver? Occupational Skills and the Economic Outcomes of Immigrants. Working Papers 1275, Queen's University. 2011
- Kim, S.; Varanasi, N. Working Papers UWEC-2010-01. University of Washington; 2010. Labour Supply of Married Women in Credit Constrained Households: Theory and Evidence.
- Lewis, P., editor. *Ethnologue: Languages of the World*. Sixteenth edition. SIL International; Dallas, Tex: 2009. Online version: <http://www.ethnologue.com/>
- Sweetman, Arthur; Warman, Casey. Temporary Foreign Workers and Former International Students as a Source of Permanent Immigration. CLSRN Working Papers 2009-34. 2009
- Warman C, Worswick C. Technological Change and Declining Immigrant Outcomes, Implications for Income Inequality in Canada. *CJE*. 2015; 48(2)
- Worswick C. Immigrant Families in the Canadian Labour Market. *CPP*. 1996; 22(4):378–96.
- Worswick C. Credit Constraints and the Labour Supply of Immigrant Families in Canada. *Canadian Journal of Economics*. 1999; 32(1):152–170.

Highlights

- Immigrant women to Canada do not fit the profile of secondary workers.
- Their labor market participation and wage increase with time in Canada.
- Ten years after migration they have not converged to natives' occupational status
- University-educated immigrant women exit strength-demanding jobs over time
- Education is key to assimilate into more quantitative occupations

Figure 1. Odds ratio of employment of university-educated immigrant women by type of job

Source: Author's calculations using Canadian census 1991-2006. Odds ratio is relative to university-educated native women with native-born husbands. For low-skill jobs, the dependent variable is an indicator equal to 1 if a woman works in a job requiring skills either at the bottom quartile of the analytical distribution or at the top quartile of the strength distribution. For high-skill jobs, the definition is the reverse.

Figure 2.
Wage assimilation of married immigrant women in immigrant couples relative to native-born women, by educational attainment of women.

(a).

(b).

39

Figure 3.

- (a). Analytical skill mobility of immigrant women relative to similar natives, by cohort and family type
- (b). Analytical skill mobility of University-educated immigrant women relative to similar natives, by cohort and family type.

(a).

(b).

Figure 4.

(a). Strength skill mobility of immigrant women relative to similar natives, by cohort and family type

(b). Strength skill mobility of University-educated immigrant women relative to similar natives, by cohort and family type.

Table 1

Sample Summary Statistics () Census 1991-2006. (Standard deviation)

		Immigrant				Canadian born			
		Immigrant husband		NB husband		Immigrant husband		NB husband	
Women Characteristics									
Age		36.3	(6.0)	36.1	(5.9)	35.1	(6.5)	34.6	(6.7)
Education	High S. or less	0.45	(0.41)	0.32	(0.30)	0.40	(0.40)	0.46	(0.42)
	Post-secondary (other)	0.22	(0.32)	0.30	(0.35)	0.31	(0.42)	0.34	(0.37)
	Bachelor	0.26	(0.44)	0.29	(0.45)	0.23	(0.42)	0.17	(0.38)
	Graduate	0.08	(0.27)	0.09	(0.28)	0.05	(0.22)	0.03	(0.16)
Labour Force Participation		0.70	(0.46)	0.75	(0.40)	0.82	(0.41)	0.81	(0.40)
Skills	Social	−0.09	(1.04)	0.30	(0.93)	0.38	(0.86)	0.24	(0.89)
	Motor	−0.12	(0.92)	−0.38	(0.92)	−0.46	(0.88)	−0.34	(0.91)
	Strength	−0.12	(0.94)	−0.32	(0.96)	−0.43	(0.90)	−0.30	(0.92)
	Quantitative	−0.12	(1.02)	0.12	(0.92)	0.18	(0.90)	0.06	(0.91)
	Visual	−0.28	(0.78)	−0.37	(0.74)	−0.42	(0.72)	−0.35	(0.79)
Linguistic proximity	Same Lg.	0.41	(0.50)	0.63	(0.48)	1.00	-	1.00	-
	4 th level	0.15	(0.36)	0.11	(0.31)	-	-	-	-
	3 rd /2 nd level	0.03	(0.15)	0.07	(0.25)	-	-	-	-
	1 st level	0.18	(0.39)	0.08	(0.26)	-	-	-	-
	None	0.23	(0.42)	0.10	(0.30)	-	-	-	-
Husband Characteristics									
Age		40.0	(7.9)	39.4	(8.0)	39.9	(8.80)	37.3	(7.80)
Education	High S. or less	0.38	(0.39)	0.33	(0.38)	0.37	(0.39)	0.45	(0.42)
	Post-secondary (other)	0.23	(0.38)	0.31	(0.36)	0.35	(0.38)	0.36	(0.37)
	Bachelor	0.26	(0.44)	0.25	(0.43)	0.20	(0.40)	0.15	(0.36)
	Graduate	0.13	(0.33)	0.11	(0.31)	0.08	(0.28)	0.04	(0.19)
Labour Force Participation		0.89	(0.35)	0.95	(0.25)	0.94	(0.30)	0.95	(0.30)
Observations		353,265		54,170		32,125		389,715	

* The sample is restricted to married (or in common law relations) women 18-45 years of age. Immigrants are adults (18 years or older) at arrival

Table 2

Odds ratio of the labour force participation of married immigrant women relative to similar natives (P-values)

Cohort	Years in Canada	All women		University-educated women	
		IMM husband	NB husband	IMM husband	NB husband
1986-90	5	0.606 (0.000)	0.506 (0.000)	0.421 (0.000)	0.401 (0.000)
	10	0.736 (0.000)	0.707 (0.000)	0.509 (0.000)	0.592 (0.000)
	15	0.891 (0.041)	0.791 (0.000)	0.684 (0.041)	0.798 (0.012)
1991-95	20	0.910 (0.002)	0.875 (0.021)	0.833 (0.002)	0.684 (0.021)
	5	0.346 (0.000)	0.464 (0.000)	0.240 (0.000)	0.345 (0.000)
	10	0.651 (0.000)	0.673 (0.000)	0.527 (0.000)	0.579 (0.000)
1996-00	15	0.737 (0.000)	0.755 (0.000)	0.721 (0.000)	0.708 (0.000)
	5	0.269 (0.000)	0.394 (0.000)	0.215 (0.000)	0.333 (0.000)
	10	0.508 (0.000)	0.566 (0.000)	0.506 (0.000)	0.560 (0.000)
2001-05	5	0.271 (0.000)	0.365 (0.000)	0.254 (0.000)	0.325 (0.000)
Observations		828,650		226,230	

Dependent variable is 1 if the respondent was employed or looking for a job, 0 otherwise. The sample is restricted to married (or common law) women 18-45 years of age. Immigrants are adults (18 years or older) at arrival. All specifications include arrival cohort-time effects for immigrants and their spouses - as in equation (1) - plus controls for woman's age and age squared, education, province and main Census Metropolitan Area, survey year, husband's wage, number of children before migration, number of children 0-5 in the household and number of children 6-14, age at first birth and indicators for linguistic proximity to English or French.

Table 3

Odds ratio of employment in Low-skill jobs of married immigrant women relative to natives (P-values)

Cohort	YSM	Low-Skill Jobs				Low-Skill Jobs (University-educated women)			
		Analytical (a)		Strength (b)		Analytical (a)		Strength (b)	
		IMM husband	NB husband	IMM husband	NB husband	IMM husband	NB husband	IMM husband	NB husband
1986-90	5	1.331 (0.000)	1.093 (0.113)	1.130 (0.000)	0.972 (0.569)	2.571 (0.000)	1.941 (0.000)	1.311 (0.000)	1.226 (0.028)
	10	1.332 (0.000)	1.246 (0.000)	1.234 (0.000)	1.052 (0.276)	2.268 (0.000)	1.693 (0.000)	1.392 (0.000)	1.363 (0.000)
	15	1.664 (0.000)	1.064 (0.271)	1.496 (0.000)	1.165 (0.002)	2.961 (0.000)	1.675 (0.000)	1.433 (0.000)	1.274 (0.009)
1991-95	20	1.817 (0.000)	1.174 (0.012)	1.722 (0.000)	1.133 (0.029)	3.283 (0.000)	1.683 (0.000)	1.645 (0.000)	1.020 (0.860)
	5	0.988 (0.567)	1.158 (0.003)	0.924 (0.000)	1.112 (0.010)	1.794 (0.000)	1.744 (0.000)	1.172 (0.000)	1.246 (0.003)
	10	1.621 (0.000)	1.249 (0.000)	1.381 (0.000)	1.230 (0.000)	3.496 (0.000)	2.401 (0.000)	1.624 (0.000)	1.310 (0.001)
1996-00	15	1.806 (0.000)	1.204 (0.001)	1.588 (0.000)	1.112 (0.031)	3.691 (0.000)	2.264 (0.000)	1.706 (0.000)	1.249 (0.006)
	5	1.227 (0.000)	1.049 (0.359)	0.850 (0.000)	0.907 (0.046)	2.599 (0.000)	2.512 (0.000)	1.018 (0.633)	1.183 (0.032)
	10	1.537 (0.000)	1.037 (0.536)	1.179 (0.000)	0.982 (0.719)	3.247 (0.000)	2.140 (0.000)	1.364 (0.000)	1.041 (0.606)
2001-05	5	1.495 (0.000)	1.131 (0.008)	0.963 (0.000)	0.912 (0.031)	3.573 (0.000)	2.385 (0.000)	1.233 (0.000)	1.024 (0.710)
Observations		828,650		828,650		226,230		226,230	

Dependent variable is 1 if the respondent was working in a low-skill job, 0 otherwise. The sample is restricted to married (or common law) women 18-45 years of age. Immigrants are adults (18 years or older) at arrival. All specifications include same regressors as specified in Table 2.

(a) Indicates employment in a job requiring low levels of analytical skills- at the bottom 25% of the analytical skill distribution; (b) Indicates employment in a job requiring high levels of strength skills - at the top 25% of the strength skill distribution.

Table 4

Weekly wages of immigrant women with immigrant partners (P-values) (relative to native-born women with NB partners)

Cohort	YSM	All		Heckman	Non-university	University
		(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)
1986-90	5	−0.220 (0.000)	−0.164 (0.000)	−0.109 (0.000)	−0.100 (0.000)	−0.303 (0.000)
	10	−0.152 (0.000)	−0.101 (0.000)	−0.062 (0.000)	−0.054 (0.000)	−0.226 (0.000)
	15	−0.075 (0.000)	−0.010 (0.363)	−0.020 (0.041)	0.035 (0.009)	−0.132 (0.000)
	20	−0.069 (0.000)	0.004 (0.701)	−0.013 (0.229)	0.037 (0.009)	−0.065 (0.001)
1991-95	5	−0.384 (0.000)	−0.309 (0.000)	−0.231 (0.000)	−0.200 (0.000)	−0.484 (0.000)
	10	−0.215 (0.000)	−0.136 (0.000)	−0.081 (0.000)	−0.097 (0.000)	−0.199 (0.000)
	15	−0.140 (0.000)	−0.059 (0.000)	−0.056 (0.000)	0.002 (0.844)	−0.151 (0.000)
1996-00	5	−0.428 (0.000)	−0.590 (0.000)	−0.218 (0.000)	−0.197 (0.000)	−0.412 (0.000)
	10	−0.282 (0.000)	−0.347 (0.000)	−0.168 (0.000)	−0.088 (0.000)	−0.264 (0.000)
2001-05	5	−0.543 (0.000)	−0.214 (0.000)	−0.346 (0.000)	−0.226 (0.000)	−0.468 (0.000)
Social			0.086 (0.000)	0.066 (0.000)	0.074 (0.000)	0.117 (0.000)
Motor			0.152 (0.000)	0.116 (0.000)	0.188 (0.000)	0.042 (0.000)
Visual			−0.080 (0.000)	−0.044 (0.000)	−0.083 (0.000)	−0.021 (0.000)
Strength			−0.128 (0.000)	−0.098 (0.000)	−0.171 (0.000)	−0.019 (0.002)
Quantitative			0.119 (0.000)	0.116 (0.000)	0.105 (0.000)	0.162 (0.000)
Observations		583,220	562,695	562,695	400,810	161,885

The sample is restricted to married (common law) women 18–45 years of age. Immigrants are adults (18 years or older) at arrival. All specifications include same regressors as specified in Table 2. Model (3) estimates a 2-step selection model where the first stage estimates participation as a function of the female/male ratio of labour force participation in the country of origin at the time the woman was 18 years old, and the number of children in the household (coefficients shown in appendix). Models (4) and (5) repeat specification (2) for the subsamples of university- and non-university educated women, respectively.

Table 5

Wage and analytical skill assimilation of immigrant men in immigrant couples (by wife's labour force participation) relative to similar natives.

			Wages		Analytical skill	
			All	If wife participates	All	If wife participates
Cohort	YSM					
1986-90	5		-0.386 (0.000)	-0.395 (0.000)	-0.306 (0.000)	-0.323 (0.000)
	10		-0.304 (0.000)	-0.301 (0.000)	-0.124 (0.000)	-0.140 (0.000)
	15		-0.245 (0.000)	-0.247 (0.000)	-0.183 (0.000)	-0.183 (0.000)
	20		-0.197 (0.000)	-0.182 (0.000)	-0.306 (0.000)	-0.332 (0.000)
1991-95	5		-0.556 (0.000)	-0.569 (0.000)	-0.136 (0.000)	-0.183 (0.000)
	10		-0.354 (0.000)	-0.355 (0.000)	-0.226 (0.000)	-0.226 (0.000)
	15		-0.294 (0.000)	-0.279 (0.000)	-0.317 (0.000)	-0.328 (0.000)
1996-00	5		-0.487 (0.000)	-0.493 (0.000)	-0.140 (0.000)	-0.186 (0.000)
	10		-0.333 (0.000)	-0.326 (0.000)	-0.324 (0.000)	-0.317 (0.000)
2001-05	5		-0.609 (0.000)	-0.595 (0.000)	-0.532 (0.000)	-0.529 (0.000)
Observations			677,805	530,340	677,805	530,340

The sample comprises the husbands and common law partners of the females in the sample.

All specifications include arrival cohort-time effects for immigrants and their spouses - as in equation (1) - plus controls for male experience and experience squared education, group area of origin, province and main Census Metropolitan Area, and survey year.

(***) indicates the coefficient is significant at 1%, (**) at 5%; (*) at 10%.