Published in final edited form as:

Immunogenetics. 2015 October ; 67(10): 547–561. doi:10.1007/s00251-015-0864-z.

Single nucleotide polymorphisms/haplotypes associated with multiple rubella-specific immune response outcomes post-MMR immunization in healthy children

Inna G. Ovsyannikova^a, Hannah M. Salk^a, Beth R. Larrabee^b, V. Shane Pankratz^b, and Gregory A. Poland^{a,*}

^aMayo Clinic Vaccine Research Group, Mayo Clinic, Rochester, MN 55905, USA

^bDepartment of Health Sciences Research, Mayo Clinic, Rochester, MN 55905, USA

Abstract

Background—The observed heterogeneity in rubella-specific immune response phenotypes post-MMR vaccination is thought to be explained, in part, by inter-individual genetic variation.

Methods—In this study, single nucleotide polymorphisms (SNPs) and multiple haplotypes in several candidate genes were analyzed for associations with *more than one* rubella-specific immune response outcome, including secreted IFN- γ , secreted IL-6, and neutralizing antibody titers.

Results—Overall, we identified 23 SNPs in 10 different genes that were significantly associated with at least two rubella-specific immune responses. Of these SNPs, we detected eight in the *PVRL3* gene, five in the *PVRL1* gene, one in the *TRIM22* gene, two in the *IL10RB* gene, two in the *TLR4* gene, and five in other genes (*PVR*, *ADAR*, *ZFP57*, *MX1*, and *BTN2A1/BTN3A3*). The *PVRL3* gene haplotype GACGGGGCAGCAAAAAGAAGAGGAAAGAACAA was significantly associated with both higher IFN- γ secretion (t-statistic: 4.43, $p < 0.0001$) and higher neutralizing antibody titers (t-statistic: 3.14, $p = 0.002$).

Conclusions—Our results suggest that there is evidence of multigenic associations among identified gene SNPs, and that polymorphisms in these candidate genes contribute to the overall observed differences between individuals in response to live rubella virus vaccine. These results will aid our understanding of mechanisms behind rubella-specific immune response to MMR vaccine and influence the development of vaccines in the future.

*Address all correspondence to: Gregory A. Poland, M.D., Director, Mayo Clinic Vaccine Research Group, Mayo Clinic, Guggenheim 611C, 200 1st Street S.W., Rochester, Minnesota 55905, Phone: (507) 284-4968; Fax: (507) 266-4716; poland.gregory@mayo.edu.

Presented in part: The 18th Annual Conference on Vaccine Research, Bethesda, MD, April 13–15, 2015 (Abstract S1).

Conflict of interest

Dr. Poland is the chair of a Safety Evaluation Committee for novel non-rubella investigational vaccine trials being conducted by Merck Research Laboratories. Dr. Poland offers consultative advice on vaccine development to Merck & Co. Inc., CSL Biotherapies, Avianax, Sanofi Pasteur, Dynavax, Novartis Vaccines and Therapeutics, PAXVAX Inc, Emergent Biosolutions, Adjuvance, and Vaxess. Drs. Poland and Ovsyannikova hold two patents related to measles and vaccinia peptide research. These activities have been reviewed by the Mayo Clinic Conflict of Interest Review Board and are conducted in compliance with Mayo Clinic Conflict of Interest policies. This research has been reviewed by the Mayo Clinic Conflict of Interest Review Board and was conducted in compliance with Mayo Clinic Conflict of Interest policies.

Keywords

Rubella vaccine; single nucleotide polymorphisms (SNPs); genetic association; neutralizing antibodies; cytokines

MeSH Keywords

Rubella; Rubella Vaccine; Rubella virus; Measles-Mumps-Rubella Vaccine; Polymorphism; Single Nucleotide; Genetic Association Studies; Antibodies; Neutralizing; Cytokines

1. Introduction

The morbidity associated with rubella virus (RV) infection remains of great concern. Although typical childhood or adulthood infection can be benign (signified by rash, fever, lymphadenopathy, and malaise) (2011), rubella infection is particularly dangerous in pregnant women, resulting in congenital defects of the fetus (Plotkin 2001) or, in severe cases, perinatal death (Sydnor and Perl 2014). The most effective way to prevent rubella infection and reduce the morbidity associated with congenital rubella syndrome is maternal immunization with the measles-mumps-rubella (MMR) virus vaccine, which has successfully reduced rubella infection by > 99% since its introduction in 1971 in the U.S. (Lievano et al. 2012).

While many individuals develop protective immunity against rubella after MMR vaccination (~ 95%) (2011), others remain susceptible to infection for several reasons, including waning rubella-specific immune memory and primary vaccine non-response to RV (Sydnor and Perl 2014), both of which are influenced by genetic factors. Our previous study aimed to identify genetic influences on response to rubella vaccine (Ovsyannikova et al. 2007; Ovsyannikova et al. 2009a; Ovsyannikova et al. 2014a). Twenty-seven genes, including genes in the HLA-A and HLA-B loci, were found to differ between low and high antibody responders after stimulation with RV (Haralambieva et al. 2013), suggesting that genetics play a large role in one's ability to develop protective immunity against rubella after immunization. In this study, we identified several single-nucleotide polymorphisms (SNPs)/haplotypes in candidate immune response genes that are significantly associated with multiple rubella vaccine-induced immune response outcomes after MMR immunization.

To our knowledge, this study is the first study of its kind to identify polymorphisms in several candidate genes that are significantly associated with *more than one* rubella-specific immune response (i.e., secreted IFN- γ , IL-6, and neutralizing antibody titers) post-MMR vaccination. Developing an understanding of the function of genetic variability on immune response to rubella immunization is critical for designing more effective vaccines in the future.

2. Materials and Methods

The methods described in this study are similar to those published for our previous studies (Haralambieva et al. 2014; Haralambieva et al. 2011a; Lambert et al. 2013; Lambert et al. 2014; Ovsyannikova et al. 2011a; Ovsyannikova et al. 2011b).

2.1 Study Subjects and Immunization

Subjects from a previously described cohort were utilized for this study (Haralambieva et al. 2010; Ovsyannikova et al. 2010a; Ovsyannikova et al. 2011b; Ovsyannikova et al. 2004; Ovsyannikova et al. 2005). The study cohort comprised a combined sample of 1,052 subjects from three independent cohorts of healthy children in Rochester, MN. Specifically, 368 healthy children, ranging in age from 12 to 18 years, were recruited from Rochester, MN, between the years 2001–2002. In 2006–2007, we enrolled an additional 396 healthy children (age 11–19 years) as part of our original MMR vaccine studies. In 2008–2009, additional subjects, ranging in age from 11 to 22 years, were added to this cohort, resulting in a cohort of 1,052 subjects. Prior to participation in these studies, subjects provided documentation of receiving two doses of rubella-containing vaccine. After excluding subjects without genotyping data, 1,039 subjects remained for analysis. Each subject provided a written record of receiving two age-appropriate doses of MMR vaccine. Permission to conduct this study was granted by the institutional review board of Mayo Clinic.

2.2 Antibody Measurement

Rubella-specific neutralizing antibody (NA) titers were quantified for each subject using a method that has been previously published (Lambert et al. 2014). In brief, a modified soluble immunocolorimetric (ICA)-based neutralization assay (sICNA) was optimized for high-throughput measurement and analysis. Measurements were reported as the highest dilution at which there was a 50% reduction in viral activity (NT₅₀).

2.3 Secreted Cytokine Measurement

Secreted rubella-specific IFN- γ and IL-6 were measured by conducting enzyme-linked immunosorbent assays (ELISAs). The complete protocol for this methodology has been previously published (Dhiman et al. 2010; Lambert et al. 2013; Ovsyannikova et al. 2009b). To summarize, cryopreserved peripheral blood mononuclear cells (PBMCs) from each subject were cultured, in triplicate (2×10^5 cells per well in 96-well plates), with either media (control wells) or the W-Therien strain of RV (MOI=5). PHA (5 μ g/ml) was used as a positive control. Cell cultures were incubated based upon previous optimization results: 48 h for maximal IFN- γ secretion, 24 h for maximal IL-6 secretion. ELISAs were performed using the manufacturer's recommendations (BD Pharmingen), and plates were read at 450 nm on a microplate reader (Molecular Devices Corporation, Sunnyvale, CA).

2.4 Candidate gene SNP genotyping

The description of the tagging SNP selection strategies and genotyping methods has been previously described (Haralambieva et al. 2014; Haralambieva et al. 2011a; Ovsyannikova et al. 2011a; Ovsyannikova et al. 2011b). SNPs within candidate genes, 5 kb upstream and

downstream for each candidate gene, were chosen based on the linkage disequilibrium (LD) tagSNP selection algorithm (Yen et al. 2006) from the Hapmap Phase II (<http://www.hapmap.org>), Seattle SNPs (<http://pga.mbt.washington.edu/>), and NIEHS SNPs (<http://egp.gs.washington.edu/>), with SNP minor allele frequencies ≥ 0.05 , LD threshold of $r^2 \geq 0.90$. Overall, 768 SNPs in 92 candidate genes were analyzed as part of this study (Haralambieva et al. 2014; Pankratz et al. 2010). The 768 SNPs were genotyped using a custom-designed 768-plex Illumina GoldenGate™ assay (Illumina Inc., San Diego, CA) following the manufacturer's instructions. The BeadStudio 2 software was used to call genotypes.

2.5 Statistical Analysis

Our goal was to determine whether there were genetic variants that shared associations with multiple immune response phenotypes for rubella. We have reported many of these associations previously, and the analytical methods used to assess the associations are outlined in those publications (Haralambieva et al. 2011a; Ovsyannikova et al. 2010b; Ovsyannikova et al. 2012; Ovsyannikova et al. 2011b). Briefly, to assess the additive genetic association with the logarithmic transformation of neutralizing antibody NT₅₀ titer, simple linear regression models were employed. All other phenotypes had multiple observations per subject and were evaluated with repeated measures approaches, including an unstructured within-person variance-covariance matrix to account for within-subject correlations. A test of the ordinal genotype by stimulation status interaction assessed the effect of genotype on the average difference between stimulated and unstimulated PBMC samples. Our primary tests of association for each of these phenotypes were adjusted for a number of potentially important covariates, including age at enrollment, ages at first and second vaccinations, sex, time between most recent vaccination and study participation, batch/run number of assay and the first 3 population stratification eigenvectors. The q-values were then computed. The p-values from these primary tests of association were compared on a SNP-by-SNP basis to identify polymorphisms significant ($p < 0.05$) for more than one phenotype. Six-hundred and five SNPs were used in these comparisons. Summaries of the measures of virus-specific immune responses were obtained for these SNPs, broken by allelic category, as noted in our previously published work (Haralambieva et al. 2011a; Ovsyannikova et al. 2010a; Ovsyannikova et al. 2010b; Ovsyannikova et al. 2011b).

Further exploration of these data then commenced via pos-hoc haplotype estimation and analysis. In the absence of pedigree data and known linkage phase, there may be multiple possible haplotypes for an observed genotype. To address this complication, the expectation-maximum (EM) algorithm, as per Schaid *et al.* (Schaid et al. 2002), was used to establish the conditional posterior probabilities of a given haplotype with an observed genotype. From these probabilities, a design matrix of expected haplotype counts was constructed and used to investigate associations with phenotype. The above techniques were applied utilizing the Haplo.Stats package with the default settings for batch size, maximum number of iterations and convergence criteria. Haplotypes with less than a 1% frequency were eliminated to help reduce the error associated with estimation.

3. Results

3.1 Demographics

In total, 1,039 subjects participated in this study. The median age at the time of enrollment was 15.1 years with a range of 11–22 years. Slightly over half (55.2%) of the cohort consisted of male subjects while the remaining 44.8% were female. Caucasian-Americans accounted for 85.0% of the cohort, and 8.1% of subjects identified as either Black or African-American. Quantification of NA titers, IL-6 secretion, and IFN- γ secretion within the cohort yielded median values of 57.4 (range 17.0–2391.2), 3595.7 ng/ μ l (range –957.3–5831.8 ng/ μ l), and 6.1 ng/ μ l (range –239.0–579.4 ng/ μ l), respectively. See Table 1 for a summary of subject demographics.

3.2 Associations between SNPs and Immune Measures

Since the study subjects were racially diverse, genotype-phenotype data were analyzed for a combined cohort of 1,039 subjects (Table 2), and, in addition, separately for 883 Caucasian subjects (Supplementary Table 1)

PVRL3 (Nectin-3) Gene Associations—Overall, we identified 23 SNPs in 10 genes that were significantly associated with more than one rubella-specific immune phenotype post-MMR vaccination, including eight SNPs in the PVRL3 gene. Of these eight SNPs, five were significantly associated with rubella-specific IL-6 and IFN- γ secretion: rs4682233 ($p < 0.0007$), rs72935984 ($p < 0.004$), rs72937914 ($p < 0.04$), rs10433385 ($p < 0.01$), and rs78545860 ($p < 0.01$). Interestingly, the major alleles of these SNPs were all associated with an increase in IL-6 secretion, and enhanced IFN- γ secretion was observed in four of the five. The remaining three SNPs identified in the PVRL3 gene (rs75054607, rs76464851, and rs78157313) were significantly associated with IFN- γ secretion and NA titers ($p < 0.002$, $p < 0.002$, $p < 0.002$, respectively). Though relatively rare (only one homozygous minor allele GG genotype was observed), increasing copies of the minor alleles in all three of these SNPs resulted in a greater than 80-fold increase in IFN- γ secretion from baseline and a greater than three-fold increase in NA titers from baseline (Table 2). These associations remained statistically significant when excluding the homozygous minor allele genotype observed only in one subject (IFN- γ , $p = 0.004$; NT₅₀, $p = 0.0007$).

Several of the SNPs in the *PVRL3* gene are in high linkage disequilibrium (LD) and are likely to be inherited together. SNPs in high LD ($r^2 \geq 0.92$) include rs72935984 and rs4682233; rs75054607, rs78157313 and rs76464851; rs10433385 and rs78545860 (Figure 1).

PVRL1 (Nectin-1) Gene Associations—Five SNPs in the PVRL1 gene were also found to be significantly associated with multiple rubella-specific immune response outcomes. The homozygous major alleles of the rs11820364 ($p < 0.008$; one homozygous minor allele genotype was observed) and rs61247604 ($p < 0.0005$; no homozygous minor allele genotype was found) SNPs were associated with a decrease in both IL-6 secretion and NA titers. Both associations remained significant when excluding the homozygous minor allele genotype from analysis (rs11820364, IL-6, $p = 0.002$; NT₅₀, $p = 0.02$; rs61247604, IL-6,

$p=0.0003$; NT_{50} , $p=0.0005$). An increase in the count of major alleles of the rs73571285 ($p<0.02$) and rs73571287 ($p<0.02$) SNPs were associated with an increase in IL-6 secretion and a decrease in secreted IFN- γ ; however, rs73571285 demonstrated no association with neither IL-6 nor IFN- γ secretion, and rs73571287 displayed no association with IFN- γ secretion when excluding the homozygous minor allele genotypes from statistical analysis (data not shown). The three remaining SNPs in the PVRL1 gene (rs79849521, $p<0.03$; rs4936489, $p<0.03$; and rs73578845, $p<0.04$) were significantly associated with both IL-6 secretion and NA titers. Likewise, when examining associations without the homozygous minor genotypes that have few (0–2) subjects in that category, IL-6 association with the PVRL1 rs73578845 becomes more significant ($p<0.0001$) but the NA titer association becomes less significant ($p=0.104$). Decreasing the count of the major alleles of the rs79849521 resulted in an increase from baseline in IL-6 secretion, as well as an increase in NA titers. Conversely, the major allele of rs4936489 tended to correlate with enhanced IL-6 ($p=0.04$) secretion and decreased NA titers ($p=0.03$). These associations remained statistically significant when excluding the homozygous minor allele genotype observed only in one individual (IL-6, $p=0.009$; NT_{50} , $p=0.04$) (Table 2).

Several intronic SNPs in the *PVRL1* gene have a moderate likelihood of being inherited together. SNPs with an LD of $r^2 \geq 0.33$ include: rs11820364 with rs79849521 and rs61247604, rs79849521 with rs61247604, and rs73571285 with rs73571287 (Figure 2).

TRIM22 (Tripartite Motif Containing 22) Gene Associations—One coding SNP in the TRIM22 gene, rs2291842 ($p<0.01$), was significantly associated with all three rubella-specific immune response outcomes in this study (IFN- γ , IL-6, and NA titers). For this SNP, increasing numbers of the minor allele were associated with an increase in NA titers (1.1-fold) and IFN- γ secretion (2.0-fold); however, the major allele seemed to correlate with enhanced secretion of IL-6 (1.1-fold) (Table 2).

Other Gene Associations—We identified nine other associations between multiple rubella-specific immune phenotypes and SNPs from the following genes: IL10RB (interleukin 10 receptor beta; 2 SNPs); TLR4 (toll-like receptor 4; 2 SNPs); PVR (poliovirus receptor; 1 SNP); ADAR (adenosine deaminase; 1 non-synonymous SNP); ZFP57 (zinc finger protein 57; 1 SNP); MX1 (MX dynamin-like GTPase 1; 1 SNP); and BTN2A1/BTN3A3 (butyrophilin, subfamily 2/3, member A1/3; 1 SNP). The two SNPs in the TLR4 gene (rs5030728, $p<0.04$; and rs2770150, $p<0.02$) are both significantly associated with both IL-6 secretion and IFN- γ secretion. The major alleles in both SNPs are associated with increased secretion of IL-6; however, subjects with minor alleles of these SNPs tended to secrete increased levels of IFN- γ (Table 2).

Associations between PVRL1 and PVRL3 Haplotypes and Rubella Immune Response Outcomes—The Haploview output for the *PVRL3* and *PVRL1* gene SNPs that were genotyped and were significant in the study is shown in Figures 1 and 2. Among the seven *PVRL1* haplotypes with frequencies $\geq 1\%$ in the study cohort, the global statistical tests revealed a significant association (global $p=0.017$) between lower IFN- γ secretion and the *PVRL1* haplotype GAAGCGGCGGCGGAGGGAGGGGGCCGGAGCAGCGCAGGGGTCCGGG (t-

statistic: -2.49 , $p=0.01$) (Table 3). This specific *PVRL1* haplotype was not associated with rubella-specific IL-6 secretion or NA titers. In addition, we identified six haplotypes (with frequencies $\sim 1\%$) in the *PVRL3* gene in our study cohort (Table 3). The global tests demonstrated highly significant associations between IFN- γ secretion (global $p=0.0001$) and NA titers (global $p=0.037$) and the *PVRL3* haplotype. Specifically, the *PVRL3* haplotype GACGGGGGCAGCAAAAAGAAGAGGAAAGAACAA was significantly associated with both higher IFN- γ production (t-statistic: 4.43 , $p<0.0001$) and higher NA titers (t-statistic: 3.14 , $p=0.0018$). *PVRL1* and *PVRL3* gene haplotype associations with rubella-specific immune response outcomes in the Caucasian cohort are shown in Supplementary Table 2.

Discussion

Previous studies have identified a broad collection of SNPs/haplotypes identified from HLA and non-HLA genes significantly associated with humoral and cellular immune responses to rubella vaccine (Haralambieva et al. 2010; Haralambieva et al. 2014; Ovsyannikova et al. 2010a; Ovsyannikova et al. 2010b; Ovsyannikova et al. 2004; Ovsyannikova et al. 2005; Ovsyannikova et al. 2009b; Pankratz et al. 2010). The purpose of this exploratory study was to identify SNPs in several candidate genes that were significantly associated with more than one rubella-specific immune response post-MMR vaccination. To our knowledge, this is the first study that has identified genes associated with multiple immune response outcomes. Because the identified genotypes are significantly associated with more than one RV-specific outcome, it may be suggested that they have a greater impact on overall immune response to vaccination (Ovsyannikova et al. 2014b). Overall, we identified 23 SNPs in 10 genes that were associated with at least two rubella-specific immune response outcomes, including secreted IL-6, secreted IFN- γ , or neutralizing antibody titers, suggesting joint effects of various genes/genetic variants in the control of the vaccine-induced immune response.

Our statistical analysis results demonstrated evidence for the role of multiple SNPs (some in LD) in the poliovirus receptor (*PVR*), poliovirus receptor-related 1 (*PVRL1*), and poliovirus receptor-related 3 (*PVRL3*) genes for being immunologically relevant to the development of both antibody and cytokine immune responses to rubella vaccine. Little is known about the role of genetic variants within these genes in the genetic control of immune response to rubella vaccination; however, It has been demonstrated that the *PVR* (CD155) gene encodes a transmembrane glycoprotein that belongs to the immunoglobulin (Ig) superfamily and serves as a cellular entry receptor for poliovirus that mediates cell-cell adhesion and cell migration (He et al. 2000). While evidence for *PVR*'s contribution to RV vaccine-induced immunity is not strong, CD155/*PVR* was demonstrated to play a role in regulation of Th2 phenotype polarization, NK (natural killer) cell activation, secretion of lytic granules and IFN- γ , and modulation of antigen-specific IgG antibodies in response to TLR agonists (Fuchs et al. 2004; Kamran et al. 2013).

We detected eight SNPs in the *PVRL3* (Nectin-3, CD113) gene that were significantly associated with more than one rubella-specific immune response post-MMR vaccination. The effects of these SNPs were also detected at the haplotype level, where haplotype analysis showed a significant association between the *PVRL3*

GACGGGGGCAGCAAAAAGAAGAGGAAAGAACAA haplotype and both higher rubella-specific NA titers and IFN- γ production. This increases our confidence that the PVRL3 gene locus/allelic variants play a role in the development of RV-induced humoral and cellular immune response. The Nectin family is considered a member of the immunoglobulin super family due to structural similarities (Takai et al. 2008). Nectin-3 has been shown to play a critical role in the control of junctions between endothelial cells, which is important for the transmigration of immune cells during infection (Devilard et al. 2013). Once expressed on the surface of T lymphocytes, Nectin-3 binds to Nectin-2 expressed on endothelial cells. Results from previous studies suggest that this trans-interaction induces the opening of endothelial cell junctions and is required for efficient and effective extravasation of lymphocytes from the blood to sites of infection (Devilard et al. 2013).

Additionally, we identified several SNPs in the *PVRL1* (Nectin-1, CD111) gene that were significantly associated with multiple rubella-specific immune response phenotypes. As another member of the Nectin family, Nectin-1 has been shown to influence viral infection. A study conducted by Geraghty *et al.* identified Nectin-1 (referred to as HveC) as the primary receptor allowing for initial mucosal infection of herpes simplex virus 1 (HSV-1) and HSV-2 and subsequent entry into epithelial and neuronal cells (Geraghty et al. 1998; Satoh-Horikawa et al. 2000). It is unknown how the *PVRL1* gene and Nectin gene family relate specifically to immune response to RV although speculations can be made.

Based on the functional role of Nectins in lymphocyte transmigration, HSV infection (Geraghty et al. 1998; Satoh-Horikawa et al. 2000), and measles virus infection (Muhlebach et al. 2011), it might be speculated that they also play a role in the propagation and/or elimination of RV. Since RV replicates in mucosal cells of the nasopharynx, lymphocyte transmigration is essential for terminating viral replication. Therefore, polymorphisms in the Nectin-3 gene could significantly impact the ability to evade rubella infection. Likewise, Nectin-1 has been shown to mediate cellular infection of HSV and pseudorabies virus (PRV) as well suggesting that a polymorphism in the Nectin-1 gene may enhance or decrease one's susceptibility to rubella viral infection via downstream effects in viral receptor-mediated entry into host cells and control following immune response. Future studies should, therefore, be aimed at determining if such a relationship between Nectin genes and live RV vaccine exists.

In addition, we identified a coding SNP, rs2291842, in the *TRIM22* gene coding region that was significantly associated with all three immune response outcomes. TRIM22 is a member of the tripartite motif family, which is involved in a various array of cellular processes, including differentiation, regulation, and apoptosis (Reymond et al. 2001). For example, rs2291841 in the TRIM22 gene was previously associated with a higher IFN- γ ELISPOT response to measles virus vaccine, while TRIM22 rs885002 was associated with a diminished IL-10 and TNF- α measles virus-specific response (Ovsyannikova et al. 2013). Previous studies also identify TRIM22 as a key regulator of signaling pathways in the innate immune system, especially the antiviral response (McNab et al. 2011). These studies also suggest that IFN- γ induces *TRIM22* expression; this leads to an increase in the transcription factor nuclear factor- κ B, which has been shown to stimulate pro-inflammatory cytokine secretion, including IL-6 secretion (Yu et al. 2011). The minor allele variant (GG) of the

coding rs2291842 identified in this study was associated with an increase from baseline in both rubella-specific IFN- γ secretion and rubella-specific NA titers. Conversely, the major allele variant (AA) of this SNP was associated with secreted IL-6. We speculate that this coding polymorphism may affect TRIM22 protein structure and hence antiviral function and IFN- γ , IL-6 and antibody production by NK/T cells, T cells/macrophages and B cells, respectively. Our earlier studies on live RV vaccine identified associations between SNPs in the *TRIM22* gene and rubella-specific IFN- γ , IL-2, and IL-6 secretion levels (Ovsyannikova et al. 2010a), as well as humoral immunity after rubella vaccination (Ovsyannikova et al. 2010b). Therefore, a polymorphism in the *TRIM22* gene may impact the response to live RV vaccine due to its significance in innate antiviral immune response.

Two SNPs in the *IL10RB* gene, rs962859 and rs2284552, were found to be significantly associated with both rubella-specific IFN- γ and IL-6 secretion. Expression of IL10RB is essential for signal transduction induced by IL-10. The interaction between IL10RB, IL10RA, and IL-10 has been shown to impede the secretion of many cytokines, including IL-6 (Dokter et al. 1996). Interestingly, in this study, the major allele variant of the rs962859 SNP and the minor allele variant of the rs2284552 SNP were associated with a significant increase in secreted IL-6 levels, suggesting that polymorphisms in this gene alter this sensitive IL-10 pathway.

Finally, we identified two SNPs in the *TLR4* gene that were significantly associated with rubella-specific IL-6 and IFN- γ secretion. Toll-like receptor protein 4 is encoded by the *TLR4* gene, and it is important for pathogen recognition and activation of innate immune response pathways (Kopp and Medzhitov 1999). The major allele variants of the rs5030728 and rs2770150 SNPs of the *TLR4* gene were found to be significantly associated with increases in rubella-specific IL-6 secretion; however, they were also associated with decreases in rubella-specific IFN- γ secretion. Cytokines IL-6 and IFN- γ are known to have functionally distinct roles and regulate many biological processes, including antiviral immune response. However, data suggest that IL-6 and IFN- γ induce overlapping sets of genes and both signal through a common regulatory JAK/STAT signaling pathway (Qi et al. 2013; Yuan et al. 1994). The role of TLR4 in the immune response to viral pathogens (i.e., viral envelope glycoprotein) has been widely studied (Barton 2007; Ovsyannikova et al. 2011b; Puthothu et al. 2006; Zhou et al. 2011), and our results support the importance of this gene in the immune response to live RV vaccine. We also identified one SNP in each of the following genes that were significantly associated with more than one rubella-specific immune response post-MMR vaccination: *PVR*, *ZFP57*, *BTN2A1/BTN3A3* and IFN- γ -induced antiviral *MX1* and *ADAR*. For example, a non-synonymous rs2229857 (Lys384/Arg) in the antiviral RNA-specific *ADAR* gene, known to be involved in RNA editing and gene regulation, demonstrated an allele dose-related increase in IL-6 and IFN- γ secretion with the representation of a minor allele. Consistent with the current results, our earlier vaccine study with measles demonstrated an association between *ADAR* SNP rs2229857 and measles virus-specific IFN- γ ELISPOT responses (Haralambieva et al. 2011b). We speculate that this genetic variant is likely to be involved in regulation of virus-induced cellular immune mechanisms. This study is strengthened by several factors. The recruitment and utilization of a relatively large sample population (1,039 subjects, 85% Caucasian) with

documented vaccine coverage and no circulating wild-type RV enhances our confidence that the immune outcomes measured reflected rubella immunization alone and not disease. Additionally, the relatively small range of age at time of enrollment limits additional factors, such as immunosenescence and waning immune response. The chief limitation of this study is the sole use of candidate genes for statistical analysis and the possibility of detecting potential false-positive associations. This study could be improved upon by having a more genetically diverse population, and future studies will explore whether these associations are observed in other genetically distinct populations. The associations we report herein cannot be generalized to other ethnic groups not examined in this study. We observed very small or no representation of a minor allelic variant for some SNPs in the *PVRL1*, *PVRL3*, *PVR* and other candidate genes that may have skewed the IL-6, IFN- γ and NA immune responses. Multiple statistical tests were completed for this rubella vaccine study; thus, it is possible that a number of false-positive associations with immune response outcomes have been found. It is important to note that after controlling for multiple testing via q-value, some of the SNP-specific tests failed to remain significant at the $p < 0.1$ level. These SNPs have been noted in Table 2. These associations require confirmation in a separate cohort to understand their functional significance. Future replication studies are necessary to validate all of these results.

In conclusion, this is the first study that analyzed and identified SNPs/haplotypes significantly associated with more than one rubella-specific immune response post-MMR vaccination. Our results provided additional insights into multigenic and haplotypic associations between candidate gene SNPs and rubella vaccine-specific NA titers and cytokine production. The results from this study suggest that polymorphisms in these genes contribute to the overall heterogeneity in rubella-specific immune response phenotypes in individuals after being immunized with the MMR vaccine. In the future, these results could aid the prediction of immune response phenotypes in patients pre-vaccination, as well as influence the design of better vaccines through generation of new knowledge and the identification of targets and biomarkers for vaccine response (Poland et al. 2011a; Poland et al. 2009; Poland et al. 2011b).

Supplementary Material

Refer to Web version on PubMed Central for supplementary material.

Acknowledgements

We thank the Mayo Clinic Vaccine Research Group staff and subjects who participated in our studies. We thank Caroline L. Vitse for her editorial assistance with this manuscript. We thank Nathaniel D. Warner for his assistance with this study. Research reported in this publication was supported by the National Institute of Allergy And Infectious Diseases of the National Institutes of Health under award numbers R37AI48793 (which recently received a MERIT Award) and R01AI33144. The content is solely the responsibility of the authors and does not necessarily represent the official views of the National Institutes of Health

References

Immunization of health-care personnel: recommendations of the Advisory Committee on Immunization Practices (ACIP). *MMWR Recomm. Rep.* 2011; 60:1–45.

- Barton GM. Viral recognition by Toll-like receptors. *Seminars in Immunology*. 2007; 19:33–40. [PubMed: 17336545]
- Devilard E, Xerri L, Dubreuil P, Lopez M, Reymond N. Nectin-3 (CD113) interacts with Nectin-2 (CD112) to promote lymphocyte transendothelial migration. *PLoS ONE*. 2013; 8:e77424. [PubMed: 24116228]
- Dhiman N, Haralambieva IH, Vierkant RA, Pankratz VS, Ryan E, Jacobson RM, Ovsyannikova IG, Poland GA. Predominant inflammatory cytokine secretion pattern in response to two doses of live rubella vaccine in health vaccinees. *Cytokine*. 2010; 50:24–29. [PubMed: 20117947]
- Dokter WH, Koopmans SB, Vellenga E. Effects of IL-10 and IL-4 on LPS-induced transcription factors (AP-1, NF-IL6 and NF-kappa B) which are involved in IL-6 regulation. *Leukemia*. 1996; 10:1308–1316. [PubMed: 8709636]
- Fuchs A, Cella M, Giurisato E, Shaw AS, Colonna M. Cutting edge: CD96 (tactile) promotes NK cell-target cell adhesion by interacting with the poliovirus receptor (CD155). *Journal of Immunology*. 2004; 172:3994–3998.
- Geraghty RJ, Krummenacher C, Cohen GH, Eisenberg RJ, Spear PG. Entry of alphaherpesviruses mediated by poliovirus receptor-related protein 1 and poliovirus receptor. *Science*. 1998; 280:1618–1620. [PubMed: 9616127]
- Haralambieva IH, Dhiman N, Ovsyannikova IG, Vierkant RA, Pankratz VS, Jacobson RM, Poland GA. 2'-5'-Oligoadenylate synthetase single-nucleotide polymorphisms and haplotypes are associated with variations in immune responses to rubella vaccine. *Hum.Immunol*. 2010; 71:383–391. [PubMed: 20079393]
- Haralambieva IH, Lambert ND, Ovsyannikova IG, Kennedy RB, Larrabee BR, Pankrantz VS, Poland GA. Associations between single nucleotide polymorphisms in cellular viral receptors and attachment factor-related genes and humoral immunity to rubella vaccination. *PLoS ONE*. 2014; 9:e99997. [PubMed: 24945853]
- Haralambieva IH, Oberg AL, Ovsyannikova IG, Kennedy RB, Grill DE, Middha S, Bot BM, Wang VW, Smith DI, Jacobson RM, Poland GA. Genome-wide characterization of transcriptional patterns in high and low antibody responders to rubella vaccination. *PLoS ONE*. 2013; 8:e62149. [PubMed: 23658707]
- Haralambieva IH, Ovsyannikova IG, Kennedy RB, Vierkant RA, Pankratz SV, Jacobson RM, Poland GA. Associations between single nucleotide polymorphisms and haplotypes in cytokine and cytokine receptor genes and immunity to measles vaccination. *Vaccine*. 2011a; 29:7883–7895. [PubMed: 21875636]
- Haralambieva IH, Ovsyannikova IG, Umlauf BJ, Vierkant RA, Pankratz SV, Jacobson RM, Poland GA. Genetic polymorphisms in host antiviral genes: associations with humoral and cellular immunity to measles vaccine. *Vaccine*. 2011b; 29:8988–8997. [PubMed: 21939710]
- He Y, Bowman VD, Mueller S, Bator CM, Bella J, Peng X, Baker TS, Wimmer E, Kuhn RJ, Rossmann MG. Interaction of the poliovirus receptor with poliovirus. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America*. 2000; 97:79–84. [PubMed: 10618374]
- Kamran N, Takai Y, Miyoshi J, Biswas SK, Wong JS, Gasser S. Toll-like receptor ligands induce expression of the costimulatory molecule CD155 on antigen-presenting cells. *PLoS ONE*. 2013; 8:e54406. [PubMed: 23349877]
- Kopp EB, Medzhitov R. The Toll-receptor family and control of innate immunity. *Current Opinion in Immunology*. 1999; 11:13–18. [PubMed: 10047546]
- Lambert ND, Haralambieva IH, Ovsyannikova IG, Larrabee BR, Pankratz VS, Poland GA. Characterization of humoral and cellular immunity to rubella vaccine in four distinct cohorts. *Immunologic Research*. 2013; 58:1–8. [PubMed: 24375276]
- Lambert ND, Pankratz VS, Larrabee BR, Ogee-Nwankwo A, Chen MH, Icenogle JP, Poland GA. High-throughput Assay Optimization and Statistical Interpolation of Rubella-Specific Neutralizing Antibody Titers. *Clinical and Vaccine Immunology*. 2014; 21:340–346. [PubMed: 24391140]
- Lievano F, Galea SA, Thornton M, Wiedmann RT, Manoff SB, Tran TN, Amin MA, Seminack MM, Vagie KA, Dana A, Plotkin SA. Measles, mumps, and rubella virus vaccine (M-M-RII): a review of 32 years of clinical and postmarketing experience. *Vaccine*. 2012; 30:6918–6926. [PubMed: 22959986]

- McNab FW, Rajsbaum R, Stoye JP, O'Garra A. Tripartite-motif proteins and innate immune regulation. *Current Opinion in Immunology*. 2011; 23:46–56. [PubMed: 21131187]
- Muhlebach MD, Mateo M, Sinn PL, Prufer S, Uhlig KM, Leonard VH, Navaratnarajah CK, Frenke M, Wong XX, Sawatsky B, Ramachandran S, McCray PB Jr, Cichutek K, von MV, Lopez M, Cattaneo R. Adherens junction protein nectin-4 is the epithelial receptor for measles virus. *Nature*. 2011; 480:530–533. [PubMed: 22048310]
- Ovsyannikova IG, Dhiman N, Haralambieva IH, Vierkant RA, O'Byrne MM, Jacobson RM, Poland GA. Rubella vaccine-induced cellular immunity: evidence of associations with polymorphisms in the Toll-like, vitamin A and D receptors, and innate immune response genes. *Human Genetics*. 2010a; 127:207–221. [PubMed: 19902255]
- Ovsyannikova IG, Haralambieva IH, Dhiman N, O'Byrne MM, Pankratz VS, Jacobson RM, Poland GA. Polymorphisms in the vitamin A receptor and innate immunity genes influence the antibody response to rubella vaccination. *J Infect Dis*. 2010b; 201:207–213. [PubMed: 20001730]
- Ovsyannikova IG, Haralambieva IH, Vierkant RA, O'Byrne MM, Jacobson RM, Poland GA. The association of CD46, SLAMF8, and CD209 cellular receptor gene SNPs with variations in measles vaccine-induced immune responses--a replication study and examination of novel polymorphisms. *Human Heredity*. 2011a; 72:206–223. [PubMed: 22086389]
- Ovsyannikova IG, Haralambieva IH, Vierkant RA, O'Byrne MM, Jacobson RM, Poland GA. Effects of vitamin A and D receptor gene polymorphisms/haplotypes on immune responses to measles vaccine. *Pharmacogenetics and Genomics*. 2012; 22:20–31. [PubMed: 22082653]
- Ovsyannikova IG, Haralambieva IH, Vierkant RA, O'Byrne MM, Poland GA. Associations between polymorphisms in the antiviral TRIM genes and measles vaccine immunity. *Human Immunology*. 2013; 74:768–774. [PubMed: 23416095]
- Ovsyannikova IG, Haralambieva IH, Vierkant RA, Pankratz VS, Poland GA. The role of polymorphisms in toll-like receptors and their associated intracellular signaling genes in measles vaccine immunity. *Human Genetics*. 2011b; 130:547–561. [PubMed: 21424379]
- Ovsyannikova IG, Jacobson RM, Ryan JE, Dhiman N, Vierkant RA, Poland GA. Relationship between HLA polymorphisms and gamma interferon and interleukin-10 cytokine production in healthy individuals after rubella vaccination. *Clin Vaccine Immunol*. 2007; 14:115–122. [PubMed: 17215337]
- Ovsyannikova IG, Jacobson RM, Vierkant RA, Jacobsen SJ, Pankratz VS, Poland GA. The contribution of HLA class I antigens in immune status following two doses of rubella vaccination. *Human Immunology*. 2004; 65:1506–1515. [PubMed: 15603879]
- Ovsyannikova IG, Jacobson RM, Vierkant RA, Jacobsen SJ, Pankratz VS, Poland GA. Human leukocyte antigen class II alleles and rubella-specific humoral and cell-mediated immunity following measles-mumps-rubella-II vaccination. *Journal of Infectious Diseases*. 2005; 191:515–519. [PubMed: 15655774]
- Ovsyannikova IG, Jacobson RM, Vierkant RA, O'Byrne MM, Poland GA. Replication of rubella vaccine population genetic studies: validation of HLA genotype and humoral response associations. *Vaccine*. 2009a; 27:6926–6931. [PubMed: 19761839]
- Ovsyannikova IG, Pankratz VS, Larrabee BR, Jacobson RM, Poland GA. HLA genotypes and rubella vaccine immune response: additional evidence. *Vaccine*. 2014a; 32:4206–4213. [PubMed: 24837503]
- Ovsyannikova IG, Ryan JE, Vierkant RA, O'Byrne MM, Jacobson RM, Poland GA. Influence of host genetic variation on rubella-specific T cell cytokine responses following rubella vaccination. *Vaccine*. 2009b; 27:3359–3366. [PubMed: 19200845]
- Ovsyannikova IG, Salk HM, Larrabee BR, Pankratz VS, Poland GA. Single-nucleotide polymorphism associations in common with immune responses to measles and rubella vaccines. *Immunogenetics*. 2014b; 66:663–669. [PubMed: 25139337]
- Pankratz VS, Vierkant RA, O'Byrne MM, Ovsyannikova IG, Poland GA. Associations between SNPs in candidate immune-relevant genes and rubella antibody levels: a multigenic assessment. *BMC Immunol*. 2010; 11:48. [PubMed: 20923569]
- Plotkin SA. Rubella eradication. *Vaccine*. 2001; 19:3311–3319. [PubMed: 11348695]

- Poland GA, Kennedy RB, Ovsyannikova IG. Vaccinomics and personalized vaccinology: Is science leading us toward a new path of directed vaccine development and discovery? *PLoS Pathogens*. 2011a; 7:e1002344. [PubMed: 22241978]
- Poland GA, Ovsyannikova IG, Jacobson RM. Application of pharmacogenomics to vaccines. *Pharmacogenomics*. 2009; 10:837–852. [PubMed: 19450131]
- Poland GA, Ovsyannikova IG, Kennedy RB, Haralambieva IH, Jacobson RM. Vaccinomics and a new paradigm for the development of preventive vaccines against viral infections. *Omics*. 2011b; 15:625–636. [PubMed: 21732819]
- Puthothu B, Forster J, Heinzmann A, Krueger M. TLR-4 and CD14 polymorphisms in respiratory syncytial virus associated disease. *Dis Markers*. 2006; 22:303–308. [PubMed: 17264400]
- Qi YF, Huang YX, Wang HY, Zhang Y, Bao YL, Sun LG, Wu Y, Yu CL, Song ZB, Zheng LH, Sun Y, Wang GN, Li YX. Elucidating the crosstalk mechanism between IFN-gamma and IL-6 via mathematical modelling. *BMC Bioinformatics*. 2013; 14:41. [PubMed: 23384097]
- Reymond A, Meroni G, Fantozzi A, Merla G, Cairo S, Luzi L, Riganelli D, Zanaria E, Messali S, Cainarca S, Guffanti A, Minucci S, Pelicci PG, Ballabio A. The tripartite motif family identifies cell compartments. *The EMBO journal*. 2001; 20:2140–2151. [PubMed: 11331580]
- Satoh-Horikawa K, Nakanishi H, Takahashi K, Miyahara M, Nishimura M, Tachibana K, Mizoguchi A, Takai Y. Nectin-3, a new member of immunoglobulin-like cell adhesion molecules that shows homophilic and heterophilic cell-cell adhesion activities. *The Journal of Biological Chemistry*. 2000; 275:10291–10299. [PubMed: 10744716]
- Schaid DJ, Rowland CM, Tines DE, Jacobson RM, Poland GA. Score tests for association between traits and haplotypes when linkage phase is ambiguous. *American Journal of Human Genetics*. 2002; 70:425–434. [PubMed: 11791212]
- Sydnor E, Perl TM. Healthcare providers as sources of vaccine-preventable diseases. *Vaccine*. 2014; 32:4814–4822. [PubMed: 24726251]
- Takai Y, Miyoshi J, Ikeda W, Ogita H. Nectins and nectin-like molecules: roles in contact inhibition of cell movement and proliferation. *Nature reviews. Molecular cell biology*. 2008; 9:603–615. [PubMed: 18648374]
- Yen D, Cheung J, Scheerens H, Poulet F, McClanahan T, McKenzie B, Kleinschek MA, Owyang A, Mattson J, Blumenschein W, Murphy E, Sathe M, Cua DJ, Kastelein RA, Rennick D. IL-23 is essential for T cell-mediated colitis and promotes inflammation via IL-17 and IL-6. *The Journal of clinical investigation*. 2006; 116:1310–1316. [PubMed: 16670770]
- Yu S, Gao B, Duan Z, Xu W, Xiong S. Identification of tripartite motif-containing 22 (TRIM22) as a novel NF-kappaB activator. *Biochemical and Biophysical Research Communications*. 2011; 410:247–251. [PubMed: 21651891]
- Yuan J, Wegenka UM, Luttkien C, Buschmann J, Decker T, Schindler C, Heinrich PC, Horn F. The signalling pathways of interleukin-6 and gamma interferon converge by the activation of different transcription factors which bind to common responsive DNA elements. *Molecular and cellular biology*. 1994; 14:1657–1668. [PubMed: 7509445]
- Zhou L, Wei B, Xing C, Xie H, Yu X, Wu L, Zheng S. Polymorphism in 3'-untranslated region of toll-like receptor 4 gene is associated with protection from hepatitis B virus recurrence after liver transplantation. *Transplant infectious disease : an official journal of the Transplantation Society*. 2011; 13:250–258. [PubMed: 20977567]

Figure 1.

Haplotype block structure of the PVRL3 genetic variants, analyzed using Haploview software, version 4.2 (all SNPs presented were genotyped and utilized in the construction of haplotypes). The r^2 color scheme is: white ($r^2=0$), shades of grey ($0 < r^2 < 1$), black ($r^2=1$). The numbers report the r^2 value multiplied by 100.

Figure 2.

Haplotype block structure of the PVRL1 genetic variants, analyzed using Haploview software, version 4.2 (all SNPs presented were genotyped and utilized in the construction of haplotypes). The r^2 color scheme is: white ($r^2=0$), shades of grey ($0<r^2<1$), black ($r^2=1$). The numbers report the r^2 value multiplied by 100. Blocks are missing when the minor allele frequency for at least one SNP is 0.

Table 1

Subject demographics and immune outcomes summary.

Subject Demographics and Immune Outcomes Summary		
	Total (N=1,039)	P Value
Age		<0.0001
N	1039	
Mean (SD)	15.1 (2.2)	
Median	15.0	
Q1, Q3	13.0, 17.0	
Range	(11.0–22.0)	
Age at First Vaccination (Months)		0.0002
N	1039	
Mean (SD)	20.1 (20.9)	
Median	15.0	
Q1, Q3	15.0, 16.0	
Range	(11.0–185.0)	
Age at Second Vaccination (Years)		<0.0001
N	1039	
Mean (SD)	8.4 (3.5)	
Median	9.0	
Q1, Q3	5.0, 12.0	
Range	(1.0–17.0)	
Time from Second Vaccination to Enrollment (Years)		<0.0001
N	1039	
Mean (SD)	6.7 (2.9)	
Median	6.4	
Q1, Q3	4.6, 8.6	
Range	(0.4–16.8)	
Gender		0.6255
Male	574 (55.2%)	
Female	465 (44.8%)	
Race		<0.0001
American Indian, Alaska Native	4 (0.4%)	
Asian, Hawaiian, Pacific Islander	27 (2.6%)	
Black or African American	84 (8.1%)	
Caucasian-American	883 (85.0%)	
Multiple	28 (2.7%)	
Other	7 (0.7%)	
Unknown	6 (0.6%)	

Subject Demographics and Immune Outcomes Summary		
	Total (N=1,039)	P Value
Ethnicity		0.0089
Not Hispanic or Latino	1012 (97.4%)	
Hispanic or Latino	20 (1.9%)	
Don't Know	7 (0.7%)	
Neutralizing Antibody (NT₅₀)		0.0034
N	1029	
Mean (SD)	81.6 (123.5)	
Median	57.4	
Q1, Q3	34.9, 95.5	
Range	(17.0–2391.2)	
IL-6 (ng/μl)		<0.0001
N	988	
Mean (SD)	3435.4 (908.0)	
Median	3595.7	
Q1, Q3	3027.1, 4005.1	
Range	(–957.3–5831.8)	
IFN-γ (ng/μl)		<0.0001
N	969	
Mean (SD)	24.4 (70.0)	
Median	6.1	
Q1, Q3	1.5, 20.0	
Range	(–239.0–579.4)	

Abbreviations: IL-interleukin; IFN-interferon; SD-standard deviation; Q1-first quartile; Q3-third quartile; NT₅₀-neutralizing titer

Negative cytokine values indicate that the unstimulated secretion levels were, on average, higher than the rubella virus-stimulated secretion levels.

Table 2

SNPs associated with more than one rubella-specific immune response outcome after MMR vaccination.

Cohort	SNP ID	Chromosome / Position	Gene	Location	Immune Measure	N	Genotype	No.	Immune Response Outcome (IQR)	P Value	Immune Measure	N	Genotype	No.	Immune Response Outcome (IQR)	P Value
Rubella Vaccine Study	rs4682233	3/1.11×10 ⁸	PVRL3	Intron	Secreted IL-6 (ng/μl)	969	AA AG GG	953 16 0	3609.7 (3049.2, 4006.3) 3372.2 (1952.7, 4094.1)	0.000675	Secreted IFN-γ (ng/μl)	969	AA AG GG	953 16 0	6.2 (1.5, 20.2) 3.7 (−5.8, 10.7)	0.000498
Rubella Vaccine Study	rs72935984	3/1.11×10 ⁸	PVRL3	Intron	Secreted IL-6 (ng/μl)	962	CC CA AA	944 18 0	3609.8 (3048.0, 4007.3) 3608.4 (2134.9, 4123.8)	0.001363	Secreted IFN-γ (ng/μl)	962	CC CA AA	944 18 0	6.2 (1.5, 20.0) 5.4 (−0.4, 27.3)	0.0004264
Rubella Vaccine Study	rs75054607 +NA	3/1.11×10 ⁸	PVRL3	Intron	Secreted IFN-γ (ng/μl)	969	AA AG GG	946 22 1	6.1 (1.5, 19.7) 11.6 (3.9, 33.6) 508.8 (508.8, 508.8)	0.0000028	NA (NT ₅₀)	1029	AA AG GG	1004 23 2	56.6 (34.6, 93.9) 112.5 (65.5, 159.4) 192.1 (31.2, 353.0)	0.001575
Rubella Vaccine Study	rs76464851 +NA	3/1.11×10 ⁸	PVRL3	Intron	Secreted IFN-γ (ng/μl)	969	AA AG GG	946 22 1	6.1 (1.5, 19.7) 11.6 (3.9, 33.6) 508.8 (508.8, 508.8)	0.0000028	NA (NT ₅₀)	1029	AA AG GG	1004 23 2	56.6 (34.6, 93.9) 112.5 (65.5, 159.4) 192.1 (31.2, 353.0)	0.001575
Rubella Vaccine Study	rs78157313 +NA	3/1.11×10 ⁸	PVRL3	Intron	Secreted IFN-γ (ng/μl)	967	AA AG GG	944 22 1	6.1 (1.5, 19.8) 11.6 (3.9, 33.6) 508.8 (508.8, 508.8)	0.0000029	NA (NT ₅₀)	1027	AA AG GG	1002 23 2	56.6 (34.6, 93.8) 112.5 (65.5, 159.4) 192.1 (31.2, 353.0)	0.001575
Rubella Vaccine Study	rs72937914 +IFN-γ	3/1.11 ×10 ⁸	PVRL3	Intron	Secreted IL-6 (ng/μl)	969	AA AC CC	942 27 0	3612.3 (3056.4, 4008.4) 2917.9 (2076.4, 4064.3)	0.000386	Secreted IFN-γ (ng/μl)	969	AA AC CC	942 27 0	6.1 (1.5, 19.9) 6.1 (−0.4, 27.3)	0.040073
Rubella Vaccine Study	rs10433385 +IFN-γ	3/1.11 ×10 ⁸	PVRL3	Intergenic	Secreted IL-6 (ng/μl)	968	AA AG GG	929 36 3	3613.2 (3056.4, 4020.6) 3398.5 (2754.5, 3870.5) 2717.6 (2617.3, 4306.3)	0.008086	Secreted IFN-γ (ng/μl)	968	AA AG GG	929 36 3	6.3 (1.6, 20.8) 3.5 (0.1, 7.7) 3.4 (2.6, 16.6)	0.012882
Rubella Vaccine Study	rs78545860 +IFN-γ	3/1.11×10 ⁸	PVRL3	Intergenic	Secreted IL-6 (ng/μl)	969	AA AG GG	930 36 3	3614.0 (3056.4, 4020.6) 3398.5 (2754.5, 3870.5) 2717.6 (2617.3, 4306.3)	0.008063	Secreted IFN-γ (ng/μl)	969	AA AG GG	930 36 3	6.3 (1.6, 20.8) 3.5 (0.1, 7.7) 3.4 (2.6, 16.6)	0.012874
Rubella Vaccine Study	rs11820364 +NA	11/1.2×10 ⁸	PVRL1	Intron	Secreted IL-6 (ng/μl)	969	GG GA AA	953 15 1	3595.6 (3036.5, 4000.4) 4328.9 (3759.0, 4494.6) 2271.6 (2271.6, 2271.6)	0.000102	NA (NT ₅₀)	1029	GG GA AA	1010 18 1	57.4 (34.9, 95.3) 67.3 (32.5, 126.5) 75.8 (75.8, 75.8)	0.00822
Rubella Vaccine Study	rs61247604	11/1.2×10 ⁸	PVRL1	Intron	Secreted IL-6 (ng/μl)	968	GG GA AA	956 12 0	3596.0 (3037.7, 4003.1) 4178.1 (3605.9, 4384.3)	0.000332	NA (NT ₅₀)	1028	GG GA AA	1015 13 0	57.4 (34.8, 95.8) 63.1 (36.2, 74.5)	0.000477
Rubella Vaccine Study	rs73571285* +IFN-γ	11/1.2×10 ⁸	PVRL1	Intron	Secreted IL-6 (ng/μl)	969	AA AG GG	953 14 2	3600.2 (3049.7, 4003.7) 4011.0 (2630.3, 4439.8) −450.2 (−957.3, 56.9)	0.000144	Secreted IFN-γ (ng/μl)	969	AA AG GG	953 14 2	6.2 (1.5, 20.0) 4.8 (−0.9, 62.3) −51.9 (−60.5, −43.3)	0.022627
Rubella Vaccine Study	rs73571287* +IFN-γ	11/1.2×10 ⁸	PVRL1	Intron	Secreted IL-6 (ng/μl)	968	GG GA AA	959 8 1	3598.9 (3043.4, 4003.9) 4011.0 (1079.8, 4310.4) 56.9 (56.9, 56.9)	9×10 ^{−7}	Secreted IFN-γ (ng/μl)	968	GG GA AA	959 8 1	6.2 (1.5, 20.2) 3.7 (−1.1, 38.4) −43.3 (−43.3, −43.3)	0.02229

Author Manuscript

Author Manuscript

Author Manuscript

Author Manuscript

Cohort	SNP ID	Chromosome / Position	Gene	Location	Immune Measure	N	Genotype	No.	Immune Response Outcome (IQR)	P Value	Immune Measure	N	Genotype	No.	Immune Response Outcome (IQR)	P Value
Rubella Vaccine Study	rs79849521 ++	11/1.2×10 ⁸	PVRL1	Intron	Secreted IL-6 (ng/μl)	969	GG GA AA	959 10 0	3598.9 (3036.5, 4003.9) 4099.9 (3356.6, 4328.9)	0.026416	NA (NT ₅₀)	1029	GG GA AA	1018 11 0	57.4 (34.9, 95.7) 63.1 (33.4, 75.8)	0.004395
Rubella Vaccine Study	rs4936489 ++	11/1.2×10 ⁸	PVRL1	Intergenic	Secreted IL-6 (ng/μl)	968	GG GA AA	936 31 1	3605.0 (3041.1, 4005.1) 3514.8 (2803.7, 4126.2) 3696.9 (3696.9, 3696.9)	0.042337	NA (NT ₅₀)	1028	GG GA AA	992 35 1	57.4 (34.7, 95.2) 65.5 (41.0, 101.3) 77.3 (77.3, 77.3)	0.03046
Rubella Vaccine Study	rs73578845+ NA	11/1.19×10 ⁸	PVRL1	Intergenic	Secreted IL-6 (ng/μl)	969	GG GC CC	956 11 2	3596.0 (3041.1, 4003.1) 4078.1 (2299.1, 4439.8) 4099.9 (3970.0, 4229.9)	0.000315	NA (NT ₅₀)	1029	GG GC CC	1015 12 2	57.4 (34.6, 95.4) 62.5 (52.7, 112.3) 116.5 (74.5, 158.6)	0.037341
Rubella Vaccine Study	rs2291842 +NA	11/5719667	TRIM2 2	Coding	Secreted IFN-γ (ng/μl)	969	AA AG GG	639 285 45	5.9 (1.5, 19.9) 6.1 (1.9, 18.0) 11.5 (2.7, 42.5)	0.014516	NA (NT ₅₀)	1029	AA AG GG	683 299 47	56.6 (34.6, 95.7) 58.9 (35.1, 94.8) 61.0 (34.9, 97.4)	0.029181
Rubella Vaccine Study	rs2291842 +NA	11/5719667	TRIM2 2	Coding	Secreted IL-6 (ng/μl)	969	AA AG GG	639 285 45	3619.8 (3056.4, 4002.4) 3595.8 (3024.7, 4038.5) 3350.8 (3025.7, 3868.0)	0.002321	NA (NT ₅₀)	1029	AA AG GG	683 299 47	56.6 (34.6, 95.7) 58.9 (35.1, 94.8) 61.0 (34.9, 97.4)	0.029181
Rubella Vaccine Study	rs2291842 +IFN-γ	11/5719667	TRIM2 2	Coding	Secreted IL-6 (ng/μl)	969	AA AG GG	639 285 45	3619.8 (3056.4, 4002.4) 3595.8 (3024.7, 4038.5) 3350.8 (3025.7, 3868.0)	0.002321	Secreted IFN-γ (ng/μl)	969	AA AG GG	639 285 45	5.9 (1.5, 19.9) 6.1 (1.3, 18.0) 11.5 (2.7, 42.5)	0.014516
Rubella Vaccine Study	rs962859~ +IFN-γ	21/34648123	IL10RB	Intron	Secreted IL-6 (ng/μl)	954	AA AC CC	323 483 148	3660.3 (3064.3, 4061.3) 3569.1 (3023.7, 4000.9) 3533.8 (3066.0, 3900.4)	0.008451	Secreted IFN-γ (ng/μl)	954	AA AC CC	323 483 148	6.9 (1.8, 22.8) 4.9 (1.2, 18.2) 7.5 (2.5, 21.4)	0.027823
Rubella Vaccine Study	rs2284552~ +IFN-γ	21/34644082	IL10RB	Intron	Secreted IL-6 (ng/μl)	968	CC CA AA	600 321 47	3535.6 (2995.2, 3975.5) 3668.8 (3160.0, 4044.1) 3666.1 (3064.3, 4150.4)	7.89×10 ⁻⁵	Secreted IFN-γ (ng/μl)	968	CC CA AA	600 321 47	5.9 (1.2, 19.2) 6.2 (1.9, 21.7) 7.9 (1.6, 30.7)	0.018961
Rubella Vaccine Study	rs5030728 ++	9/1.2×10 ⁸	TLR4	Intron	Secreted IL-6 (ng/μl)	965	GG GA AA	489 398 78	3619.4 (3066.3, 4016.0) 3597.3 (3015.3, 3984.0) 3569.5 (2943.2, 4033.6)	0.018059	Secreted IFN-γ (ng/μl)	965	GG GA AA	489 398 78	5.5 (0.8, 19.7) 6.4 (1.9, 20.0) 6.5 (1.4, 25.2)	0.037292
Rubella Vaccine Study	rs2770150 +IFN-γ	9/1.2×10 ⁸	TLR4	Intergenic	Secreted IL-6 (ng/μl)	968	AA AG GG	516 389 63	3615.4 (3064.5, 4005.1) 3600.2 (3018.3, 4008.4) 3542.9 (2943.2, 4085.3)	0.01256	Secreted IFN-γ (ng/μl)	968	AA AG GG	516 389 63	5.9 (1.1, 20.0) 6.3 (1.7, 19.2) 6.6 (1.1, 27.5)	0.017476
Rubella Vaccine Study	seq- rs112723153 +IFN-γ	19/45178636	PVR	Intron	Secreted IL-6 (ng/μl)	969	GG GA AA	961 8 0	3609.8 (3049.2, 4008.4) 2936.2 (2438.8, 3855.6)	0.011401	Secreted IFN-γ (ng/μl)	969	GG GA AA	961 8 0	6.1 (1.5, 20.0) 10.4 (0.3, 34.5)	0.041896
Rubella Vaccine Study	rs2229857~ +IFN-γ	1/1.55 ×10 ⁸	ADAR	Coding	Secreted IL-6 (ng/μl)	968	GG GA AA	505 374 89	3595.6 (3058.5, 4006.3) 3594.7 (3036.5, 4033.3) 3732.8 (3023.6, 3969.3)	0.000435	Secreted IFN-γ (ng/μl)	968	GG GA AA	505 374 89	6.0 (1.4, 20.0) 5.9 (1.5, 19.2) 8.4 (2.3, 22.1)	0.01358
Rubella Vaccine Study	rs3870968 +IFN-γ	6/29647149	ZFP57	Intron	Secreted IL-6 (ng/μl)	969	CC CA AA	866 102 1	3619.6 (3038.9, 4024.9) 3523.0 (3032.0, 3900.6) 3643.5 (3643.5, 3643.5)	0.006571	Secreted IFN-γ (ng/μl)	969	CC CA AA	866 102 1	5.9 (1.3, 19.2) 9.0 (3.2, 38.2) 16.1 (16.1, 16.1)	0.018177
Rubella Vaccine Study	rs469483~ +IFN-γ	21/42818515	MX1	Intron	Secreted IL-6 (ng/μl)	969	AA AG GG	308 485 176	3528.1 (2975.4, 3968.9) 3641.8 (3064.3, 4080.6) 3598.0 (3096.5, 3975.8)	0.002902	Secreted IFN-γ (ng/μl)	969	AA AG GG	308 485 176	5.0 (0.9, 18.5) 6.6 (1.8, 21.8) 6.4 (1.6, 19.5)	0.019999

Cohort	SNP ID	Chromosome / Position	Gene	Location	Immune Measure	N	Genotype	No.	Immune Response Outcome (IQR)	P Value	Immune Measure	N	Genotype	No.	Immune Response Outcome (IQR)	P Value
Rubella Vaccine Study	rs2393657 ++	6/26457688	BTN2A1/BTN3A3	Intergenic	Secreted IL-6 (ng/μl)	961	CC CA AA	854 107 0	3619.9 (3064.3, 4023.2) 3398.9 (2750.9, 3832.4)	0.031523	Secreted IFN-γ (ng/μl)	961	CC CA AA	854 107 0	6.2 (1.6, 20.8) 6.1 (0.4, 15.2)	0.034371

Abbreviations: NA-neutralizing antibody; SNP ID-single nucleotide polymorphism identification; IL-interleukin; IFN-interferon; IQR-interquartile range; NT50-neutralizing titer; A-Adenine; C-Cytosine; G-Guanine; No.-number

Negative values indicate that the unstimulated secretion levels were higher than the rubella virus-stimulated secretion levels.

* Loss of significant association when homozygous minor allele genotype (observed only in few subjects) was excluded from analysis

+One phenotype failed to remain significantly associated with genotype as determined by having a q-value greater than 0.1.

++Two phenotypes failed to remain significantly associated with genotype as determined by having a q-value greater than 0.1.

~IL-6 remained significantly associated with genotype as determined by having a q-value greater than 0.1 in the Caucasian subset.

Table 3

PVRL1 and PVRL3 gene haplotype associations with rubella-specific immune response outcomes in the study cohort.

PVRL1 (Nectin-1) Gene Allele ^a	Immune Outcome	Frequency	Test Statistic	Allele P Value	Global P Value
					0.0174
GAGGCACGGCAGAGAGGAGAGGGGCCCGGAGCGGCGCAGGGGTCCGGG	IFN- γ	0.0377	0.7327	0.4640	
GAGGAGAGCAGCGGGGGGGGAGGCCGGAGCGGCGCAGGGGTCCGGG	IFN- γ	0.3452	-0.8671	0.3861	
GAGGAGAGCAGCAGGAGGGGGGAGGCCCGGAGCGGCGCAGGGGTCCGGG	IFN- γ	0.0168	-0.4096	0.6822	
GAAGCGCGGCGGAGAGGAGGGGGCCCGGAGCGGCGCAGGGGTCCGGG	IFN- γ	0.2571	-1.6004	0.1099	
GAAGCGCGGCGGAGAGGAGGGGGCCCGGAGCGGCGCAGGGGTCCGGG	IFN- γ	0.0682	0.3797	0.7042	
GAAGCGCGGCGGAGAGGAGGGGGCCCGGAGCAGCGCAGGGGTCCGGG	IFN-γ	0.0662	-2.4912	0.0129	
GAAGCACGGCAGAGAGGAGAGGGGGAAGGGAAGGAGCAAGGGTCCGGG	IFN- γ	0.0498	1.3947	0.1635	
					0.2050
GAGGCACGGCAGAGAGGAGAGGGGGCCCGGAGCGGCGCAGGGGTCCGGG	IL-6	0.0377	1.6917	0.0911	
GAGGAGAGCAGCGGGGGGGGAGGCCGGAGCGGCGCAGGGGTCCGGG	IL-6	0.3452	1.3917	0.1643	
GAGGAGAGCAGCAGGAGGGGGGAGGCCCGGAGCGGCGCAGGGGTCCGGG	IL-6	0.0168	1.7540	0.0798	
GAAGCGCGGCGGAGAGGAGGGGGCCCGGAGCGGCGCAGGGGTCCGGG	IL-6	0.2571	1.1243	0.2612	
GAAGCGCGGCGGAGAGGAGGGGGCCCGGAGCGGCGCAGGGGTCCGGG	IL-6	0.0682	1.2159	0.2243	
GAAGCGCGGCGGAGAGGAGGGGGCCCGGAGCAGCGCAGGGGTCCGGG	IL-6	0.0662	-0.8107	0.4178	
GAAGCACGGCAGAGAGGAGAGGGGGAAGGGAAGGAGCAAGGGTCCGGG	IL-6	0.0498	-0.0479	0.9618	
					0.9084
GAGGCACGGCAGAGAGGAGAGGGGGCCCGGAGCGGCGCAGGGGTCCGGG	NA	0.0377	0.4669	0.6407	
GAGGAGAGCAGCGGGGGGGGAGGCCGGAGCGGCGCAGGGGTCCGGG	NA	0.3452	0.2172	0.8281	
GAGGAGAGCAGCAGGAGGGGGGAGGCCCGGAGCGGCGCAGGGGTCCGGG	NA	0.0168	-0.2991	0.7649	
GAAGCGCGGCGGAGAGGAGGGGGCCCGGAGCGGCGCAGGGGTCCGGG	NA	0.2571	0.8906	0.3734	
GAAGCGCGGCGGAGAGGAGGGGGCCCGGAGCGGCGCAGGGGTCCGGG	NA	0.0682	1.0419	0.2977	
GAAGCGCGGCGGAGAGGAGGGGGCCCGGAGCAGCGCAGGGGTCCGGG	NA	0.0662	0.7988	0.4246	
GAAGCACGGCAGAGAGGAGAGGGGGAAGGGAAGGAGCAAGGGTCCGGG	NA	0.0498	0.7432	0.4575	
PVRL3 (Nectin-3) Gene Allele^b					0.0001

PVRL1 (Nectin-1) Gene Allele ^a	Immune Outcome	Frequency	Test Statistic	Allele P Value	Global P Value
CACGGGAGAAAGCAGCACAAAAACGGAAAAACAA	IFN- γ	0.7719	1.4267	0.1540	
CACGGGAGAAAGCAGAAAAACCGGAAAAA	IFN- γ	0.0939	1.4610	0.1444	
CACAGGAGCAGCAGAAAGGAAAAACAAAAACAA	IFN- γ	0.0160	-0.0068	0.9946	
GACGGGGGCGCAAAAAAGAAAGAGGAAAAAGAACAA	IFN-γ	0.0119	4.4292	<0.0001	
GACGAAAGCAACCAAAAAAGAAAGGAAAAAACAA	IFN- γ	0.0294	1.5462	0.1224	
GACAGGAGCAGCAGAAAGGAAAAACAAAAACAA	IFN- γ	0.0186	-1.2745	0.2028	
					0.6698
CACGGGAGAAAGCAGCACAAAAACGGAAAAACAA	IL-6	0.7719	-0.7554	0.4502	
CACGGGAGAAAGCAGAAAAACCGGAAAAA	IL-6	0.0939	-0.1292	0.8973	
CACAGGAGCAGCAGAAAGGAAAAACAAAAACAA	IL-6	0.0160	-0.2601	0.7949	
GACGGGGGCGCAAAAAAGAAAGAGAAAAAGAACAA	IL-6	0.0119	-1.3743	0.1697	
GACGAAAGCAACCAAAAAAGAAAGGAAAAAACAA	IL-6	0.0294	-0.9995	0.3178	
GACAGGAGCAGCAGAAAGGAAAAACAAAAACAA	IL-6	0.0186	-1.2313	0.2185	
					0.0372
CACGGGAGAAAGCAGCACAAAAACGGAAAAACAA	NA	0.7719	-0.2135	0.8310	
CACGGGAGAAAGCAGAAAAACCGGAAAAA	NA	0.0939	-0.3169	0.7514	
CACAGGAGCAGCAGAAAGGAAAAACAAAAACAA	NA	0.0160	-0.3080	0.7581	
GACGGGGGCGCAAAAAAGAAAGAGGAAAAAGAACAA	NA	0.0119	3.1359	0.0018	
GACGAAAGCAACCAAAAAAGAAAGGAAAAAACAA	NA	0.0294	-0.5452	0.5858	
GACAGGAGCAGCAGAAAGGAAAAACAAAAACAA	NA	0.0186	-0.7710	0.4409	

NOTE

^a PVRL1 genetic variants from left to right: rs73578845, rs11607606, rs12364363, rs59832923, rs1567375, rs20337, rs12273351, rs12292908, rs77067657, rs73571253, rs1009363, rs75247221, rs60657140, rs78757430, rs12270510, rs10892423, rs4936489, rs4936490, rs60492264, rs4938697, rs4412763, rs79178970, rs34163098, rs73571271, rs28489831, rs7940667, rs4938699, rs11820364, rs7944565, rs2089646, rs2089646, rs906827, rs12788928, rs4619159, rs10892424, rs7931981, rs7932236, rs73571285, rs10892425, rs73571286, rs73571287, rs79849521, rs12805373, rs7130996, rs11217372, rs75546438, rs75959285, rs61247604

^b PVRL3 genetic variants from left to right: rs1871026, rs9859451, rs7645248, rs7642664, rs873132, rs873133, rs75054607, rs16857598, rs1547518, rs6765133, rs7433877, rs72935984, rs72935989, rs717160, rs9288918, rs1477848, rs72937908, rs1477844, rs7616280, rs75354183, rs78157313, rs72937914, rs9882945, rs1351049, rs56668317, rs4682233, rs76464851, rs60379798, rs10433385, rs73229194, rs78545860, rs1351048

P-values calculated using linear (for antibodies) and linear mixed models (secreted cytokines) while adjusting for the potentially confounding variables of sex, age at enrollment, vaccination history (age at first immunization, age at second immunization, and time from last immunization to blood draw), batch/run number of immune assay used to measure immune outcome, and differences in population genetics (eigenvalues). Allelic P values compare individual haplotypes to all other haplotypes combined. Statistically significant P values (P<0.05) are in boldface type.