Published in final edited form as:

Psychol Health Med. 2014 October ; 19(5): 572–579. doi:10.1080/13548506.2013.855318.

Loss and Growth: Identity Processes with Distinct and Complementary Impacts on Wellbeing among those Living with Chronic Illness

Sarit A. Golub, PhD, MPH,

Hunter College of the City University of New York, the Center for HIV/AIDS Educational Studies and Training, and the Graduate Center of the City University of New York, USA

Kristi E. Gamarel, EdM, MA, and

Center for HIV/AIDS Educational Studies and Training, and the Graduate Center of the City University of New York, USA

H. Jonathon Rendina, MA, MPH

Center for HIV/AIDS Educational Studies and Training, and the Graduate Center of the City University of New York, USA

Abstract

The diagnosis and treatment of any chronic illness is a major source of stress for most individuals. Although many individuals living with chronic illness report experiencing growth that arises from this experience, studies have revealed mixed results regarding the association between reported growth and other aspects of psychological wellbeing. This pilot study examines the complementary and buffering influences of self-growth on self-loss in perceptions of physical and mental health among individuals living with HIV ($N = 60$). The sample comprised of a racially/ethnically diverse sample of men and women ranging in age from 27 to 62. Measures included Impact of Illness on Self-Concept Scale, the Medical Outcomes Study HIV Health Survey, the HIV Symptom Index, and the Center for Epidemiological Studies Depression Scale. Regression analyses were conducted to examine the relationship between self-growth and self-loss on self-reported bothersome symptoms and depression, controlling for demographic covariates and physical health. Self-loss accounted for a significant proportion of variance in both bothersome symptom reports and depression, after controlling for physical health. In multivariate analysis, self-growth appeared to buffer the negative impact of self-loss on bothersome symptoms, but not on depression. These data suggest that self-loss is a critical construct in understanding adaptation to chronic illness, and that identity processes may influence symptom perception and mental health outcomes above and beyond the impact of traditional measures of health status.

The diagnosis and treatment of any potentially life-threatening disease can be a major source of stress and anxiety, with long-lasting psychological and physical effects (Rothschild, 2000; Stanton & Revenson, 2011). For some, this anxiety can inhibit a return to baseline

Correspondence should be directed to: Sarit A. Golub, PhD, MPH, Department of Psychology, Hunter College of the City University of New York, 695 Park Avenue, New York, NY 10065. sarit.golub@hunter.cuny.edu.

COMPETING INTERESTS. None declared

functioning, resulting in enduring symptoms and experiences which have been described as posttraumatic stress (Hefferson, 2009). Others not only recover from the stress of diagnosis but come to see their experience as a positive influence in their lives (Carver, 1998; Nolen-Hoeksema, 2004; Tedeschi & Calhoun, 1998). Posttraumatic growth describes the process whereby individuals experience positive transformation as a result of their struggle with adversity (Tedeschi & Calhoun, 1998). Reports of posttraumatic growth have been found across a range of chronic illnesses, including HIV (Danoff-Burg & Revenson, 2005; Evers et al., 2001; Siegel & Schrimshaw, 2000; Urcuyo, Boyers, Carver, & Antoni, 2005).

Studies have revealed mixed results regarding the association of posttraumatic growth with other aspects of psychological wellbeing. Growth in the face of adversity is associated with less depression, yet appears unrelated to other indicators such as global distress, quality of life, and subjective physical health (Algoe, 2009; Helgeson, 2006; Stanton, Bower, & Low, 2006). The experiences of loss is explicitly recognized in the literature on posttraumatic growth, which acknowledges that negative events and their sequelae remain undesirable, even if positive changes have resulted from them (Fitzpatrick, Simpson, & Smith, 2010; Habermann, 1996; Tedeschi & Calhoun, 2004). The bulk of this literature assumes that growth and other benefits arise from losses, suggesting that growth and loss lie on opposite sides of a psychological spectrum. However, research indicates that people may experience both processes simultaneously, such that individuals who report growth may also experience distress during processes of adaptation (Lepore & Revenson, 2006; Siegel & Schrimshaw, 2000).

As such, a focus on growth alone may not be sufficient to understand the impact of chronic illness on identity and psychological well-being. Research on the independence of positive and negative affective states (Keyes, 2002; Larsen, McGraw, & Cacioppo, 2001; Russell, 1999) suggests that perceptions of growth and loss may be orthogonal constructs, operating independently and in interaction to influence wellbeing. This approach is consistent with recent research suggesting that self-growth may serve as a stress-buffer in moderating the disruptive aspects of negative affective reactions to stress among individuals living with chronic illness (Golub, Rendina, & Gamarel, 2013; Tran, Wiebe, Fortenberry, Butler, & Berg, 2011).

This pilot study was intended to extend these findings and examine the impact of self-loss and self-growth on psychological wellbeing among a diverse sample of adults living with HIV. Specifically, we hypothesized that self-growth would serve as a stress-buffer in moderating the effects of self-loss on two types of illness-related distress: bothersome symptoms and depression.

Method

Participants

The sample consisted of 60 individuals living with HIV ranging in age from 27–62, with a median age of 49 years. The detailed methods of this study have been published previously (Golub, Tomassilli, & Parsons, 2009). The included 40 males and 20 females, with 33% ($n = 20$) identifying as gay or bisexual. The majority of participants (78%) were Black, 13%

were Latino/a, 7% were white, and 2% were multiracial. Seventeen participants (28%) had less than a high-school degree, and the majority of participants (60%, $n = 36$) had annual household incomes under \$15,000. Time since diagnosis ranged from under one to 24 years (median = 13).

Procedures

Participants completed a quantitative survey via Audio Computer-Assisted Self-Interviewing (ACASI). Participant visits averaged an hour and a half, and participants were compensated \$40. The study was approved by the institutional review board of the university.

Measures

Growth and loss—The Impact on Self-Concept Scale (ISCS; Golub, Rendina, & Golub, 2013) assesses participants' perceptions of the ways in which living with HIV impacts their self-concept, and includes a self-growth subscale (e.g., "Living with HIV has taught me that I can handle anything"; $\alpha = .68$.) and a self-loss subscale (e.g., "Having HIV has made me lose part of who I am"; $\alpha = .88$).

Physical health—Participants completed the physical health component score of the Medical Outcomes Study – HIV Health Survey (MOS-HIV; Wu, Revicki, Jacobson, & Malitz, 1997), with higher scores indicating better physical health.

Symptom severity—The HIV Symptom Index (Justice, 2001) was used to assess physical symptoms associated with HIV and their severity over the past month.

Depression—Participants completed the 20 item Center for Epidemiologic Studies Depression Scale (CESD-D; Radloff, 1977), one of the most widely used measures of depressive symptomatology in the field of HIV research ($\alpha = .85$).

Statistical analyses

Correlations were examined to identify potential covariates and to explore demographic differences in study variables. Hierarchical regression analyses were conducted to examine the extent to which self-growth, self-loss, and their interaction were associated with symptom severity and depression, over and above the impact of general physical health. We excluded 11 participants from analyses due to missing data on their number of years since diagnosis with HIV, which was an important covariate included in all analyses.

Results

Bivariate correlations revealed no significant associations between self-growth and demographic variables (Table 1). Men reported higher average self-loss scores compared to women. A one-way ANOVA of self-loss scores by gender-sexual orientation (gay/bisexual men, heterosexual men, women) was significant, $F(2,57) = 3.54$, $p < .05$, and post-hoc tests indicated that the heterosexual men had significantly higher self-loss scores compared to

female participants. As such both gender and sexual orientation were included in all multiple regression models. Self-loss was also marginally associated with years since HIV diagnosis.

There were no significant bivariate associations between self-growth and any of the illness-related variables. Self-loss was positively associated with bothersome symptoms and depression, and negatively associated with physical health. Bothersome symptoms and depression were also strongly negatively associated with physical health scores.

Results from both regression analyses are presented in Table 2. After adjusting for demographic factors and physical health scores, self-growth and self-loss accounted for 9% of the variance in bothersome symptoms. The interaction between self-growth and self-loss accounted for an additional 6% of the variance, suggesting that the impact of self-loss is experienced most strongly among those who report low levels of self-growth (Figure 1). In the model predicting depression, self-growth and self-loss scores accounted for an additional 10% of variance, over and above demographic factors and physical health scores. Only self-loss was significantly associated with depression, and there was no significant interaction between self-growth and self-loss.

Discussion

In this sample of individuals living with HIV, perceptions of the impact of illness had important impacts on two critical components of health-related quality of life: bothersome symptoms and depression. At the bivariate level, self-loss was significantly associated with these factors, while self-growth was not. In multivariate analysis, self-growth appeared to buffer the negative impact of self-loss on bothersome symptoms, but not depression. These findings suggest that self-growth and self-loss are not necessarily orthogonal constructs, and remain critical factors in understanding the impact of illness-related perceptions on experiences of physical and mental health.

It is important to note that although self-loss was associated with physical health scores, its association with bothersome symptoms and depression appeared independent of that relationship. Self-loss accounted for a significant amount of variance in both bothersome symptoms and depression after controlling for physical health, indicating that its psychological contribution to illness perception and depression exists over and above its relationship to objective physical health.

Self-loss and self-growth scores were uncorrelated in this sample, supporting previous findings that these processes may be orthogonal or distinct (Golub et al., 2013). In this analysis, self-growth served as a stress-buffer by moderating the association of self-loss on the perception of bothersome symptoms. The stress-buffering role of self-growth has been theorized in a number of studies (Pakenham, 2005; Siegel & Schrimshaw, 2007; Tran et al., 2011), and these data provide insight into this research by demonstrating that self-growth can be simultaneously exist in the presence of self-loss.

These data are subject to limitations, including relying on a small convenience sample of majority Latino and/or African American adults who responded to self-report rather than objective health measures. As such, caution is warranted in interpretation of regression

coefficients, and future research is needed to more fully examine self-growth and self-loss among HIV-positive adults. However, these data suggest a critical role for individuals' experience of the impact of illness on self-concept in their *perception* of both physical symptoms and overall quality of life. In much of the empirical and theoretical literature, the loss associated with the traumatic event or diagnosis is assumed rather than assessed (Sears, 2003). These findings suggest that one particular type of loss – perceived loss of identity or sense of self – and its distinctiveness from self-growth may be crucial to understanding the impact of chronic illness on health-related quality of life.

Acknowledgments

This research was supported in part by the Hunter College Center for HIV Educational Studies & Training (CHEST). Jonathon Rendina was supported by a Ruth L. Kirchstein National Research Service Award Individual Predoctoral Fellowship from the National Institute of Mental Health (F31 MH095622; H. Jonathon Rendina, PI; Sarit A. Golub, Sponsor; Jeffrey T. Parsons, Co-Sponsor). The authors would like to thank Dr. David Greenberg, Dr. Julia Tomassilli, Dr. Jeffrey Parsons, Michael Adams, and the research participants who gave their time and energy to the project.

References

- Algoe, S.B.; Stanton, A.L. Is benefit finding good for individuals with chronic disease?. In: Park, SCLCL.; Antoni, M.H.; Stanton, A.L., editors. *Medical illness and positive life change: Can crisis lead to personal transformation?*. Washington, DC: American Psychological Association; 2009. p. 173-193.
- Carver S. Resilience and thriving: Issues, models, and linkages. *Journal of Social Issues*. 1998; 54:245–266.
- Danoff-Burg S, Revenson TA. Benefit-finding among patients with rheumatoid arthritis: positive effects on interpersonal relationships. *Journal of Behavioral Medicine*. 2005; 28(1):91–103. [PubMed: 15887879]
- Evers AW, Kraaijmaat FW, van Lankveld W, Jongen PJ, Jacobs JW, Bijlsma JW. Beyond unfavorable thinking: the illness cognition questionnaire for chronic diseases. *Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology*. 2001; 69(6):1026–1036. [PubMed: 11777106]
- Fitzpatrick L, Simpson J, Smith A. A qualitative analysis of mindfulness-based cognitive therapy (MBCT) in Parkinson's disease. *Psychology and Psychotherapy: Theory, Research and Practice*. 2010; 83(2):179–192.
- Golub SA, Rendina HJ, Gamarel KE. Identity-Related Growth and Loss in a Sample of HIV-Positive Gay and Bisexual Men: Initial Scale Development and Psychometric Evaluation. *AIDS and Behavior*. 2013; 17(2):748–759. [PubMed: 23086425]
- Golub SA, Tomassilli JC, Parsons JT. Partner serostatus and disclosure stigma: implications for physical and mental health outcomes among HIV-positive adults. *AIDS and Behavior*. 2009; 13(6): 1233–1240. [PubMed: 18843532]
- Gribble J, Miller HG, Rogers SM, et al. Interview mode and measurement of sexual behaviors: methodological issues. *Journal of Sex Roles*. 1999; 36:16–24.
- Habermann B. Day-to-day demands of Parkinson's disease. *Western Journal of Nursing Research*. 1996; 18(4):397–413. [PubMed: 8797365]
- Hefferson K, Greal M, Mutrie N. Post-traumatic growth and life threatening illness: A systematic review of the qualitative literature. *British Journal of Health Psychology*. 2009; 14:343–378. [PubMed: 18718109]
- Helgeson VS, Reynolds KA, Tomich PL. A meta-analytic review of benefit finding and growth. *Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology*. 2006; 74(5):797–816. [PubMed: 17032085]
- Justice AC, Holmes W, Gifford AL, Rabeneck L, Zackin R, Sinclair G, Weissman S, Neidig J, Marcus C, Chesney M, Cohn SE, Wu AW. Development and validation of a self-completed HIV symptom index. *Journal of Clinical Epidemiology*. 2001; 54(12):S77–S90. [PubMed: 11750213]

- Kalichman SC, Grebler T. Stress and poverty predictors of treatment adherence among people low-literacy living with HIV/AIDS. *Psychosomatic Medicine*. 2010; 72(8):810–816. [PubMed: 20716711]
- Keyes C, Shmotkin D, Ryff C. Optimizing well-being: The empirical encounter of two traditions. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*. 2002; 82(6):1007–1022. [PubMed: 12051575]
- Larsen JT, McGraw AP, Cacioppo JT. Can people feel happy and sad at the same time? *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*. 2001; 81:684–696. [PubMed: 11642354]
- Lepore, SJ.; Revenson, TA. Resilience and Posttraumatic Growth: Recovery, Resistance, and Reconfiguration. In: Lawrence, T.; GRG, editors. *Handbook of posttraumatic growth: Research & Practice*. Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates Publishers Calhoun; 2006. p. 24–46.
- Nolen-Hoeksema, SDC. Positive response to loss. In: Lopez, CRSS., editor. *Handbook of Positive Psychology*. New York: Oxford University Press; 2004.
- Pakenham KI. Benefit finding in multiple sclerosis and associations with positive and negative outcomes. *Health Psychology*. 2005; 24:123–132. [PubMed: 15755226]
- Radloff LS. The CES-D scale: A self-report depression scale for research in the general population. *Applied Psychological Measurement*. 1977; 1:385–401.
- Rothschild, B. *The body remembers*. California: W.W. Norton and Company; 2000.
- Russell JA, Carroll JM. On the bipolarity of positive and negative affect. *Psychological Bulletin*. 1999; 125:3–30. [PubMed: 9990843]
- Sears SR, Stanton AL, Danoff-Burg S. The yellow brick road and the emerald city: Benefit finding, positive reappraisal coping, and posttraumatic growth in women with early-stage breast cancer. *Health Psychology*. 2003; 22(5):487–497. [PubMed: 14570532]
- Siegel K, Schrimshaw EW. Perceiving benefits in adversity: stress-related growth in women living with HIV/AIDS. *Social Science & Medicine*. 2000; 51(10):1543–1554. [PubMed: 11077956]
- Siegel K, Schrimshaw EW. The stress moderating role of benefit finding on psychological distress and well-being among women living with HIV/AIDS. *AIDS and Behavior*. 2007; 11:421–433. [PubMed: 17103124]
- Stanton, A.; Bower, J.; Low, C. Posttraumatic growth after cancer. In: Calhoun, TR.; LG, editors. *Handbook of Posttraumatic Growth: Research and Practice*. Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum; 2006. p. 138–175.
- Stanton A, Revenson T. Adjustment to chronic disease: Progress and promise in research. *Oxford Handbook of Health Psychology*. 2011:241–268.
- Tedeschi, RG.; Calhoun, LG. Posttraumatic growth: Future directions. In: Tedeschi, RG.; Park, CL.; Calhoun, LG., editors. *Posttraumatic growth: Positive change in the aftermath of crisis*. Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Inc; 1998. p. 215–238.
- Tedeschi RG, Calhoun LG. Posttraumatic growth: Conceptual foundations and empirical evidence. *Psychological Inquiry*. 2004; 15(1):1–18.
- Tran V, Wiebe DJ, Fortenberry KT, Butler JM, Berg CA. Benefit finding, active reactions to diabetes stress, and diabetes management among early adolescents. *Health Psychology*. 2011; 30(2):212–219. [PubMed: 21401255]
- Turner C, Ku L, Rogers SM, et al. Adolescent sexual behavior, drug use, and violence: increased reporting with computer survey technology. *Science*. 1998; 280:867–873. [PubMed: 9572724]
- Urcuyo K, Boyers A, Carver C, Antoni M. Finding benefit in breast cancer: Relations with personality, coping, and concurrent wellbeing. *Psychology and Health*. 2005; 20:175–192.
- Wu AW, Revicki DA, Jacobson D, Malitz FE. Evidence for reliability, validity and usefulness of the Medical Outcomes Study HIV Health Survey (MOS-HIV). *Quality of Life Research*. 1997; 6(6): 481–493. [PubMed: 9330549]

Figure 1.
Self-Growth Moderates the Impact of Self-Loss on Number of Bothersome Symptoms

Table 1
Pearson Correlation Coefficients, Means, Standard Deviations, Percentages of Study Variables

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11
1. Growth scale	--										
2. Loss scale	-0.15	--									
3. Botherome Symptoms	-0.25	0.53***	--								
4. Depression	-0.26	0.62***	0.48**	--							
5. MOS-Physical Health	0.23	-0.58***	-0.60***	-0.56***	--						
6. Gender ^a	0.03	-0.39**	-0.06	-0.44**	0.11	--					
7. Sexual Orientation ^b	0.01	0.12	0.18	0.32*	-0.16	-0.51***	--				
8. Age	0.23	-0.28	-0.18	-0.23	0.00	-0.02	-0.07	--			
9. Years since diagnosis	-0.18	0.26	0.10	0.08	-0.13	-0.13	0.07	0.02	--		
10. Education ^c	0.08	0.20	0.16	0.13	-0.19	-0.28	0.25	0.25	0.06	--	
11. Income ^d	-0.01	0.07	0.05	-0.11	-0.12	0.08	-0.09	0.19	-0.04	0.20	--
<i>M/%</i>	4.49	2.63	4.98	15.19	47.64	32.7%	34.7%	48.02	13.27	22.4%	28.6%
<i>SD</i>	1.36	1.28	4.36	9.54	10.22	--	--	6.84	5.46	--	--

Note. MOS – Medical Outcomes Study.

^a Gender was coded as 0 = male and 1 = female with percent female presented as the mean.

^b Sexual Orientation was coded as 0 = heterosexual and 1 = gay/bisexual, with percent gay presented as the mean.

^c Education was coded as 1 = less than B.A., 2 = B.A. or higher with percent having a B.A. or higher presented as the mean.

^d Income was coded as 1 = <\$15,000, 2 = \$15,000 with percent earning less than \$15,000 presented as the mean; for income, $n = 43$.

* $p < .05$.

** $p < .01$.

Table 2
Multiple Regression Analyses Testing Growth, Loss and the Growth * Loss Interaction Predicting Bothersome Symptoms and Depression

Predictor variables	Bothersome Symptoms		Depression	
	β	SE	β	SE
Step 1	$R^2 = .04$, $F(3, 45) = 0.67$		$R^2 = .21$, $F(3, 44) = 3.79^*$	
Gender	0.26	(1.29)	-0.20	(2.67)
Sexual Orientation	0.20	(1.18)	0.17	(2.45)
Years since diagnosis	0.00	(0.09)	-0.12	(0.19)
Step 2	$R^2 = .33$, $F(1, 44) = 22.89^{***}$		$R^2 = .26$, $F(1, 43) = 21.19^{***}$	
MOS Physical Health	-0.36*	(0.06)	-0.28*	(0.13)
Step 3	$R^2 = .09$, $F(2, 42) = 3.64^{**}$		$R^2 = .10$, $F(2, 41) = 4.98^*$	
Growth	-0.21	(0.38)	-0.16	(0.79)
Loss	0.33*	(0.52)	0.39**	(1.08)
Step 4	$R^2 = .06$, $F(1, 41) = 4.64^{**}$		$R^2 = .00$, $F(1, 40) = 0.15$	
Growth x Loss	-0.26*	(0.34)	0.05	(0.72)

Note. All coefficients displayed are the values estimated in the final step of the model.

$n = 48$.

* $p < .05$.

** $p < .01$.

*** $p < .001$.

Gender is coded as 0 = male, 1 = female; Sexual Orientation is coded as 0 = straight, 1 = gay/bisexual