Published in final edited form as:

Pain. 2012 November ; 153(11): 2163–2166. doi:10.1016/j.pain.2012.05.030.

Virtual Reality for Persistent Pain: A New Direction for Behavioral Pain Management

Francis J. Keefe, Ph.D.,

Department of Psychiatry and Behavioral Sciences, and Department of Psychology and Neuroscience Duke University, Duke Pain Prevention and Treatment Research Program, Suite 340, 2200 West Main St., Durham, NC 27705, phone: 919 416-3401

Dane A. Huling,

Department of Psychiatry and Behavioral Sciences, Duke Pain Prevention and Treatment Research Program, Suite 340, 2200 West Main St., Durham, NC 27705, phone: 919 416-3401

Michael J. Coggins,

Department of Psychiatry and Behavioral Sciences, Duke Pain Prevention and Treatment Research Program, Suite 340, 2200 West Main St., Durham, NC 27705, phone: 919 416-3401

Daniel F. Keefe, Ph.D.,

Department of Computer Science and Engineering, University of Minnesota, 4-192 Keller Hall, 200 Union Street SE, Minneapolis, MN 55455, phone: 612-626-7508

M. Zachary Rosenthal, Ph.D.,

Department of Psychiatry and Behavioral Sciences, and Department of Psychology and Neuroscience Duke University, Duke University Medical Center (3026), 2213 Elba St., Durham, NC, 27710, phone: 919-684-6702

Nathaniel R. Herr, Ph.D., and

Department of Psychiatry and Behavioral Sciences, Duke University Medical Center, 2213 Elba Street, Rm 123, DUMC (3026), Durham, NC 27705, phone 919-684-6714

Hunter G. Hoffman, Ph.D.

Department of Mechanical Engineering, University of Washington, Box 352142, Seattle, WA 98195, phone: 206-616-1496

Francis J. Keefe: keefe003@mc.duke.edu; Dane A. Huling: dane.huling@duke.edu; Michael J. Coggins: michael.coggins@duke.edu; Daniel F. Keefe: keefe@cs.umn.edu; M. Zachary Rosenthal: rosen025@mc.duke.edu; Nathaniel R. Herr: nathaniel.herr@duke.edu; Hunter G. Hoffman: hunter@hitl.washington.edu

Recent research indicates that immersive virtual reality (VR) can be used tool in treating acute pain [10,25,23]. For example, VR-based behavioral interventions have been used to decrease acute pain among individuals undergoing painful medical procedures (e.g. wound cleaning of burn injuries [14,15,22,10], urological endoscopies (36)), physical therapy (e.g. for blunt force trauma [16], for burned skin [12,13]), and dental pain [11,5], and experimental pain in healthy volunteers (e.g. thermal pain) [17,18]. Although these data suggest that VR has promise as a tool to help reduce acute pain, there has been limited investigation on the use of VR in the treatment of patients with persistent pain.

© 2012 International Association for the Study of Pain. Published by Elsevier B.V. All rights reserved.

Publisher's Disclaimer: This is a PDF file of an unedited manuscript that has been accepted for publication. As a service to our customers we are providing this early version of the manuscript. The manuscript will undergo copyediting, typesetting, and review of the resulting proof before it is published in its final citable form. Please note that during the production process errors may be discovered which could affect the content, and all legal disclaimers that apply to the journal pertain.

The purpose of this topical review is to identify and highlight ways in which VR can be used either alone or in combination with other treatments for persistent pain. The review is divided into three parts. First, we briefly describe VR methods currently used in the management of acute pain. Second, we discuss several potential applications of VR as a behavioral intervention for persistent pain. Third, we highlight important future directions for research in this area.

Virtual Reality for Acute Pain: Previous Research

VR-based behavioral interventions have been used in acute pain management for over a decade [12]. VR-based interventions often have been developed as an adjunctive intervention designed to distract patients from acute pain that has not responded to conventional approaches (e.g. opioid medications) [10,14,22,13]. The rationale for using VR-based distraction for acute pain is that since pain requires conscious attention, VR draws attention into the computer-generated world, leaving less attention available to process incoming pain signals.

In most VR approaches to acute pain management, an immersive virtual environment is selected that is likely to divert attention away from acute pain such as Snow World [10,22]. In Snow World, patients can use a computer mouse to maneuver around and interact with (e.g. by throwing snowballs at snowmen, penguins, and woolly mammoths) a snow covered virtual environment while listening to music. Display devices that can be used to display virtual environments used in distraction interventions can range in complexity and cost from fully immersive environments such as Snow World displayed in a wide field of view, high-resolution head-mounted display on the high end, to desktop computers using inexpensive polarized or shutter glasses in combination with stereoscopic projectors or large 3-D monitors.

Potential Applications of VR to Persistent Pain

VR for Distraction

Distraction methods such as counting strategies, visual distraction, and audio distraction are components of many cognitive-behavioral therapy (CBT) protocols for chronic pain [20,34]. The question arises: under what conditions might VR prove particularly useful or necessary as a distraction method for chronic pain? VR may be particularly useful for individuals with persistent pain who have difficulty diverting their attention away from or disengaging their attention from ongoing pain [32].

There is evidence that VR can enhance the level of immersion in a distracting environment and that this occurs even when an individual is experiencing pain (32). Repeated VR trials in which a person with persistent pain is exposed in a laboratory to a highly engaging virtual environment (e.g. SnowWorld [10]) are one way to build confidence in one's ability to use distraction for pain control. One might expect an enhanced sense of immersion if the VR technology uses head, hand, or body tracking to foster interaction with the scene [19]. New haptic devices potentially enable one to combine visuals, sound, touch, and smell (olfactory displays) that can further enhance a sense of immersion.

VR for Pain-related Movement Patterns

One of the major challenges of living with persistent pain is that pain is typically increased when a patient moves the painful body area. The increases in pain that occur during movement can be substantial and can lead patients to avoid and become fearful of daily activities such as walking, transferring from one position to another, etc [33].

VR potentially provides a way of exposing patients to movements that they may avoid because of pain or fear. One can also easily move a patient from one VR environment to another thereby enabling rapid and broad exposure to many different challenges. Along these lines, Gromala, et al. [9] have used VR to help patients cope with pain that can occur during walking. They have developed a virtual walk in which the patient is on a treadmill while wearing VR headgear. The patient is watching an avatar that is walking in a slow and mindful fashion through a virtual environment. During the walk physiological responses are monitored and visual (3D display) and auditory feedback is provided to the patient with the goal of fostering relaxation and decreasing pain. Araceneaux, et al. [1] also have described a VR device for managing walking-related pain.

Recent advances in VR technology designed to accurately simulate walking and stopping during interaction with topographical features (e.g. experiencing the slope force simulating the grade of a virtual hill) or virtual stair climbing offer the possibilities of enhancing the sense of immersion and presence of such treadmill-based VR walking environments [35,4].

VR technology can also be used to simulate movement of specific body parts that the patient is unable to control or avoids using. Cole et al [3] have recently shown VR is an effective way to reduce phantom limb pain in both arm and leg amputees, using motion capture from patients' stumps to generate simulated motion in a virtual limb. When compared to a control group using basic pain distraction methods, amputees using this VR technology reported significantly lower levels of phantom pain in the affected arm or leg. In a small series of amputees having phantom limb pains (n=5) VR has been used to provide mirror visual feedback of movement patterns that reduces pain [26]. Ramachandran & Seckel [31] have suggested a similar approach could be used to treat persons with fibromyalgia who experience pain during movement.

Integrating VR with Other Behavioral Interventions

VR also can be combined with other behavioral interventions that are currently being used to treat persistent pain. The behavioral intervention that has received the most attention in VR pain research is hypnosis. David Patterson [29] pioneered the use of hypnosis delivered via a VR environment in the treatment of pain. In a case study of a patient having a severe burn injury, he found that a VR hypnosis protocol reduced pain by up to 40%. A subsequent series of 13 cases of patients with burn injuries by this group [30] found the VR hypnosis not only produced substantial decreases in pain and anxiety but also reduce patients' requirements for opioid medications by 50%. Oneal, Patterson, Soltani, et al. [27] published the first study to test the effects of a VR hypnosis protocol for chronic pain. In this study, the effects of 33 sessions of VR hypnosis was evaluated in a patient with chronic neuropathic pain who had failed to respond to prior conventional medical treatment. Following VR sessions the patient reported either no pain or a reduction of pain for hours afterward. A limitation of the study, however, was that one month after completing treatment the patient's pain ratings had returned to their pre-treatment level. Further research is needed to determine whether a greater dose of VR or additional training in maintenance strategies could enhance the long-term effects of this VR protocol.

There are several reasons for integrating VR with established behavioral interventions for pain [2]. First, such a combined intervention may be beneficial for patients who fail to respond to a conventional behavioral treatment such as meditation or hypnosis [27]. Second, VR can standardize the presentation of images, instructions, and environmental sounds used in hypnosis (or other behavioral interventions) for persistent pain [2, 28]. Finally, once patients have achieved enhanced pain control via a combined VR/behavioral intervention protocol, they may be more motivated and more successful with practicing the behavioral intervention on its own in their home environment. Given the promising results of VR

hypnosis for acute pain, future research seems warranted to explore other proposed VR/behavioral treatment combinations (e.g. VR in combination with meditation [8] or VR in combination with exposure therapy [24]).

Future Directions

VR technologies are rapidly evolving. One of the most promising areas for future study is developing and evaluating tailored VR environments that are optimally effective in pain control for a given patient. In the future it may be practical to tailor VR environments on the basis of visual, auditory, tactile [32] and even olfactory stimuli [6]. Tailoring of VR not only could enhance the sense of immersion and presence in the VR environment, it could also enhance pain control, thereby making training processes more efficient and more readily available to larger numbers of patients. As costs of VR equipment continue to drop and increasingly accessible ways of delivering VR become available (e.g. VR delivered by home computers coupled with low cost 3D television displays and 3 D input devices), it will become more practical to use home-based training for patients having persistent pain.

Several key questions remain to be addressed if the promise of home-based VR for pain control is to become a reality. First, we need to better understand the mechanism(s) by which VR effects pain. If VR primarily works through distraction then efforts should be made to ensure that the displays used continue to be sufficiently complex and novel. On the other hand if VR works by fundamentally altering the way we think and perceive of reality (e.g. by creating a sense of being present in a different state) then the technology required may simply need to be sufficient to create a sense of immersion. Second, developmental research is needed to ensure that specialized VR pain control applications work as well in the home as, for example, a game played on a game console. Much of this work will be at the human-computer interface space where methods need to be developed to ensure that VR applications work as well at home as in lab settings. There may also be challenges on the hardware side, though new technologies may help. For example, Microsoft Kinect is a new, camera-based VR input device that is unobtrusive and eliminates the need for wires and gloves. New displays such as autostereoscopic displays (no glasses needed) are likely to provide a more user friendly component that is much less prone to breaking, running out of battery power, or otherwise causing problems that could disrupt home-based VR training.

There is clear need for studies to help develop and refine VR protocols for managing persistent pain. First, the efficacy of VR in different populations of persons having persistent pain needs to be determined. The efficacy of VR for persistent pain may vary across age groups. Recent evidence indicates that older adults report lower ratings of pain when exposed to pain while being presented with an immersive VR protocol [21]. Third, new software technologies are needed to support the creation of custom environments. New 3D modeling and VR design software may be developed with the goal of making designing custom VR therapies as easy as sketching a storyboard and related 3D models, perhaps as in the style of Google SketchUp (<http://sketchup.google.com/>).

One important research issue is how to enhance generalization of treatment effects from a VR environment to daily situations in which pain is a problem. Several strategies could be used. First, lab based (or home based) VR training could be combined with a "more portable" behavioral intervention. Second, one can now construct a 3D stereoscopic VR display for a smartphone that can be linked to customizable VR software (<http://projects.ict.usc.edu/mxr/diy/>) that could potentially be adapted for use in pain management. Finally, in VR one can directly expose patients to progressively more difficult pain-related situations inside the clinic in order to foster more adaptive coping responses to pain.

In summary, research on VR interventions for persistent pain is in its infancy. This technology, however, holds considerable promise. It is our hope that pain researchers and clinicians will more actively pursue research and clinical efforts so that this promise may be realized.

Acknowledgments

The authors would like to thank Vicky Gandhi and Sarah Rowe for their help in preparing this manuscript for submission. This manuscript was supported in part by the following NIH grants: R01 CA131148 (PI=Francis Keefe), 1UM1AR062800 (PI=Dan Riddle), P01 AR50245 (PI=Farshid Guiak, Project 3 PI=Francis Keefe), R01 NR010777 (PI=John Burns, CoInv=Francis Keefe), R01 NS053759 (PI=Laura Porter, CoInv=Francis Keefe), P01 AR50245 (PI=Farshid Guiak, Project 3 PI=Francis Keefe), R01 AR054626 (PI=Joan Broderick, Co-Inv=Francis Keefe), and R01-DA-026454 (PI=M. Zachary Rosenthal), by a Within Our Reach Grant from the American College of Rheumatology Research and Education Fund (PI=Francis Keefe) as well as by NIH grants to Drs. Patterson and Sharar at the UW: NIH HD40954-01, 1R01AR054115-01A1, R01GM042725-17A1 and the Scan Design Foundation by Inger and Jens Bruun

References

1. Arceneaux, LL.; Meyer, WJ.; Hoffman, HG.; Suman, OE. Pain and perceived exertion in pediatric burn patients during exercise with virtual reality. NICHD Scholars Summer Workshop; August 12–13, 2010; Bethesda Maryland.
2. Askay SW, Patterson DR, Sharar SR. Virtual reality hypnosis. *Contemp Hypn*. 2009; 26:40–47. [PubMed: 20737029]
3. Cole J, Crowle S, Austwick G, Slater D. Exploratory findings with virtual reality for phantom limb pain; from stump motion to agency and analgesia. *Disabil Rehabil*. 2009; 31:846–854. [PubMed: 19191061]
4. Creem-Regehr S, Gooch A, Sahm C, Thompson W. Perceiving virtual geographic slant: Action influences perception. *J Exp Psychol Hum Percept Perform*. 2004; 30:811–821. [PubMed: 15462622]
5. Furman E, Jasinevicius TR, Bissada NF, Victoroff KZ, Skillicorn R, Buchner M. Virtual reality distraction for pain control during periodontal scaling and root planing procedures. *J Am Dent Assoc*. 2009 Dec; 140(12):1508–16. [PubMed: 19955069]
6. Gerardi M, Rothbaum BO, Ressler K, Heekin M, Rizzo A. Virtual reality exposure therapy using a virtual Iraq: Case report. *J Trauma Stress*. 2008; 21:209–213. [PubMed: 18404648]
7. Goubert L, Crombez G, Eccleston C, Devulder J. Distraction from chronic pain during a pain-inducing activity is associated with greater post-activity pain. *Pain*. 2004; 110:220–227. [PubMed: 15275771]
8. Gromala, D.; Shaw, C.; Song, M. Chronic pain and the modulation of self in immersive virtual reality. *Papers from the AAAI Fall Symposium (FS-09-01)*; 2009.
9. Gromala, D.; Song, M.; Yim, J.; Fox, T.; Barnes, SJ.; Nazemi, M.; Shaw, C.; Squire, P. Immersive VR: A non-pharmacological analgesic for chronic pain. *Proceedings of the 2011 annual conference extended abstracts on Human factors in computing systems*; p. 1171-1176.
10. Hoffman HG, Chambers GT, Meyer WJ 3rd, Arceneaux LL, Russell WJ, Seibel EJ, Richards TL, Sharar SR, Patterson DR. Virtual reality as an adjunctive non-pharmacologic analgesic for acute burn pain during medical procedures. *Ann Behav Med*. 2011 Apr; 41(2):183–91. [PubMed: 21264690]
11. Hoffman HG, Garcia-Palacios A, Patterson DR, Jensen M, Furness T 3rd, Ammons WF Jr. The effectiveness of virtual reality for dental pain control: a case study. *Cyberpsychol Behav*. 2001; 4(4):527–35.
12. Hoffman HG, Patterson DR, Carrougher GJ. Use of virtual reality for adjunctive treatment of adult burn pain during physical therapy: a controlled study. *Clin J Pain*. 2000; 16(3):244–50. [PubMed: 11014398]
13. Hoffman HG, Patterson DR, Carrougher GJ, Sharar S. The effectiveness of virtual reality based pain control with multiple treatments. *Clin J Pain*. 2001; 17:229–235. [PubMed: 11587113]

14. Hoffman HG, Patterson DR, Magula J, Carrougner GJ, Zeltzer K, Dagadakis S, Sharar SR. Water-friendly virtual reality pain control during wound care. *J Clin Psychol.* 2004; 60:95.
15. Hoffman HG, Patterson DR, Seibel E, Soltani M, Jewett-Leahy L, Sharar SR. Virtual Reality Pain Control During Burn Wound Debridement in the Hydrotank. *Clin J Pain.* 2008 May; 24(4):299–304. [PubMed: 18427228]
16. Hoffman HG, Patterson DR, Soltani M, Teeley A, Miller W, Sharar SR. Virtual Reality Pain Control during Physical Therapy range of motion exercises for a patient with multiple blunt force trauma injuries. *Cyberpsychol Behav.* 2009 Feb; 12(1):47–9. [PubMed: 19018695]
17. Hoffman HG, Richards TL, Coda B, Bills AR, Blough D, Richards AL, Sharar SR. Modulation of thermal pain-related brain activity with virtual reality: evidence from fMRI. *Neuroreport.* 2004 Jun; 7(15):1245–1248. [PubMed: 15167542]
18. Hoffman HG, Richards TL, Van Oostrom T, Coda BA, Jensen MP, Blough DK, Sharar SR. The analgesic effects of opioids and immersive virtual reality distraction: evidence from subjective and functional brain imaging assessments. *Anesth Analg.* 2007 Dec; 105(6):1776–83. [PubMed: 18042882]
19. Hoffman HG, Sharar SR, Coda B, Everett JJ, Ciol M, Richards T, Patterson DR. Manipulating presence influences the magnitude of virtual reality analgesia. *Pain.* 2004; 111:162–168. [PubMed: 15327820]
20. Keefe FJ, Somers TJ. Psychological approaches to understanding and treating arthritis pain. *Nature Reviews Rheumatology.* 2010; 6(4):210–216.
21. Le D, Sharar H, Hoffman H, Jensen M, Uso L, Opheim E, Patterson D, Blough D, Hoffer C. A pilot study demonstrating effective virtual reality analgesia in the elderly. *The Journal of Pain.* 2011; 12(4, supplement):P79.
22. Maani C, Hoffman HG, DeSocio PA, Morrow M, Galin C, Magula J, Maiers A, Gaylord K. Pain control during wound care for combat-related burn injuries using custom articulated arm mounted virtual reality goggles. *Journal of CyberTherapy and Rehabilitation.* 2008; 1:193–198.
23. Malloy KM, Milling LS. The effectiveness of virtual reality distraction for pain reduction: a systematic review. *Clin Psychol Rev.* 2010 Dec; 30(8):1011–8. Epub 2010 Jul 13. Review. [PubMed: 20691523]
24. Morris LD, Grimer-Somers KA, Spottiswoode B, Louw QA. Virtual reality exposure therapy as treatment for pain catastrophizing in fibromyalgia patients: Proof of concept study (Study Protocol). *BMC Musculoskeletal Disorders.* 2011; 12(1):85–92. [PubMed: 21529375]
25. Morris LD, Louw QA, Grimmer-Somers K. The effectiveness of virtual reality on reducing pain and anxiety in burn injury patients: a systematic review. *Clin J Pain.* 2009 Nov-Dec; 25(9):815–826. Review. [PubMed: 19851164]
26. Murray, CD.; Patchick, E.; Pettifer, S.; Howard, T.; Caillette, F. Investigating the efficacy of a virtual mirror box in treating phantom limb pain in a sample of chronic sufferers. *Proc. 6 Intl Conf. Disability, Virtual Reality & Assoc. Tech; Esbjerg, Denmark.* 2006.
27. Oneal BJ, Patterson DR, Soltani M, Teeley A, Jensen MP. Virtual reality hypnosis in the treatment of chronic neuropathic pain: a case report. *Int J Clin Exp Hypn.* 2008; 56:451–62. [PubMed: 18726807]
28. Patterson DR, Jensen MP, Wiechman SA, Sharar SR. Virtual reality hypnosis for pain associated with recovery from physical trauma. *Int J Clin Exp Hypn.* 2010; 58:288–300. [PubMed: 20509069]
29. Patterson DR, Tininenko JR, Schmidt AE, Sharar SR. Virtual reality hypnosis: a case report. *Int J Clin Exp Hypn.* 2004; 52:27–38. [PubMed: 14768967]
30. Patterson DR, Wiechman SA, Jensen M, Sharar SR. Hypnosis delivered through immersive virtual reality for burn pain: A clinical case series. *Int J Clin Exp Hypn.* 2006; 54:130–42. [PubMed: 16581687]
31. Ramachandran VS, Seckel EL. Using mirror visual feedback and virtual reality to treat fibromyalgia. *Med Hypotheses.* 2010; 75:495–496. [PubMed: 20692106]
32. Sharar, SR.; Carrougner, GJ.; Nakamura, OT.; Hoffman, HG.; Blough, DK.; Patterson, DR. Factors influencing the efficacy of virtual reality distraction analgesia during postburn physical therapy: preliminary results from 3 ongoing studies. Needs additional info

33. Vlaeyen JWS, Crombez G. Fear of movement/ (re)injury, avoidance and pain disability in Chronic low back pain patients. *Manual Therapy*. 1999; 4:187–195. [PubMed: 10593107]
34. Waters SJ, McKee DC, Keefe FJ. Cognitive behavioral approaches to the treatment of pain. *Psychopharmacol Bull*. 2007; 40(4):74–88. [PubMed: 18227779]
35. Whitton, M.; Brooks, F.; Wendt, JD. GUD WIP: Gait-Understanding-Driven Walking-In-Place.
36. Wright JL, Hoffman HG, Sweet RM. Virtual reality as an adjunctive pain control during transurethral microwave thermotherapy. *Urology*. 2005 Dec.66(6):1320. [PubMed: 16360473]